2025-June-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 17 June 2025, 11:00 AM UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice-Chair
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC	
Jia Rong Low (JRL)	APNIC	Treasurer

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Yogesh Chadee	AFRINIC
Vikash Dabee (VD)	AFRINIC Receiver
Jeremy Harrison (JH)	APNIC
Anton Strydom (AS)	APNIC
Tom Harrison (TH)	APNIC
Nathan Harvey (NH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela (MA)	ARIN
Nancy Carter (NC)	ARIN
Mark Kosters (MK)	ARIN
Ignacio Estrada (IE)	LACNIC
Eduardo Jimenez (EJ)	LACNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC
Felipe Victolla (FV)	RIPE NCC

Tim Bruijnzeels	RIPE NCC
Sofia Silva	NRO

Secretariat:

Laureana Pavon (LP)	Minutes
German Valdez (GV)	Executive Secretary

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 250617-1: GV will contact the RIR CEOs' executive assistants to work out where people would be traveling from to an additional f2f ASO AC meeting (plus comms and legal teams) and then come up with two or three possible alternatives so the EC can decide on the best possible locations and dates for this meeting.

New Action Item 250617-2: Re the IANA Intellectual Property Transfer to IETF IPCM, HPH to reply to Russ Housley saying "We've discussed it, and we give our consent to send this communication".

New Resolutions

-

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

4.- ICP-2 Review Process Update

5.- IANA Intellectual Property Transfer to IETF IPCM

6.- CFO NRO Budget Quarterly Report

Sofia Silva, RIR CTOs, Tom Harrison (APNIC) and Tim Bruijnzeels (RIPE NCC) are invited to join at 12:00 PM UTC

7.- NRO RPKI Program Session

8.- RIR CEO Updates

9.- Minutes Review

- 2025-May-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2025-April-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)
- 2025-March-18:Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2025-March-9: Minutes NRO EC f2f- DRAFT (Pending LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

10.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 15 July 2025 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 19 August 2025 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 16 September 2025 Teleconference

11.- Open Actions Review

12.- AOB

- **IETF Drip Effort** https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc9374/

13.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

HPH welcomed everyone at 11:02 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

The draft agenda was reviewed and approved as written.

3.- AFRINIC Update

HPH welcomed VD and invited him to provide an update.

VD said that he wouldn't be long because he was busy. He noted that everything was ready to begin e-voting on Monday and in-person voting on 23 June (systems, staff, and external providers), but last Friday there was an injunction against the election by the Tanzanian ISP Association (TISPA). The court has not suspended the election altogether, but it is not known at this time when e-voting and in person voting will proceed. Hopefully, tomorrow we will have an answer from the court and proceed with the election.

HPH said he was sorry to hear the election was postponed, and asked VD whether he could share some details about the reasons for this.

VD replied that his mandate was only to set up the board, which will go on to recruit the CEO, although there were some modifications which the judge approved early on, which include holding the election. Certain AFRINIC resource members have been denied voting rights in the upcoming election, and TISPA asserts that AFRINIC's bylaws do not allow the exclusion of those members. TISPA also argues that an order by the Supreme Court of Mauritius required AFRNIC to follow its established governance protocols.

HPH thanked VD for his update, after which VD left the meeting at 11:11 UTC.

HPH asked NM if he had anything to add, to which NM replied that all the papers, including the affidavit, went directly to the receiver, who is dealing directly with the court.

4.- ICP-2 Review Process Update

GV provided a detailed update about the work of the ASO AC, who recently met in Prague during ICANN 83 to continue their work on the ICP-2 review, with the support of the comms and the legal teams. The goal of the AC for the week had been to digest the comments/feedback about the RIR Governance Document received from the community through the RIR and ICANN community consultations. The drafting team (Esteban Lescano and Nick Nugent) will then update the text once they are back home. At the end of the week, due consideration had been given to each comment received, all comments had been discussed, and a decision had been made regarding whether the text of the document would be updated and, if so, how.

GV then shared some final considerations:

- The comms team has drawn up a new timeline for the process, according to which v2 of the document will be published on 25 August at the latest and the ASO AC will wrap up their analysis of the comments received during the next round of consultations by 15 December 2025.

- The comms team has committed to assisting the ASO AC by working on several documents.
  - Summary report of the consultation on the draft RIR Governance Document,
  - Redline version comparing v1 and v2 of the document once it is ready,
  - Rationale for the changes between v1 and v2,
  - Slides for the next round of presentations at RIR and ICANN meetings.

- The legal team and comms will start a high-level impact analysis based on the draft RIR Governance Document as it stands.

- The ASO AC suggested that it will need another face-to-face meeting after the next cycle of RIR meetings to finalize v2 (preferably in the last week of November/ first week of December).

HPH asked whether the impact assessment will be prepared by the NRO or RIR by RIR.

After some discussion, all agreed that it would be per RIR, with each RIR conducting the analysis at their preferred level.

As for the request to have an additional f2f meeting, EM said that LACNIC is open to receiving the ASO AC at the LACNIC offices, as the work they did in Montevideo in the past had been productive. However, he is also open to other venues.

HPH replied that the EC has received an email from Hervé Clément and that the EC needs to answer two questions: 1) Do we want to do this? 2) Where? Brisbane and Montevideo are the most expensive, and we've already been to Montevideo. Perhaps the AC could meet somewhere in the middle. He is in favor of an additional f2f meeting but would like some research on the best place for the AC to meet.

After some discussion, it was agreed to fund an additional f2f meeting of the ASO AC (with the support of the comms and legal teams) and the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 250617-1: GV will contact the RIR CEOs' executive assistants to work out where people would be traveling from to an additional f2f ASO AC meeting (plus comms and legal teams) and then come up with two or three possible alternatives so the EC can decide on the best possible locations and dates for this meeting.

HPH then observed that Hervé Clement's email included a second request: travel to regional RIR meetings. He noted that while each RIR funds their EC representatives to travel, the chair / chair team could be funded by the NRO. Also, he could also fund Hervé Clement's trip to ICANN 84, the other two members HPH doesn't know if they are interested.

JC believes the NRO should fund the chair / chair team for the ICANN meeting, as for the IAS he would have to check.

HPH then provided an update from the ICANN meeting in general:

- We had a session with the ICANN Board with all the chairs of the SOs and ACs about what we're doing within the ICANN framework. The presentation was very similar to the ASO's "How It Works" presentation. I was really impressed with the level of engagement of the board members, even on the technical aspects.

- There was great interest, Nick Nugent presented a statement about ICP-2 and there was even more interest. It was really positive. It may be recorded, so maybe you can check out that session.

5.- IANA Intellectual Property Transfer to IETF IPCM

JC briefly explained the situation as previously shared via email by GV. He noted that the names community has been evaluating the situation for more than a year, and that there had been a

Zoom call where the CCG got together and worked through the issues. Of the items that were raised, only a few were deemed substantial. A statement was converged on: we consent if a couple of changes are made to make clear the role of the new organization, but we also ask that the trustees consider all the edits suggested. It's a good outcome. The statement was shared with the EC.

GV shared the statement on screen.

HPH said that the other thing that had made things a bit more complicated was that the names community didn't know who their representatives on the CCG were.

New Action Item 250617-2: Re the IANA Intellectual Property Transfer to IETF IPCM, HPH to reply to Russ Housley saying "We've discussed it, and we give our consent to send this communication"

6.- CFO NRO Quarterly Report

NH joined the meeting at 11:45 AM UTC. He shared on screen the NRO Budget for 2025 and explained that the budget is expected to be in line with the forecast. He then walked everyone through highlights of the document.

HPH shared with NH that an additional meeting of the ASO AC had been approved (location TBD), which could add some additional costs. He also inquired about the cost for webhosting (USD 15k) and what it includes.

NH replied that it's the cost of the NRO wiki and the various CG wikis.

EM asked whether this budget is published on the NRO website.

GV replied that the information is included in the NRO updates, mentioning the total and main items, but in presentation format, not on the NRO website.

HPH thanked NH and the financial team for keeping things in order, after which NH left the meeting (12:00 UTC).

7.- RPKI Program Session

SS and other members of the RPKI Steering Team joined the meeting at 12:00 PM UTC.

SS shared a slide deck, which included the following discussion topics:

- Update on RPKI Program progress

- Discussion topics

- Constraints Consensus solution

- Business requirements based on ICP-2

- Alignment on general requirements

- Next steps

- Core set of RPKI features

- Roadmap: SG would like to commit to offering ASPA by the end of 2026

- ROAs for IANA reserved space (Tom H)

Outcomes were as follows:

- The NRO EC confirmed that it is safe to assume that a newly recognized RIR and a successor or interim entity (in the case of the de-recognition of an RIR) will operate the Constraints Consensus solution.

- The NRO EC agreed to remove the requirement to allow an RIR to opt out of the consensus. We can assume that all RIRs will be part of the consensus.

- JC requested that the CEOs review the draft before discussing it with any external parties (private review by the technical community). CEOs will then determine whether a legal review is required.

- The NRO EC agreed to committing to all RIRs offering ASPA support by the end of 2026, but the annual plans need to be approved by the RIRs' boards.

- FV shared that the RIPE NCC should complete implementation of ASPA before the end of 2025.

TH then spoke to a slide deck he shared about how the IANA handles ROAs for reserved space, including the disadvantages of separate TA and a possible recommendation from RPKI PT.

After some discussion on this, it was decided that further discussion on this matter was needed and that the topic would be added to the agenda for the next EC meeting to finalize the discussion.

HPH had to leave the meeting at this time (13:07 UTC), so the agenda items 8-9 were not discussed.

Before closing the meeting, all agreed that there would be no conflict for the 15 July meeting.

As others had to go, the meeting was adjourned at 13:10 UTC.