

2025-April-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 15 April 2025, 11:00 AM UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

| | | |
|-------------------------|----------|------------|
| Hans Petter Holen (HPH) | RIPE NCC | Chair |
| John Curran (JC) | ARIN | Vice-Chair |
| Ernesto Majo (EM) | LACNIC | |
| Jia Rong Low (JRL) | APNIC | Treasurer |

Observers:

| | |
|------------------------|------------------|
| Yogesh Chadee (YC) | AFRINIC |
| Nirmal Manic (NM) | AFRINIC |
| Vikash Dabee (VD) | AFRINIC Receiver |
| Anton Strydom (AS) | APNIC |
| Jeremy Harrison (JH) | APNIC |
| Richard Jimmerson (RJ) | ARIN |
| Michael Abejuela (MA) | ARIN |
| Nancy Carter (NC) | ARIN |
| Mark Kosters (MK) | ARIN |
| Ignacio Estrada (IE) | LACNIC |
| Eduardo Jimenez (EJ) | LACNIC |
| Carlos Martinez (CM) | LACNIC |
| Athina Fragkouli (AF) | RIPE NCC |
| Sofia Silva (SS) | NRO |

Secretariat:

| | |
|---------------------|---------------------|
| Laureana Pavon (LP) | Minutes |
| German Valdez (GV) | Executive Secretary |

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 250415-1: GV to draft a message to the IANA RC acknowledging publication of their annual report and thanking them for their work. This message will be sent to HPH for approval before being sent to the IANA RC.

New Action Item 250415-2: JC to start a draft of bullet points/talking points explaining why our present coordination structure is suited to the job (role of the RIRs and ICANN).

New Resolutions

R-20250415-1: The NRO EC agrees to transfer an NRO contribution of US\$ 75,000 as budgeted to support the IGF Secretariat.

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- Conversation with AFRINIC Receiver / AFRINIC Update

4.- ICP-2 Review Process Update

Outline

- Secretariat to update on last development on the ICP-2 Review Process

5.- ICANN 83 Preparations

Outline

- Secretariat to update in ICANN 83 NRO/ASO activities

6.- Contribution to IGF 2025

Outline

- Secretariat to brief NRO EC on the budgeted contribution to IGF/UNDESA for \$75,000 USD

7.- 2025 IANA Review Committee Report

Outline

- Secretariat to brief NRO EC on the IANA RC 2025 Report.

8.- NRO RPKI Program Update (Topic scheduled to start at 12:00 PM UTC)

- Follow up session with RIR CTOs and Sofia Silva

Outline

9.- RIR CEO Updates

11.- Minutes Review

- 2025-March-18:Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2025-March-9: Minutes NRO EC f2f- DRAFT (Pending ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

12.- Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 20 May 2025 Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 17 June 2025 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 July 2025 Teleconference

13.- Open Actions Review

14.- AOB

15.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

HPH welcomed everyone at 11:02 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

The draft agenda was reviewed and approved as written.

3.- Conversation with AFRINIC Receiver

HPH welcomed Vikash Dabee, noting that the EC is eager to hear what is going on and what we can do for AFRINIC in the coming period.

Vikash Dabee replied with an update on AFRINIC:

- He has a mandate to organize the election.
- The election is normally conducted by the board of directors, but the court instructed the receiver to carry out the election, so he is working out a plan that will ensure that everything is in compliance with the bylaws.
- The process should not take too long, and by 15 June everything should be complete.
- Once the election is complete, the board of directors will appoint a CEO.
- In the meantime, we are also working on some other things (paying the rent of the office, maintenance, etc.), items that need to run in an orderly manner and according to the Bylaws and cannot be contested.
- AFRINIC is working for the courts to sanction the allocation of IP resources. Vikash Dabee is working on a solution which should be in place shortly.

HPH thanked him for the encouraging update, adding that the EC is eager to help but fully respects AFRINIC's autonomy.

No further comments were heard.

4.- ICP-2 Review Process Update

GV shared the following update:

- We had a tight deadline of 14 April for launching the RIR and ICANN consultation proceedings. With the deep involvement of the legal and communications teams and in consultation with ICANN, the consultations were launched.
- The document will be known as *Governance Document for the Recognition, Maintenance, and Derecognition of Regional Internet Registries* and the consultation will remain open until 27 May.
- Each RIR has organized specific mailing lists to allow comments and feedback in general. During the coming regional meetings, the RIRs will organize sessions to present the document to their communities. We will also have webinars to facilitate and allow online participation.
- All the information regarding the presentation of the RIR Governance Document in each RIR is now consolidated on the NRO website, where a record will be kept of these activities.
- We have also updated the FAQ page and the Process and Timeline information for the ICP-2 Review on the NRO website with additional details.

- The CCG is now working on preparing presentation material for the ASO AC to be used in the coming RIR meetings and webinars.

AF thanked GV for the detailed update, adding that, in parallel, the legal team will work on the actions gathered in the last review of the document with the NRO EC.

JC thanked the legal team for their work in shepherding this and meeting the deadline.

5.- ICANN 83 Preparations

GV said that this agenda item is mostly related to the ICP-2 process as part of the efforts to consult this within the ICANN community.

He reported that, last week, the ASO AC sent formal invitations to hold joint sessions to discuss the new document to the RSSAC, GAC, ALAC, and the ISP and Connectivity Providers Group. So far, RSSAC and ISPCP have expressed interest in meeting. We haven't heard from ALAC yet, but GV will work with ICANN staff to confirm a slot with the interested SOs and ACs that would like to meet in joint session with the ASO.

Additionally, the ASO AC is planning to meet f2f in Prague, where they will begin their meeting on Sunday 8 June. For coordination purposes, GV said he would like to know who from the NRO EC will be attending (EC).

GV noted that it would be important for CCG and the legals to be there.

HPH said he plans to be there and can assist, but presentations are the ASO AC's.

JRL will not be able to attend the ICANN 83 but agrees that the ICP-2 process should be led by the AC, who we must support.

EM will also attend and is also happy to help in any way he can.

Next steps for the NRO EC in the process: Two weeks after the Prague meeting, the AC will submit to the EC the next version with the comments received through the consultation and during the ICANN meeting.

6.- Contribution to IGF 2025

GV explained that he needs to obtain the NRO EC's approval to transfer USD 75k as a contribution to IGF 2025 so that this resolution can be minuted.

JC moved to approve R-20250415-1, JRL seconded the motion, no objections or oppositions were heard so the motion carried.

R-20250415-1: The NRO EC agrees to transfer an NRO contribution of US\$ 75,000 as budgeted to support the IGF Secretariat.

7.- 2025 IANA Review Committee Report

GV observed that this agenda item is another formality, but an important one. The IANA Review Committee published their annual report on 16 March. According to the report, during 2024, there were three transactions from the IANA to the RIRs (two ASN allocations were requested, one in March by LACNIC, one by ARIN in April, and one IPv6 block was requested by APNIC). The Review Committee concluded that no issues were observed related to IANA Numbering Services and compliance with the SLA. To close this year's cycle, the NRO EC should acknowledge the publication of the report and thank the Committee for their work.

All were in favor of this.

New Action Item 250415-1: GV to draft a message to the IANA RC acknowledging publication of their annual report and thanking them for their work. This message will be sent to HPH for approval before being sent to the IANA RC.

9.- RIR CEO Updates

EM:

- LACNIC is preparing for ICANN 43 which will be held in São Paulo, Brazil.
- We are planning to have a meeting with RIR board representatives and are also open to inviting other staff members. The idea is to invite board members and CEOs. In the case of the RIRs who will not be sending any board members or their CEO, other staff may be invited.

Each CEO then shared the names of their board/staff members who will be attending LACNIC 43 in person.

JRL:

- For the past few weeks, he has been working on realigning the teams, talking to the staff, after the restructure.
- This week we are updating the staff on some improvements to the structure, nothing groundbreaking, but we are resourcing focusing on some gaps we have detected, trying to get the house in order.
- We will not have an APNIC meeting until September, but we have avenues to boost engagement on ICP-2
- Also, APNIC is doing bylaws consultations, particularly considering changes to board member term limits.

All then shared the provisions regarding term limits or absence thereof in each RIR.

JC:

- ARIN will be having its meeting in two weeks in Charlotte.

- Policies under discussion are not very contentious, mostly cleanup that is needed.
- We will also discuss prioritization, what programs we have, it will be a good meeting.
- Plenty of discussion about the ICP-2 review, which he expects will be positive.

HPH:

- We recently had a meeting in Sophia, Bulgaria, with a round table with the governments in the area.
- HPH had a meeting with the IGF, we discussed RIPE NCC/NRO engagement in Oslo, the concept of cyber ambassadors, RIPE NCC training courses, also possible synergy with the local IGFs to move bring together the policy people and the technical people.
- The other meeting in Geneva was with Doreen Bogdan-Martin, secretary general of the ITU.
- The RIPE meeting is coming up in May. It will not include a formal meeting of RIR board members but instead a dinner.
- The board has discussed changing the governance structure of the RIPE NCC, changing the executive board to a supervisory board. We are looking for advisors to work on this.

8.- NRO RPKI Program Update

Sofía Silva presented and spoke to a slide deck about the progress of the NRO RPKI Program.

The slide deck included an Update on RPKI Program progress; Version 2 of 2025 plan to ensure we stay focused on what really matters; Summary of resources required in 2025; Update on progress since the RPKI Program execution challenge was documented.

She then shared the progress on 2025 OKRs and the implementation plan, after which she went over the proposed changes made to the Plan for 2025 in terms of top priorities and stretch goals.

JC observed that this streamlining of the plan will be very helpful.

No questions were heard.

Sofia will be sharing her slide deck with the EC tomorrow and will be open to answering questions via email.

EM suggested that, at some moment, it would be useful for the Steering Group to have a retreat, a couple of days just for the RPKI steering group to share information and work together to finalized details (not at an RIR or ICANN meeting). A one-time meeting, perhaps at one of our offices.

Carlos Martinez said that the CTOs meet separately at IETF, but it is quite hectic and the logistics have become cumbersome (e.g., rooms are expensive and there is no remote participation option). He sees the value of getting in a room with people who don't go to IETF meetings. It doesn't have to be separate trip but an extension of one that we already do (e.g. the week before or after the IETF meeting).

Sofia Silva added that, with a clear plan, we can maximize the value of getting everybody together. Set the agenda and then see who we want to bring to the meeting.

No further comments were heard on the idea of an RPKI Program steering group retreat.

Sofia invited the EC to read the Update on RPKI Program Execution Challenge on Confluence.

She suggested that it would be useful to block time to have a one-on-one talk with the NRO EC chair, at least as an experiment to see if that would prove effective.

HPH will drop Sofia Silva an email to schedule this 1-1. The next meeting of the EC with Sofia Silva will be in two months.

At this time, Sofia and the CTOs left the meeting.

After some further discussion, it was agreed that HPH will make it clear to Sofia that she can use our next meeting as hard deadlines. If that doesn't work, then she knows she can come to us.

The group then went back to the discussion on the ICP-2 review and the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 250415-2: JC to start a draft of bullet points/talking points explaining why our present coordination structure is suited to the job (role of the RIRs and ICANN).

11.- Minutes Review

2025-March-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

2025-March-9: Minutes NRO EC f2f- DRAFT (Pending ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

12.- Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 20 May 2025 Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 17 June 2025 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 July 2025 Teleconference

No clashes were brought up at this time.

13.- Open Actions Review

The later information is available on Confluence, so open action items be followed up via email.

14.- AOB

JC thanked GV for preparing the updates and including the latest information on about the action items on the wiki before the meting

15.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 13:13 UTC.