

2025-February-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 18 February 2025, 11:00 AM UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice-Chair
Ernesto Majo	LACNIC	
Jia Rong Low (JRL)	APNIC	Treasurer

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Nathan Harvey (NH)	APNIC
Jeremy Harrison (JH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela (MA)	ARIN
Ignacio Estrada (IE)	LACNIC
Eduardo Jimenez (EJ)	LACNIC
Alejandro Guzman (AG)	LACNIC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon (LP)	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 250218-1: Nathan Harvey and GV to produce a new version of the NRO Procedures document based on NRO EC feedback during Istanbul meeting.

New Action Item 250218-2: NM to follow up if a zoom session with the new AFRINIC OR can be organised

New Action Item 250218-3 NM to review internally about the timing of Sofia Silva visit and recommend accordingly.

New Action Item 250218-4: The EC will have 24 hours EC to read the Proposed ICP-2 Principles Questionnaire Community Input Report, after which it can be published.

New Action Item 250218-5: GV and MA to make sure the NRO EC/ASO AC are fully aligned in terms of ICP-2 update timeline and consultations, make sure everything is completely clear, understand when the EC needs to come in (e.g., to acknowledge/approve a document) or have some consultation with our boards, all this in preparation for the meeting with ICANN in Seattle.

New Action Item 250218-6: HPH to drop Kurtis Lindqvist a line inviting him to meet at the NRO EC's meeting room at ICANN 82. GV to coordinate this meeting with Kurtis's people.

New Action Item 250218-7: All members of the NRO EC to share their arrival dates to Seattle so that GV can organize a dinner just for the CEOs.

New Action Item 250218-8: Each CEO to send EM the name of the people within their RIR who would be willing to participate in informal discussions and exchanging information on risk management. EM will then share these names with Leticia, who will be in charge of organizing this.

New Resolutions

R-20250218-1: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2024 NRO Expenses Report.

R-20250218-2: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2024 NRO Distribution Formula, with the commitment that AFRINIC wants to get back on their feet to contribute their part.

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- 2024 NRO Expenses and 2024 Distribution Formula

4.- AFRINIC Update

5.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

- a) Proposed ICP-2 Principles Questionnaire Community Input Report
- b) Summary ICP-2 Questionnaire Report |
- c) Public Announcement ICP-2 Questionnaire Report |

6.- ICANN 82 and NRO EC f2f Meeting Preparations |

7.- RIR CEO Updates

8.- Minutes Review

- 2024-December-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2024-December-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)
- 2024-November-12: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)
- 2024-November-11: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)

9.- Next Meetings

- a) 10-11 March f2f Meeting in Seattle USA (ICANN 82)
- b) Tuesday 18 March 2025 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 April 2025 Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 20 May 2025 Teleconference

10.- Open Actions Review

11.- AOB

12.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

HPH welcomed everyone at 11:04 UTC. JC was not present on the call, so RJ and MA will represent him for the time being.

2.- Agenda Review

HPH went over the agenda and no changes were made.

3.- 2024 NRO Expenses and 2024 Distribution Formula

NH spoke to the 2024 NRO Expenses and 2024 Distribution Formula while the document was displayed on screen. He noted that the key decisions for today were the approval of the 2024 NRO Expenses and whether they should be distributed among four or five RIRs.

After noting that conditions remained just as during the past year, it was decided to divide the 2024 NRO Expenses among 4 RIRs, with the commitment that AFRINIC wants to get back on their feet to contribute their part.

All agreed and the following resolutions were approved:

R-20250218-1: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2024 NRO Expenses Report.

R-20250218-2: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2024 NRO Distribution Formula with the commitment that AFRINIC wants to get back on their feet to contribute their part.

It was noted that Action Item 241112-2 is on Simon-Jan Haytink mentioned, but it was decided to update the action and assign it to NH.

NH agreed and then dropped off the call.

New Action Item 250218-1: Nathan Harvey and GV to produce a new version of the NRO Procedures document based on NRO EC feedback during Istanbul meeting.

4.- AFRINIC Update

NM shared that a new OR has been appointed, Mr. Dabee, who will be conducting the board election and has the power to appoint a new director. We have briefed him about the election procedures, AFRINIC financials, resource allocation/voting rights, and operations. We asked him to approve a small budget until June to make things easier (until the budget for 2025 is approved). The new OR has met with the management team to better understand their role. NM hopes that the new OR will be able to conduct the election and bring AFRINIC back within the specified time frame (by 25th of April 2025). Additionally, NM believes that the OR would be open to having a Zoom call with the NRO EC.

HPH thanked Nirmal for his update.

JRL noted that the update sounds very positive and asked NM whether the new OR would approve new members getting resources going forward.

NM replied that it is too early to say, as the OR will have to consult with his legals. He added that the possibility of receiving resources but not being able to vote in this specific election was on the table. He noted that the best way forward would be to wait until the OR gets back to us on this, which will hopefully be this week. The OR will be back in the office tomorrow, NM will talk to him about the NRO and see if the OR can have a meeting with the EC via Zoom.

GV then shared that Sofia Silva is visiting different RIR offices and has scheduled to visit AFRINIC Offices the week prior to IETF Bangkok (8 March) and asked whether that would be OK.

HPH replied that there are two parts to this question: the first, for Nirmal (Will this low-level technical collaboration be well received?), the second for JRL who has responsibility for her job.

JRL replied that he sees no reason why Sofia cannot visit AFRINIC.

EM wondered whether that would be the best time for Sofia's visit to Mauritius.

NM replied that he sees no risks as her visit would be only for operational AFRINIC purposes. It's up to Sofia whether she wants to come before the election of after AFRINIC has a board.

After some further discussion, it was decided that NM will have a chat with the technical staff at AFRINIC, inform them of this visit, get their opinion, and then let the NRO EC know within a week what AFRINIC's preference would be.

New Action Item 250218-2: NM to follow up if a zoom session with the new AFRINIC OR can be organised

New Action Item 250218-3 NM to review internally about the timing of Sofia Silva visit and recommend accordingly.

5.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

GV provided the following update: HC sent the Proposed ICP-2 Principles Questionnaire Community Input Report and the ICP-2 Questionnaire Summary Report-2 to the EC mailing list last week. Also, the CCG has proposed a more visual layout for presenting the information. The ASO AC is working to publish the summary and the complete data set ahead of APNIC 59 so it can be available to the community for the first cycle of RIR meetings. The ASO AC's approach is that they are keeping the report factual. The CCG's preference is to publish the report this week before people to start traveling to Malaysia, for which they need the EC's approval.

MA noted that he had discussed with JC that it would make sense for the NRO EC to give recognition/acknowledgement/approval of the principles that come out after the ASO AC processes the feedback from the questionnaire. At some point the EC has to say they are ok with the work of the AC, this might be at the end when the final document comes out, but it might be better for this to be earlier.

HPH suggested putting this on the agenda for the NRO EC meeting in Seattle, as that would give everyone a chance to read and reflect on this. But this raises another question: creating clarity with ICANN about the process and timeline.

EM said the AC can probably show us a draft document in Seattle and we can see if everything is OK. Perhaps then we can talk about aligning with ICANN, it will be a good opportunity to

discuss this point. EM agrees that having the EC's approval of the document before its presentation in the different regions would be important.

JRL said that we have a timeline we have shared so if for some reason because we forgot a step (e.g. EC approval), we need to add the step in between. Also, as this is reporting without opinions, it is merely procedural.

JRL shared some of his experience at ICANN and noted that community processes run from the bottom up. The process should be the ASO AC drafts and conducts consultations, and the EC accepts. Interim points are not as crucial.

MA said that the EC will probably have more clarity on this after Seattle, where we will see the draft.

HPH suggested two items to discuss in person in Seattle: 1) how to manage the process of working with ICANN (carefully worded roles and process, clarify the language); and 2) we need to align with ICANN when they will do their public consultation.

Hearing no further comments, the further action item was decided:

New Action Item 250218-4: The EC will have 24 hours to read the Proposed ICP-2 Principles Questionnaire Community Input Report, after which it can be published.

6.- ICANN 82 and NRO EC f2f Meeting Preparations

Re Action Item 250121-5: JC to review if someone from ARIN staff can participate of the 'How It Works Session' during ICANN82, MA said that Hollis Kara will be there and deliver that presentation.

HPH then went over the latest version of the agenda NRO EC agenda at ICANN 82.

GV noted they need to confirm and try to find the best time possible to meet with Kurtis, and that the EC had also received an invitation from Sally Wentworth who is trying to organize an Internet Organization leaders meeting during the week, with the agenda up to everyone involved.

On the ICP-2 timeline, JRL said it might be a good chance to discuss and iron out things to align the processes with the ASO AC and ICANN. We could ask our staff to do the leg work first, adding the points we need to iron out then, when we meet again, it will be more lightweight, but we create a formality to sit down and talk through these processes.

HPH asked whether we have any staff to volunteer to do that, and JRL suggested that GV might be the one to do it. After some further discussion, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 250218-5: GV and MA to make sure the NRO EC/ASO AC are fully aligned in terms of ICP-2 update timeline and consultations, make sure everything is completely clear,

understand when the EC needs to come in (e.g., to acknowledge/approve a document) or have some consultation with our boards, all this in preparation for the meeting with ICANN in Seattle.

EM said in his opinion it would be a good idea to have the Internet Leaders meeting to strengthen our relation.

Way forward: the NRO EC will go ahead with both meetings (Kurtis and Internet Organization leaders).

EM reiterated his suggestion to invite Kurtis to the NRO EC's meeting room for the meeting.

New Action Item 250218-6: HPH to drop Kurtis Lindqvist a line inviting him to meet at the NRO EC's meeting room at ICANN 82. GV to coordinate this meeting with Kurtis's people.

7.- RIR CEO Updates

JRL provided the following update:

- JRL has made some changes at senior level. After consultation with directors, three of them are no longer with APNIC effective last Friday. He then went over the leadership current team.
- The reasons for the changes were structural, not directed to individuals. A management/organizational decision, not a personal decision.
- In terms of APNIC's financial review, new roles are not being created in the short-term, but some realignment is being considered to determine where the gaps are before clearly defining the roles of each person.
- If there is anything you need from former directors, JRL said the other CEOs should feel free to reach out to him.

New Action Item 250218-7: All members of the NRO EC to share their arrival dates to Seattle so that GV can organize a dinner just for the CEOs.

EM explained that he had no particular news to share from LACNIC, except that LACNIC is having the regular board meeting next weekend in Santiago, Chile.

As JC was not present, RJ provided the following update:

- ARIN has been growing its board over the last three years. This year was the last growth year, and the board is now at its full size: we've moved from six elected board members plus the President and CEO to 9 elected board members and the President and CEO.
- ARIN is currently reviewing vendors that will help with our strategic planning process, as we will work with a vendor who will join the Board at their August meeting to facilitate the creation of a 3-5 year strategic plan.
- We are working towards our open policy meeting that will take place in Charlotte in April.

HPH:

- I had a two-day governance training for the board with a company in the Netherlands (Board governance under Dutch law has some peculiarities, two-level board structure with Supervisory board and Executive Board).
- I want to have a five-year plan (2027 to 2032) approved in May 2026. If we have the ability, I would like to also have a 5-year operational plan to give members predictability of fees for the next five years.

8.- Minutes Review

- 2024-December-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2024-December-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)
- 2024-November-12: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)
- 2024-November-11: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending RIPE NCC)

Everyone will try to review the pending minutes as soon as possible.

9.- Next Meetings

- a) 10-11 March f2f Meeting in Seattle USA (ICANN 82)
- b) Tuesday 18 March 2025 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 April 2025 Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 20 May 2025 Teleconference

HPH observed that, unless we need the 18 March meeting for some specific resolutions after the f2f meeting in Seattle, this meeting will probably be cancelled.

10.- Open Actions Review

JRL suggested doing actions Action Items 250121-1 and 250121-2 in Seattle:

Action Item 250121-1: Each CEO to talk to their PACG teams to figure out the problem statement for incorporating the NRO, pros and cons, etc. and see if there is consensus on having establishment of the NRO as a priority. OPEN

Action Item 250121-2: The EC to meet f2f with the PACG in Seattle, with the establishment of the NRO on the agenda. OPEN

Action Item 250121-3: GV to make sure that this year's donation to the IGF is made well ahead of the meeting in Oslo, make sure that the NRO is recognized on the IGF website, and preferably get good placement in the IGF Oslo exhibition hall. IN PROGRESS

GV shared that he has already reached out to Chengetai to begin this process.

Action Item 250121-4: Each CEO to provide the name of those who will be part of the project team preparing common messaging for both WSIS+20 and IGF Oslo. HPH to lead these efforts. IN PROGRESS

Re Action Item 250121-4, HPH explained that he already has a team working on this and I would like some support. He stressed the importance of working on the messaging.

JRL said that Joyce Chen will be part of the team and she will be at IGF and WSIS+20.

EM said he does not have a name yet.

RJ shared that Einar Bohlin and Micheal Abejuela will be working on these efforts.

Action Item 250121-5: JC to review if someone from ARIN staff can participate of the "How it works Session" during ICANN82. CLOSED. Hollis Kara will be participating of this session in Seattle.

Action Item 250121-7: The EC to review the ASO procedures for Empowered Community Actions to see if they make sense or whether it would be better to have the option to make these decisions via email instead of holding a teleconference. OPEN

GV volunteered to have a look at this and draft some observations on how we can expedite decisions related to these procedures.

Action Item 241217-3: HPH to ask the PACG to appoint a person to be on the ICANN Meeting Strategy Group. CLOSED

Re Action Item 241217-3, GV will obtain and record the name of the appointee.

Action Item 241111-2: HPH to ask Sofia Silva to prepare a one-pager on the resources needed for the RPKI program. This will be used as a discussion point for the allocation of resources to the program. OPEN

11.- AOB

EM mentioned an AOB regarding risk management exchange of information. He said that LACNIC CFO Diego Mena, was proposing an informal exchange in this sense among the RIRs (risk management methodology, information). The idea is to learn from each other how to improve. Every organization knows what information it is able to share, but in EM's opinion this would be a productive initiative that can strengthen risk management for all of us.

HPH and JRL agreed.

RJ noted that ARIN has a pretty robust risk process within the organization. IN his opinion, the ARIN board would likely not release documents, but we would probably be happy to discuss informally.

EM said that LACNIC would take the lead. The person responsible for this will be Leticia. EM then asked the others to send him the email addresses of the people who would like to work on this. Perhaps the first task the group could undertake is to establish a framework.

New Action Item 250218-8: Each CEO to send EM the name of the people within their RIR who would be willing to participate in informal discussions and exchanging information on risk management. EM will then share these names with Leticia, who will be in charge of organizing this.

12.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 12:51 UTC.