

2024-July-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Public Version

Date: Wednesday, 24 July 2024, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice-Chair
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Treasurer
Paul Wilson	APNIC	
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC	

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela (MA)	ARIN
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
--------------------	-----------------

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 240724-1: GV to inform the ASO AC that the NRO EC will support travel for the ASO AC chair and one other member to attend the AIS in Mauritius (September 2024) for the purpose of briefing the African community on ICP-2, and that the ASO AC should choose who will be attending accordingly.

New Action Item 240724-2: GV to coordinate payment of the NRO sponsorship for the African Internet Summit to be held in September 2024 in Mauritius at the 25K level (Diamond).

New Action Item 240724-3: The Secretariat to draft a letter to the IGFSAs and send it to the list for NRO EC review (the NRO will be winding down support and moving to supporting regional and national IGFs directly).

New Action Item 240724-4: The NRO EC to send to the mailing list any comments about the request received from the IETF regarding IETF Trust Restructuring & Transfer of IANA Intellectual Property. The goal is for the NRO Chair to provide consent to the proposed restructuring of the Trust, as the IETF cannot move forward with the restructuring without consent from the NRO chair.

New Action Item 240724-5: The NRO EC to appoint three members to the IETF Community Coordination Group (ccg).

New Resolutions

R-20240724-1: The NRO EC resolves that the NRO will take on a sponsorship for the African Internet Summit to be held in September 2024 in Mauritius at the 25K level (Diamond).

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

Outline

- Update from last events in AFRINIC

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

Outline

- Update on last developments on ICP-2

5.- Contribution to IGFSAs

Outline

- 2024 Budget includes 50,000 USD for this contribution
- In a previous meeting NRO EC discussed the merit of this contribution
- NRO EC to decide in the support to IGFSAs in 2024

6.- RIR CEO Updates

7.- Minutes Review

- 2024-18-June: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2024-May-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)
- 2024-April-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

8.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 20 August 2024 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference

c) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference

9.- Open Actions Review

10.- AOB

11.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

Because OR was unable to be present at today's meeting, JC welcomed everyone at 11:00 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

The agenda was displayed on screen and JC proposed adding the following topic under AOB: IETF Intellectual Property Trust and the Community Coordination Group.

3.- AFRINIC Update

No update was presented, as there was nobody from AFRINIC present on the call at this time.

MA confirmed that AFRINIC is still waiting for judgment and that if we don't hear anything by the end of the month, then we won't hear anything until September at the earliest.

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

JC recalled that the NRO EC received a brief report about the ASO AC's work on ICP-2 and they are basically waiting for us at this point.

GV added that the ASO AC has also asked about their participation in the Africa Internet Summit in Mauritius. The ASO AC is trying to raise awareness of how important it is for them to participate and engage with the African community.

JC explained that, as an organization, we've agreed that the NRO EC will not be attending. The question is whether we'd accept travel support requests from the ASO AC. Other than spending money that we may not have budgeted, if someone wants to be there ARIN doesn't object.

HPH observed that this is an African community event which is being brought to Mauritius so that AFRINIC staff can participate. To show solidarity and that we care about them, we should have a presence there. Having community members from the ASO AC attend the AIS would make sense.

MA asked if there is an expectation for a presentation or if it is simply about attending and being present.

HPH replied that one of the prime purposes of attending IAS is to discuss ICP-2, so he imagines they would be expected to present whether in person or remotely.

PW added that AIS has an expectation that we would be there like last time and play a role, being available and representing the NRO and the RIRs.

NM joined the meeting at this time.

GV explained that the ASO AC mentioned sending a small group of members but did not specify the number.

EM said that it is important to clarify whether we are simply facilitating them to participate or sending them as our representatives.

JC noted that if the goal is to brief everyone on the status of ICP-2, this would involve each RIR briefing its own community at the RIR's next meeting. AFRINIC is no exception, and there's an opportunity here that we won't have again to brief that community on ICP-2. With this in mind, JC supports sending a small contingent of two people.

HPH agreed, noting that this contingent should consist of the chair plus another member.

PW and EM agreed.

New Action Item 240724-1: GV to inform the ASO AC that the NRO EC will support travel for the chair and one other member to attend the AIS in Mauritius (September 2024) for the ASO AC purpose of briefing the African community on ICP-2, and that the ASO AC should choose who will be attending accordingly.

While still on the topic of AIS, HPH said that the RIPE NCC had received a request for sponsorship ("we invite the RIPE NCC and the RIR community to participate"). The RIPE NCC hasn't decided if we want to sponsor this, but maybe the NRO EC wants to do so. He explained that sponsorship categories range from 10k to 25k and that normally the AIS is sponsored by AFRINIC (the NRO has not sponsored AIS directly in the past).

JC said that, given AFRINIC's governance challenge, we could take this on as the NRO and share the cost even though this has not been budgeted.

EM agreed, as this event is very important for the African community.

PW observed that he doesn't have the authority to decide this on behalf of APNIC, but he expects that APNIC will agree.

PH will discuss this with APNIC and there should be no problem.

JC agreed, noting that he doesn't mind doing this through the RIPE NCC as long as the RIPE NCC indicates that this is on behalf of the NRO and the RIPE NCC is the vehicle doing it.

HPH said he would 25k for the NRO.

JC if we do a robust sponsorship (which includes a presentation, logos and summit pack, and delegate passes), we should figure out how to make those available to the ASO AC for their presentation.

After some further discussion, the EC approved the following resolution and action item:

R-20240724-1: The NRO EC resolves that the NRO will take on a sponsorship for the African Internet Summit to be held in September 2024 in Mauritius at the 25K level (Diamond).

New Action Item 240724-2: GV to coordinate payment of the NRO sponsorship for the African Internet Summit to be held in September 2024 in Mauritius at the 25K level (Diamond).

5.- Contribution to IGFSAs | IGFSAs 2023 Annual Report

JC explained that the NRO 2024 budget includes a \$50,000 contribution for the IGFSAs. The decision to go ahead with this is still pending, as we wanted more information.

GV observed there is an open action item on this (Action Item 240618-5). This topic is not new. Three years ago (May 2021) the NRO decided to make the contribution for that particular year, but letting the IGFSAs know that there would be conditions for the coming years, one of which was that they needed to look for other contributors and provide more clarity in their financial reports. GV was unable to find any further information or communications after that.

HPH is reluctant to give any more money without having transparent financial reporting, so he would make that the condition. Also, he would not go for 50k but reduce the contribution, as he would rather put that money directly towards the efforts on the ground rather than supporting indirectly through IGFSAs.

JC noted that ARIN doesn't get involved in local or regional IGFs. We may or may not participate in those if we're invited, but historically ARIN has not been heavily involved in funding them.

In EM's opinion, we should reduce the NRO's contribution by half. Perhaps, also we could suggest to target those funds in the African IGFs.

PH agreed that it would be okay to wind down the support.

Summarizing, JC proposed that the NRO support IGFSAs in the amount of 25K, indicating that we don't intend to fund IGFSAs in the future as we will be funding regional and national IGFs directly as a more efficient way of getting this done. Something along the lines of "Thank you. Here's our contribution for this year. Note that it is less than normal. We intend to wind down our contribution as we are moving to a strategy of supporting regional and national IGFs directly, as we find this to be more efficient."

All agreed (provided that this is clearly communicated in writing).

New Action Item 240724-3: The Secretariat to draft a letter to the IGFSAs and send it to the list for NRO EC review (the NRO will be winding down support and moving to supporting regional and national IGFs directly).

6.- RIR CEO Updates

PW:

- Has officially finished his duties at APNIC at the end of June. An acting interim DG has not been appointed, except for the purposes of financial approvals and delegations. The new DG has been selected and contracted and should be announced early next week.
- Everything's full steam ahead for the APNIC Wellington meeting and for budgeting and planning for next year.

PH added that the new DG will be in Wellington as an incoming DG, but formally their duties will start in October. In the interim, APNIC has full delegations in place and stability of the organization.

JC noted that the APNIC EC will need to officially appoint the new DG as the APNIC NRO representative.

EM said he had nothing to report about LACNIC.

JC observed that there were no particular updates about ARIN. He invited NM who was now present on the call to provide an update on AFRINIC.

NM replied that AFRINIC is still in the same situation, not having heard anything from the judge yet.

HPH:

- The RIPE NCC had a board meeting where we got directions for the budget, total expected income and bottom line.
- Now we are working internally to develop the activity plan and see how we can fund it
- We're planning a new board meeting in September, where we will approve the draft activity plan and budget for publication, which will then be discussed at the upcoming RIPE meeting before approval by the Board during its December meeting.
- A focus area for the RIPE NCC next year will be accuracy of the registry.

JC commented that ARIN is also looking at an accuracy and validation program which for this year to be rolled out in the 4th quarter. Next year we will be in a position to talk about collaborating on common approaches in this area.

7.- Minutes Review

2024-18-June: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

2024-May-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

2024-April-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

JC requested that everyone catch up on reviewing pending minutes.

8.- Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 20 August 2024 Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference

JC said that 20 August is in the middle of his board workshop, so he will have to drop off after about an hour.

No further comments were heard re the next three teleconference dates.

Re the November NRO EC meeting which will take place f2f at ICANN 81 in Istanbul, JC asked GV if the NRO already has a room and date set for their meeting.

GV explained that he has been in touch with ICANN and has requested a room for the NRO EC from Saturday 9 to Thursday 14 November. They will begin to confirm the room allocations in early August.

JC suggested that everyone lock down their travel schedules and they will discuss their meeting agenda during the August teleconference.

9.- Open Actions Review

Postponed for lack of time.

10.- AOB

JC explained that procedures of the IETF Intellectual Property Trust call for the Community Coordination Group (ccg) to advise/consent to any restructuring of the Trust. The NRO chair is one of the three co-chairs of the ccg, and the NRO EC has received a message asking for consent for a restructuring they are currently proposing.

After some discussion, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 240724-4: The NRO EC to send to the mailing list any comments about the request received from the IETF regarding IETF Trust Restructuring & Transfer of IANA Intellectual Property. The goal is for the NRO Chair to provide consent to the proposed restructuring of the Trust, as the IETF cannot move forward with the restructuring without consent from the NRO chair.

All agreed.

New Action Item 240724-5: The NRO EC to appoint three members to the IETF Community Coordination Group (ccg).

EM asked GV if we have a clear map of all NRO representations.

GV replied that we have information published on the NRO website, but he will double check to see that everything is there.

11.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting concluded at 12:15 UTC.