2023-November-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 14 November 2023, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice-Chair
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Member

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Bill Sandiford	ARIN
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 231114-1: GV to send an execution copy (PDF) of the Proposed Amendments to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services to the members of the NRO EC so that each can add their signature and then send it to Kim Davies.

New Action Item 231114-2: GV to share the IANA Review Committee Procedures and Charter documents to the NRO EC mailing list.

New Action Item 231114-3: GV to convey to the IANA RC that it is the opinion of the NRO EC that their proposed changes to their procedures regarding the definition of quorum are well considered and that the IANA Review Committee should undertake making them as soon as possible.

New Action Item 231114-4: As ASO EC Administration Representative, GV to inform the EC Administration the NRO EC's decision to support the Approval Action on Board Approval of Fundamental Bylaws Amendments in Articles 18 and 19 of the ICANN Bylaws.

New Action Item 231114-5: GV to reply to the invitation to participate in the ICANN Leadership Program and request the material related to the ASO/RIR and Internet number resources.

New Action Item 231114-6: The Chair to check with NM whether the directors listed on the AFRINIC website are directors under some legal interpretation. If so, to extend to them an invitation to speak with the EC and explain their strategy and what they are expecting to happen in the next weeks/months.

New Resolutions

R-20231114-1: The NRO resolves to support the Approval Action on Board Approval of Fundamental Bylaws Amendments in Articles 18 and 19 of the ICANN Bylaws.

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

Outline

- Update from last events in AFRINIC by Nirmal Manic
- Status of AFRINIC Engagement Plan by GV

4.- ICP-2

Outline

- NRO EC to discuss next steps in the ICP-2 process
- Hervé request for the NRO EC to meet in Montevideo

5.- NRO Strategy Implementation Update

Outline

- Update RPKI Program Implementation by GV

6.- SLA IANA - RIR Update

Outline

- NRO EC to review proposed changes
- Kim Davies asks if the amendment can be signed without AFRINIC

7.- IANA Review Committee Changes in Quorum Requirements

Outline

- Report on IANA Review Committee to update procedures to comply with Quorum Requirements by GV

8.- Fundamental Bylaw Amendments - ICANN Art ,18 and 19

Outline

- ASO Procedures on Fundamental Bylaws Amendment by GV
- NRO EC to decide on Board Approval of Fundamental Bylaws Amendments in Articles 18 and 19 of the ICANN Bylaws

1. ICANN Leadership Program

Outline

- ICANN request the appointment of 2 representatives from the ASO to their ICANN Academy Leadership Program (LP) to be held 2 days before ICANN 79
- Deadline to submit names are 15 November 2023

10.- RIR CEO Updates

11.- Open Actions Review

12.- Minutes Review

- 2023-October-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-October-23: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

13.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 19 December 2023 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 16 January 2024 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 20 February 2024 Teleconference

14.- AOB

15.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

JC welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 11:03 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

JC went over the agenda, which was approved as written.

3.- AFRINIC Update

NM provided a brief update.

New Action Item 231114-6: The Chair to check with NM whether the directors listed on the AFRINIC website are directors under some legal interpretation. If so, to extend to them an invitation to speak with the EC and explain their strategy and what they are expecting to happen in the next weeks/months.

4.- ICP-2

JC explained that the NRO EC sent an email tasking the ASO AC with two tasks: 1) Procedures for the existing ICP-2 (implementation procedures for the recognition of a new RIR and for the review and accreditation of an existing RIR). We told them they would get a draft from our legal team to get their input. 2) Initiating a process to do a long-term update of ICP-2, engaging with the communities as necessary to discuss what we really need for recognition of an RIR, responsibilities, periodic review and so on. Now we need to help support the ASO AC in that role. The ASO AC will be meeting in person in January in Montevideo and have asked whether the NRO EC and the RIR legal teams will be attending their meeting.

JC will not be able to attend, but he will send Michael Abejuela to help the ASO AC with the process.

PW agreed that the CEOs will not be needed at that ASO AC meeting.

JC added that the Legal Team is supposed to prepare a draft before January, so the presence of the Legal Team would be good, as there will be questions.

HPH agreed. The reason he is willing to send the Legal Team all the way to Montevideo is to make sure that this moves forward. He believes that the ASO AC needs administrative support from somebody who's done this in the past, like Athina who was involved with the CRISP Team.

JC will reply to Hervé and indicate that, while the NRO EC will not be present, representatives of the Legal Team will indeed attend their meeting in Montevideo. He also asked GV to arrange for remote participation.

JC then suggested having the Legal Team participate in these calls.

All agreed and each will check with the Legal Team to see if they are available to travel to Montevideo.

PW asked whether two days would be enough to make sure that the work that needs to be done gets done.

JC replied that the ASO AC will focus predominantly on the implementation procedures for the existing ICP-2, that is the priority item. Setting up the process for review of ICP-2 on a longer-term basis is lower priority. JC has not discussed this with Hevé. To answer PW's question, JC does not know how much work the ASO AC will be able to complete in two days. Also, he does not know if we need to have the entire Legal Team there, but we need to know that the Legal Team is comfortable with those who will be there. JC will respond to Hervé that the NRO EC will make sure that representatives of the legal team are there.

OR added that he is the incoming chair of the NRO EC and will also be present at that meeting.

5.- NRO Strategy Implementation Update

Regarding the PM's level of authority, JC observed that it is an interesting situation: we have an individual who will be meeting with us directly and will be making decisions about the scope of the NRO RPKI Program. We have to backstop that within the NRO organization, so unfortunately JC doesn't think this position has a lot of authority other than what we the EC invest in it when we make a decision. It's mostly a coordination role. Presumably, we'll be making sure that we comply with whatever we agree with the PM.

HPH said that this person will be jointly setting the objectives for the team manager for the RPKI team but will not be setting the objectives for the CTO nor for the software engineering director. For HPH, it's not so much about the paygrade but about the seniority level. The opportunity for

whoever gets this position is that, through social engineering and doing the right things, they will be able to gain a lot of informal powers.

PW noted that in his opinion the decision-making authority of this role is small. The role will be about driving towards consensus, finding consensus blockers and bringing them to the NRO EC. But always working with the knowledge that each CTO has their own reporting lines. As for an NRO CTO, PW doesn't think that until we have an incorporated NRO that is an option.

JC agreed with PW. In his view, this position does not have much authority, but great scope. It's a very important and necessary role, the person will not be making many decisions but facilitating decisions being made.

RJ noted that everything that has just described and worked on has already been announced, it's in the title of the position, the secretariat did a great job, the RIR HR leads did a great job, and all of this was shared. This is how it was advertised and how it was interviewed for.

JC concluded by saying that everyone is aligned, so we need to finish the interviews and find the right candidate for the job.

6.- SLA IANA - RIR Update

JC explained that we have ICANN's agreement on the update for the reverse resolution services, services which IANA already provides, but are not in the SLA. Kim Davies has asked if it can be signed without AFRINIC. The service they provide is a service they provide to the five regions. JC has suggested that the four RIRs who are capable of doing so can sign an updated document, as this better reflects the services we get from ICANN. However, JC is not sure if ICANN will agree with this.

OR said that there are some pending comments. First, RIPE NCC had a concern about the way we were signing this (an amendment, a new contract). Has this concern been solved? Second, Kim Davies (IANA/ICANN) is changing a few things, not many, OR is fine with the changes as long as we start measuring. Third, regarding the AFRINIC situation, OR believes that this agreement does not introduce any responsibility to AFRINIC but to IANA, so if AFRINIC is not able to sign the update, it is still relevant to those of us who can as it makes IANA responsible for providing the service, and not only to the ones signing.

HPH fully agreed that the four should sign on behalf of the community, AFRINIC can sign the document later on. The intention is that all five of us will be served with this.

After some further discussion, all agreed to sign SLA IANA - RIR Update and send it back to Kim Davies.

New Action Item 231114-1: GV to send an execution copy (PDF) of the Proposed Amendments to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services to the members of the NRO EC so that each can add their signature and then send it to Kim Davies.

7.- IANA Review Committee Changes in Quorum Requirements

GV shared a slide deck to present the topic. He explained that the IANA RC is in a similar situation as the ASO AC was, as right now, one AFRINIC community member is already missing and the other's term will expire at the end of the year.

GV added that the IANA RC had a meeting last week and are proposing to amend the quorum requirements. The recommendation is to remove the "five regions" requirement similar to what the ASO AC did.

OR commented that this is a good solution. He was not aware of this issue, so he thanked GV for raising the topic. He agrees that we should accept that change.

HPH said he is fine with the amendment and asked where the criteria can be found (the exact wording for the election of the IANA RC).

GV replied that each region has its own methodology for selecting their IANA RC members, adding that he would send to the mailing list a link to the IANA RC Procedures and Charter.

New Action Item 231114-2: GV to share the IANA Review Committee Procedures and Charter documents to the NRO EC mailing list.

JC said that he is in favor of this change. He asked if the EC needs to ask the IANA RC to update their procedures accordingly.

GV replied that there is nothing that says that the EC needs to request it, but he wanted to present this to the EC for accountability.

New Action Item 231114-3: GV to convey to the IANA RC that it is the opinion of the NRO EC that their proposed changes to their procedures regarding the definition of quorum are well considered and that the IANA Review Committee should undertake making them as soon as possible.

8.- Fundamental Bylaw Amendments - ICANN Art ,18 and 19

GV shared another brief slide deck that spoke to the background and scope of the amendments. The nature of the changes are basically names related but require empowered community approval.

JC then called the motion for the NRO EC to support the Fundamental Bylaw Amendments - ICANN Art. 18 and 19. The reason is that when we did the IANA functions transition, it was decided that we needed something above the ICANN Board so that they would not change their bylaws against the will of the community. If the community wants these changes, if the ICANN Board is fine with the amendments, and if our community has not objected, there is nothing against supporting the decision.

HPH seconded the motion, nobody opposed, and the motion carried.

R-20231114-1: The NRO resolves to support the Approval Action on Board Approval of Fundamental Bylaws Amendments in Articles 18 and 19 of the ICANN Bylaws.

New Action Item 231114-4: As ASO EC Administration Representative, GV to inform the EC Administration the NRO EC's decision to support the Approval Action on Board Approval of Fundamental Bylaws Amendments in Articles 18 and 19 of the ICANN Bylaws.

9.- ICANN Leadership Program

JC explained that they had received an invitation to send people to the ICANN Leadership Program and that the deadline for submitting names is tomorrow.

PW asked about the role of the people attending (teaching or learning), to which JC replied that the program involves two days for learning about ICANN. If we wanted to instill someone into ICANN, this would be the place to do so.

OR said that in his opinion an immersive program would not be relevant for us or for our community. He wouldn't send anyone to learn about the domain name issues. But if PW is there, we can offer ICANN to present the numbers part so that people learning about domain name issues can receive some numbers knowledge and start to learn about what we do.

JC suggested responding along these lines: "Thanks for the invitation, we appreciate it, and we ask that you continue to invite us. We have a question about the content re the numbers system and the ASO that is presented. Could you send that content to us for review?"

All agreed.

New Action Item 231114-5: GV to reply to the invitation to participate in the ICANN Leadership Program and request the material related to the ASO/RIR and Internet number resources.

10.- RIR CEO Updates

HPH:

- The RIPE meeting is coming up in two weeks, we will discuss our activity plan and budget for next year.
- We have made significant savings in many places, but we will not have the budget for national events like RIPE NCC Days as we have had in the past.
- There have been budget cuts across all areas, but forecast inflation is 2% so that could mean a zero sum.
- My challenge right now is our income, which will be reduced even further for 2025 due to consolidation of LIRs.

- I am looking into a much more frugal future for the RIPE NCC than we have seen so far and ensuring we get value for money and spend the money right.

OR:

- Boad elections: I already reported that we implemented an effective mechanism to asses capabilities on candidates running for LACNIC Board elections, specifically in topics like corporate governance, LACNIC's ecosystem and LACNIC's procedures. This was very effective, we were able to identify candidates with basic knowledge and that they will provide sufficient insights. This was a good step, as the community has changed and is no longer the community we knew many years ago.
- 2024 budget: For the first time a budget will be presented to the board for approval with a loss. This is on purpose, because for the last 7-9 years, we have adjusted our budget to the new income, and that has been cut by the inflation rate of the US dollar. We have been trying to control expenses that are apparently not critical, but it still affects our mission and goals. The message to our community is that we have to spend this amount of money out of our reserves, just a small part (3%).

PW:

- We've got a new annual plan and budget for next year. We'll have a planned deficit of less than a million (3-4% of total budget).
- I've spent a few days in Pakistan, that was a pretty high profile visit with the regulator, the ministry.

PW noted that he included MANRS under AoB because he received an announcement saying that within 24 hours MANRS was being rejigged and transferred by Internet Society to the Global Cyber Alliance.

JC shared that the ARIN board made the decision to fulfil the two-million dollar pledge we made to the IETF Endowment and that they intend probably next year to put one million there. He then invite the other RIRs to donate to the Endowment.

JC:

- We had board elections and are now up to nine board members plus myself.

11.- Open Actions Review

Deferred.

12.- Minutes Review

2023-October-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
2023-October-23: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

2023-September-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)
2023-August-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)

JC thanked everyone for the progress they've made and invited the others to complete their review of prior meeting minutes.

13.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 19 December 2023 Teleconference
b) Tuesday 16 January 2024 Teleconference
c) Tuesday 20 February 2024 Teleconference

After discussing the three dates, no changes were made to the calendar at this point.

14.- AOB

15.- Adjourn

There being nothing further to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 13:14 UTC.