

2023-December-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 19 December 2023, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice-Chair
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Member

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela	ARIN
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Jeremy Harrison (JH)	APNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 231219-1: The Legal Team to prepare a draft of the procedures for the implementation of ICP-2 and share these with the NRO EC by 12 January.

New Action Item 231219-2: GV to share with the ASO AC leaders that they will receive a draft version of the implementation procedures by 16 January, that reviewing these procedures and agreeing on any recommendations for change should be the first part of their Montevideo meeting, and that they should also spend time thinking about what the ICP-2 should look like long term.

New Resolutions

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

Outline

- Update from last events in AFRINIC

4.- Update on the ICP-2

5.- NRO Strategy Implementation Update

Outline

- Update RPKI Program Implementation by GV

6.- RIR CEO Updates

7.- Open Actions Review

8.- Minutes Review

- 2023-November-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-October-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)
- 2023-October-23: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)
- 2023-September-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)
- 2023-August-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)

9.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 16 January 2024 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 20 February 2024 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 19 March 2024 Teleconference

10.- AOB

11.- Adjourn

=====

Minutes

1.- Welcome

JC welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 11:02 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

JC went over the agenda, which was approved as written.

3.- AFRINIC Update

PW said that he had delivered the goodwill message in the follow up teleconference of the IAS meeting, the meeting was dominated by administrative speculation about how AFRINIC could replace staff, hire staff into positions that become vacant, and so on.

4.- Update on the ICP-2

GV said there was not much to update, except that the meeting will take place in Montevideo on 29-30 January and that the logistics are going according to plan. The AC has the expectation that the EC will provide guidance either before or during the Montevideo meeting.

JC stressed that the Legal Team needs to deliver this on time for the EC to review and deliver to the ASO AC.

MA said he could work with the rest of the Legal Team and that he understands that it has to be ready in time for the EC to go over it. The Legal Team is working on it and will have it ready at least two weeks prior to Montevideo.

PW asked what the goals for Montevideo are. The ASO AC will have 1.5 days of meeting, for a big expense, so we need to have clear objectives.

JC presumes the goal is to work on the two items we gave them re the ICP-2. If there is any confusion, we should make our priorities clear: our first priority is getting a draft of the implementation procedures. The EC has to draft something, but as the community body we

tasked the ASO AC with two tasks, the procedures was the first one. Once we have a draft, then we can say the first task for Montevideo is to provide succinct comments.

GV explained that the ASO AC is preparing for a full two-day meeting in Montevideo and have agreed to focus exclusively on ICP-2 matters.

MA said that his understanding was that the Legal Team would have the implementation procedures for ICP-2, the EC would look at that, then they would be presented to the AC. If the AC has any thoughts, objections, or suggestions, they can bring them up in Montevideo. Basically, that it would be the AC looking at what we have put together.

JC noted that the AC is meeting on 29-30 January, and we presume we will need to have some discussion among the EC to converge on something. This means that the Legal Team needs to have something for the EC by Friday 12 January. This will allow the AC to have solid momentum going in.

New Action Item 231219-1: The Legal Team to prepare a draft of the procedures for the implementation of ICP-2 and share these with the NRO EC by 12 January.

JC said that hopefully the EC can have the implementation procedures ready for the AC on 16 January, the date of the EC's next meeting. Via email and after our meeting, we could send an email to the AC saying: "here's the draft for you to review, if you have any substantial changes, please send those changes and the reasoning behind them."

New Action Item 231219-2: GV to share with the ASO AC leaders that they will receive a draft version of the implementation procedures by 16 January, that reviewing these procedures and agreeing on any recommendations for change should be the first part of their Montevideo meeting, and that they should also spend time thinking about what the ICP-2 should look like long term.

NM joined the meeting at this time and JC updated him on what they had been discussing. He then asked NM if he had any update re AFRINIC.

NM does not have any update, as there have been no major developments.

JC said that the EC has in effect an open invitation to Benjamin for whenever he wishes to talk to us, particularly in relation of reinstatement of the board. He told NM that he could reiterate this to Benjamin. We also want to reiterate our support to the AFRINIC staff.

5.- NRO Strategy Implementation Update

GV informed that the hiring process of the RPKI PM has been finalized, and that Sofia Silva, current employee of APNIC, will be taking on the role. To allow some time for the process to change her contract and allow her to transition to her new role, she will begin her job as RPKI PM on 8 January. GV has also informed the RPKI steering group about this decision.

HPH asked if this decision is official and can be shared with all staff members, to which GV replied that it is.

JC said that this is great progress and that we need to see how this program goes before advancing on the others.

GV said that he would draft a process for hiring the PMs based on the lessons learned, knowledge, and experience.

JC said that it is good to capture the experiences now that they are fresh in our mind.

6.- RIR CEO Updates

OR:

We had a LACNIC Board meeting two weeks ago. The Board approved our budget for 2024, with a loss of approximately 3% of the budget and 2% of our reserves for the first time. The good thing is that the Board approved this budget. It was necessary to send a signal to our membership that we are starting to consume our reserves. It was a good conversation and a good signal to our membership. This May we will present a new membership scheme, with a small update for inflation.

We also agreed to an emergency budget for after 2024, so that if we do not have quorum or any other issues arise, we will have the budget for 2025.

HPH:

We had a very successful RIPE meeting. Many people were skeptical of holding the meeting on a golf course outside the city, others said “we’re simply here for the meeting.” We had a higher satisfaction score for this meeting than for the previous ones.

We had a joint meeting of the Boards of APNIC and LACNIC.

RIPE NCC had a Board meeting last week, approved the budget for approximately the same amount we spent this year.

There is agreement on the Board to listen to the comments made by the membership re correcting for inflation moving forward, but we also need to allow for the declining number of LIRs, that will be discussed and probably have some community consultation early next year.

PW:

APNIC’s Strategic Plan for the next four years had been published last week.

JC:

ARIN is rolling into 2024 with some significant changes, things that had already been approved and are now being implemented.

The ARIN board had its end of year meeting, we are spending a bit of time looking at governance, trying to do some clean up there, but everything else is very stable. We're looking at talking to the membership next year about an incremental cost of living adjustment. Operationally and governance wise everything is fine.

7.- Open Actions Review

Action Item 230919-2: JC to draft a response to Frediani saying that “The NRO has published a statement. We look forward to AFRINIC having an election and returning to normal governance.” CLOSED

Action Item 230919-8: All to review JC’s draft response to SSAC (RIR Comments on SSAC Recommendations on DNSSEC Zone Maintenance) and send in any comments they may have before 22 September 2023, when JC will send it to SSAC. CLOSED

8.- Minutes Review

JC encouraged everyone who has pending minutes to review to try to find the time to do so.

9.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 16 January 2024 Teleconference

JC noted that this will be a very important meeting to finalize our guidelines to the ASO AC.

b) Tuesday 20 February 2024 Teleconference

Because RIPE has a conflict, it was decided to move this meeting to 15 February.

c) Tuesday 19 March 2024 Teleconference

No conflicts.

10.- AOB

OR noted that this is JC’s last meeting as NRO EC Chair this year and thanked him for his work.

All others joined in thanking JC for his term as Chair.

11.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 12:00 UTC.