

2023-July-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 18 July 2023, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice-Chair
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Member

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Arthur Carindal	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 230718-1: GV and Arthur Carindal to add message/talking points as an addendum to the AFRINIC Engagement Plan.

New Action Item 230718-2: GV to send the original ASO AC procedures and the procedures review documents to the NRO EC list so that everyone can read them, making sure that everyone is working on the same page.

New Action Item 230718-3: GV to set up a call with JS and all the CEOs to coordinate the RIR content for the AIS.

New Resolutions

R-20220718-1: The NRO EC adopts the agreement sent by ICANN to PW on 12 July (re financial support for AFRINIC Engagement Plan) and recommends that APNIC move forward with the payments.

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

4.- NRO Strategy Update

5.- ASO AC Procedures Update

6.- RIR CEO Updates

7.- Open Actions Review

8.- Minutes Review

- 2023-June-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-May-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-April-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, RIPE NCC)

9.- Next Meetings

a) Next NRO EC f2f Meeting

b) Tuesday 15 August 2023 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 19 September 2023 Teleconference

d) Tuesday 17 October 2023 Teleconference

10.- AOB

11.- Adjourn

=====

Minutes

1.- Welcome

JC welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 11:04 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

JC went over the proposed agenda which was shown on screen.

GV suggested adding coordination efforts for meetings with ICANN.

3.- AFRINIC Update

There was discussion of potential for an engagement plan for AFRINIC, and OR mentioned that it was only 20% of the contacted people of the region are aware of AFRINIC, this means these efforts will be very fruitful.

HPH noted that on the 28th of September the AIS includes a joint ICANN/RIRs session. There is an action on JC to talk to John Sweeting about the agenda for that session.

HPH said that unless there are firm plans, he and his staff will not be attending.

JC is also not planning to attend AIS.

New Action Item 230718-1: GV and Arthur Carindal to add message/talking points as an addendum to the AFRINIC Engagement Plan.

4.- NRO Strategy Update

GV:

- We have been advancing on hiring the RPKI project manager. We are now down to 13 people, who are divided into two pools: 1) six current or former members of the RIR system, 2) seven people who have showed strong project management skills.
- Next step: before involving the RPKI steering group in the interview sessions, the Secretariat will have a brief 15-minute meeting with the second pool of candidates to provide some information about the RIR system and answer any questions they may

have. For this call we will have people from the HR department of the corresponding RIRs.

- In parallel, we have been working with the HR people to develop a script for the interviews. This is the first time we have to do something like this, recruiting for a global role, so we are learning as we move forward. The idea is that the EC will then meet with the strongest candidates.
- We are also working on finding a date for an inaugural call for the other steering groups (Cybersecurity and Government Engagement) to meet, which will probably be next week.

RJ added the following:

- The candidates include names that we know would be able to do the job well. For other seven, it remains to be seen, but we are confident that there will be at least one individual who is capable of doing the job that the EC will be willing to select.

HPH asked whether there are any plans for a formal leadership assessment of these candidates. Also, what is the timeline for this? It would be good if we could have more clarity regarding the timing of the meetings with the candidates.

GV replied that a leadership assessment has not been considered but that there is time to do so. We will have a discussion on that. As for the timeline, we were aiming to have the meeting with the NRO EC in late August, but we need to take a look at people's availability (holidays). We will update the timeline and let you know.

5.- ASO AC Procedures Update

JC explained that the EC has a document regarding the ASO AC procedures review, and we need to sign off on that.

OR noted that the ASO AC has to come up with a formal request for changes and then we have to ratify them. Are these changes of this document for our informal review or for formal ratification? We asked the AC to come up with those changes this year before we lose quorum for next year.

HPH replied that this is a request for input, i.e., if there is anything that might be seen as an issue from our side, we should give them feedback now, so that they can work that out. The ASO AC want to meet in Kyoto to finalize their procedures review. When they have the document ready, then they will send it to us for approval.

In that case, JC said we need to get back to the AC and say "we have the following comments, questions, or concerns, or we have none." We must all review this. He'd like to send the AC a message this week saying that we've read the work they've done.

OR noted the following: keep in mind that the changes proposed in the document we currently have are not all the changes, but the changes needed for the AC to be able to continue doing business if they lose quorum next year.

PW joined the meeting at 11:50 and apologized for being late. JC gave him a brief update of what had been discussed so far.

JC concluded the topic by reminding everyone to complete Action Item 230620-5 so that we can confirm that we have no issues or provide guidance so the ASO AC can finalize their procedures.

6.- RIR CEO Updates

PW provided the following APNIC update:

- We've just announced some changes to the APNIC governance structure and a change to the bylaws to allow changes to happen more easily (2/3 of all members was impossible to achieve). Also, six different bylaws change propositions that will go to vote probably in Kyoto. We will have some webinars next week for our members on these changes and propositions.

OR asked PW when these changes are scheduled to be approved or presented for final approval.

PW replied that the changes to the structure have been implemented as decisions of the EC. Along with the single bylaws change that allows future bylaws changes to be made with only 2/3 of the votes cast. All that is left are the propositions (criteria for APNIC nominees, code of conduct), that will be put out to a vote at the next APNIC meeting.

HPH provided a brief update on RIPE NCC:

- Good news: we have a new chief registry officer. He signed his contract yesterday and will be announced publicly soon.
- We have a lot of work going on, retreats in the technical and the communication and engagement teams. Also, a leadership retreat next week to iron out our strategy for next year.

OR had no update at this time.

NM also had no update at this time and noted that AFRINIC is still in the same situation.

JC:

- We are in the middle of the ramp up to our elections. Our nomination process is a little different this year. We are using an external firm to do the vetting and background checks, which are happening now.

Going back to a previous agenda item, OR said he had looked at the email sent by Hervé Clément and it appears that there are more changes than those included in the redline document linked on the wiki, so the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 230718-2: GV to send the original ASO AC procedures and the procedures review documents to the NRO EC list so that everyone can read them, making sure that everyone is working on the same page.

7.- Open Actions Review

All went through the list of open actions. Their new status is as follows:

Action Item 230620-1: GV to check with Arthur what the plans are for the African Peering Forum and the AIS meeting (28 September) and get back to the EC with this information, as well as with any other events prior to September in which it might be of interest for the NRO to participate. IN PROGRESS

Action Item 230620-2: JC to ask John Sweeting to put together a preliminary agenda for the AIS, communications for a normal type of peering forum event. CLOSED

Re Action Item 230620-2, JC said he asked JS but did not get a reply. He suggested that JS, GV and all CEOs have a call to coordinate RIR content for AIS.

New Action Item 230718-3: GV to set up a call with JS and all the CEOs to coordinate the RIR content for the AIS.

Action Item 230620-4: Each member of the NRO EC to brief their legal counsel to begin working on coming up with possible risk scenarios and appropriate contingency plans/analysis in relation to the situation at AFRINIC and collaborate with their peers. CLOSED

Action Item 230620-5: All to take the time to review the ASO AC Procedures Update document and analyze its approval. IN PROGRESS

Action Item 230516-2: JC to reply to ISOC's invitation to hold a Workshop on Number Resource System Resilience: "It does not appear that we have critical mass, we welcome this discussion, but it will be better informed if we hold it later in the summer. We are happy to organize or have you organize it, as you prefer." CLOSED

Action Item 230516-3: JC to send to the IANA RC the response that he circulated via the NRO EC mailing list on 15 May. CLOSED

Action Item 230516-4: JC to reach out to Sally in advance and say "We weren't intending on meeting in Washington during ICANN 77, though we do know that there will be tactical work on IANA discussions and on the communications plan." CLOSED

Action Item 230418-1: NM to start working on two or three talking points to be used as interim messaging prior to having the court's response to Silvio Amada's application requesting that AFRINIC Staff call a Special General Members Meeting to conduct elections. OVERTAKEN BY EVENTS

Action Item 230418-2: JC to Communicate to Arthur Carindal that he will be leading the AFRINIC Communications TF. CLOSED

Action Item 230418-4: JC to reach out to Andrew Sullivan and Sally Costerton on behalf of the NRO to identify AFRINIC Communications TF members and note that the NRO EC may be seeking financial support. CLOSED

R-20220718-1: The NRO EC adopts the agreement sent by ICANN to PW on 12 July (re financial support for AFRINIC Engagement Plan) and recommends that APNIC move forward with the payments.

Action Item 230221-2: JC to draft a response letter to Tanzania Internet Association regarding the AFRINIC situation. PW to review the draft reply, suggest any improvements or changes, and then send the response back to the EC. If all agree via email, the reply will be sent as soon as possible. OVERTAKEN BY EVENTS

Action Item 230321-4: GP to send the slide he shared on screen at the 21 March 2023 NRO EC teleconference (NRO EC 5-Year Strategy on a page) to the EC tomorrow (22 March) for review and final approval for external use. Once it is approved, GP to start building out a fairly short deck that can also be used and then run it past the EC. CLOSED

Action Item 220726-4: HPH will share with the EC draft output of the RIPE NCC'S recommended approaches to crisis response once this output is ready (2022 Q4). OPEN

8.- Minutes Review

- 2023-June-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-May-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2023-April-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, RIPE NCC)

JC said that we should all take the time to look at the minutes with a critical eye so we can have them published in a timely manner.

HPH noted that the style of NRO EC meeting minutes is different from the style of the minutes of the RIPE NCC. We may want to look into professionally written minutes rather than transcript type minutes. This may be more useful for the community.

JC replied that the minutes are indeed more detailed, but that can sometimes be helpful in reminding us of what we've discussed.

9.- Next Meetings

- a) Next NRO EC f2f Meeting
- b) Tuesday 15 August 2023 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 19 September 2023 Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 17 October 2023 Teleconference

HPH said he may have problem with the October meeting.

After discussing possible alternatives, JC suggested trying to schedule a f2f meeting in Hamburg (ICANN78).

10.- AOB

Re ICANN coordination meeting times, JC explained that ICANN has suggested a 8:00 pm UTC for weekly ICANN / RIR coordination calls.

All discussed this and decided that the best options would be Tuesdays, Wednesdays, or Thursdays at 8:00 pm UTC.

11.- Adjourn

All agreed and the meeting was adjourned at 12:43 UTC.