2023-May-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 16 May 2023, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice-Chair
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Member

Observers:

Sebastian Bellagamba	ISOC
Dawit Bekele	ISOC
Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Bill Sandiford (BS)	ARIN
Migue Ignacio Estrada (ME)	LACNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 230516-1: GV to share the AFRINIC Community Engagement plan with Sebastián Bellagamba.

New Action Item 230516-2: JC to reply to ISOC's invitation to hold a Workshop on Number Resource System Resilience: "It does not appear that we have critical mass, we welcome this discussion, but it will be better informed if we hold it later in the summer. We are happy to organize or have you organize it, as you prefer."

New Action Item 230516-3: JC to send to the IANA RC the response that he circulated via the NRO EC mailing list on 15 May.

New Action Item 230516-4: JC to reach out to Sally in advance and say "We weren't intending on meeting in Washington during ICANN 77, though we do know that there will be tactical work on IANA discussions and on the communications plan."

New Resolutions

-

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- Session with ISOC Representatives

4.- NRO Strategy Update

6.- AFRINIC Funding

7.- ISOC's Workshop on Number Resource System Resilience

8.- ICANN 77 Washington DC Activities

9.- NRO EC Response to IANA RC

10.- RIR CEO Updates

11.- Open Actions Review

12.- Minutes Review

- 2023-April-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

13.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 20 June 2023 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 18 July 2023 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 15 August 2023 Teleconference

14.- AOB

15.- Adjourn

================

Minutes

1.- Welcome

JC welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 11:04 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

JC went over the agenda. He noted that he would have to leave the meeting early, so agenda item No. 4 (NRO Strategy Update) would be deferred.

3.- Session with ISOC Representatives

JC said that we realize that we are going to have to do quite a bit of outreach and we have reached out to ICANN and ISOC. He welcomed the ISOC representatives present on the call and said the NRO EC would be happy to take questions, concerns, or thoughts.

SB thanked JC for the invitation, adding that he is glad to be here. He mentioned that ISOC is very concerned and aware about the situation with AFRINIC, so he would like to understand better what the NRO is planning to do and see how ISOC can contribute.

JC provided a high level overview of the situation at AFRINIC: currently there are insufficient board members to hold a board meeting and make decisions, which is impacting AFRINIC's ability to hold elections.

OR then asked JC if he could explain to SB the plan to engage the community.

JC replied as follows: once the date and timing for the election is determined, we'd like to make sure everyone understands the importance of participation, that it is not just an election but an election to make sure that AFRINIC has a solid, diverse, and representative governing board.

SB summarized this as follows: if the idea is to create awareness of the importance of the election and bring the community to participate in the election, then ISOC is aligned with that. He added that ISOC has a big network of chapters in Africa, so we could participate in communicating the importance of participating, what is at stake, try to avoid proxies, engage people and have them actively participate in the election. While unable to commit to specifics, he said that they are conceptually aligned. If this is a joint effort with the RIRs, an efficient, coordinated, and concerted effort would be great.

JC clarified that the NRO is talking about engaging the community in the election, not about an advocacy role, i.e., simply making sure that everybody takes the time to consider the candidates and vote their own mind.

SB fully agreed, we will not campaign in this election.

DB fully agreed with what has been said. We have the same objectives; we don't want to pursue a specific candidate. Before we leave this meeting, it would be good to have a plan, not a detailed plan, but how we can cooperate in tactical terms, so we know the way forward.

JC explained that right now the date and times would have to be fluid, as we cannot predict when the court will decide.

PW invited GV to share what is going on right now in AFRINIC.

Noting that this topic is part of the agenda, GV provided the following report with examples of what we are doing in terms of the community engagement plan:

- The NRO approved financial support for the execution of a set of engagement activities with the AFRINIC community.

- The main goals of this plan are to boost the active participation of the African community in the AFRINIC governance model, to encourage the nomination of experienced candidates for the AFRINIC board elections, to increase the number of AFRINIC members voting in the upcoming board elections (which we hope will be held by the end of September at the latest).

- This approach will be done by the AFRINIC staff with a strong neutral approach in their engagement with AFRINIC members.

- With the support of PW, APNIC will channel the resources and the NRO Secretariat will serve as the controller to keep the plan within the approved budget.

- Led by the AFRINIC staff, in the coming three weeks we will be facilitating the resources for six community members and engagement meetings: one in Senegal, in collaboration with the local ISP association; two more in Libya and Burkina Faso, in collaboration with ISOC chapters; a meeting in Tanzania, in collaboration with the ISP

association; others in Kenya and Cameroon. These should cover approximately 20% of the target membership.

- All the materials are developed by the AFRINIC staff in conjunction with the local stakeholders.

- This plan will extend into June (11 more countries) and July (4 more countries), then we will finalize the visits, as the election is expected to be held in September.

At JC's request, the following action item was recorded:

New Action Item 230516-1: GV to share the AFRINIC Community Engagement plan with Sebastián Bellagamba.

DB asked who the point of contact for ISOC would be to discuss this with the NRO.

GV confirmed that it would be him and that he would also be in contact with the staff that is organizing all these meetings.

JC concluded by saying that they should make sure that everyone's role is clear, because we also need to coordinate with our friends at ICANN and we do not want duplication.

At this point, JC thanked the ISOC representatives for their participation in the meeting. SB and DB left the meeting.

4.- NRO Strategy Update

Deferred.

5.- AFRINIC Update

JC noted that this topic had already been discussed and asked if anyone wanted to add anything.

6.- AFRINIC Funding

GV shared on screen a spreadsheet showing the distribution of expenses if AFRINIC had been able to contribute, and the corresponding distribution excluding AFRINIC.

JC explained that we do not lend each other money. If we can reach a decision, it will help people trying to close their books and understand how these amounts are to be treated.

HPH said he is fine with the approach of treating it as an outstanding invoice.

JC concluded by saying that, if there are no concerns, we will presume that this is the approach we will be using and we will have our legal teams work out the details

NM said he has no objection to this. He will include this in AFRINIC's accounts and then reimburse the NRO.

7.- ISOC's Workshop on Number Resource System Resilience

JC shared that the NRO has received an invitation from Andrew to have a workshop on NRO and number resource system resilience and that we have had a bit of a challenge finding a date that works to schedule it.

JC sees no issue discussing AFRINIC, it is an issue our community needs to discuss. When we work with our partners, however, we need to walk a tight line between addressing their needs and respecting what our community wants. If ISOC can come up with a date, JC is not opposed to this. Also, he we might have more input if we held it at a later time.

All agreed

OR mentioned they might add to the reply that, if there is something urgent that Andrew would like to discuss, we could try to schedule a zoom meeting.

After some further discussion, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 230516-2: JC to reply to ISOC's invitation to hold a Workshop on Number Resource System Resilience: "It does not appear that we have critical mass, we welcome this discussion, but it will be better informed if we hold it later in the summer. We are happy to organize or have you organize it, as you prefer."

8.- ICANN 77 Washington DC Activities

Deferred.

9.- IANA EC Response to IANA RC

New Action Item 230516-3: JC to send to the IANA RC the response that he circulated via the NRO EC mailing list on 15 May.

Going back to agenda item 7, ICANN 77 Washington DC Activities, JC asked whether there are any other activities scheduled that they would like to talk about.

GV asked whether they would like to follow up with the meeting the NRO had with the ICANN leadership (Sally and the ICANN Board chair) in Cancún. If so, he offered to try to set up a meeting.

JC said he does not see the need to set up a meeting without specific content. If they reach out, JC would not be adverse to a meeting. JC said he was not planning to be in Washington. Should we wait for Sally to reach out or should we say we are not planning to meet?

HPH said he is planning to be in Washington. He agreed, since we will not all be there, there is no need for a semi-formal meeting with the with the ICANN CEO, or Board, or anything like that.

After some further discussion, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 230516-4: JC to reach out to Sally in advance and say "We weren't intending on meeting in Washington during ICANN 77, though we do know that there will be tactical work on IANA discussions and on the communications plan."

GV shared that he has booked a room similar to the one we had in Cancún, which also allows remote participation if needed.

10.- RIR CEO Updates

Deferred.

11.- Open Actions Review

Deferred.

12.- Minutes Review

Deferred.

13.- Next Meetings

Deferred.

At this time, JC noted that he would have to drop from the call. JC suggested adjourning the meeting.

All agreed and the meeting was adjourned at 11:45 UTC.