

# 2023-March-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

**FINAL**

**Date: Tuesday, 21 March 2023, 11:00 UTC**

**Attendees**

**Executive Council:**

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice-Chair
Oscar Robles	LACNIC	
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	

**Observers:**

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Bill Sanford (BS)	ARIN
Christ Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC
Ernesto Majo	LACNIC
Remco van Mook (RVM)	RIPE NCC
Glenn Price (GP)	LeaderShape Consulting

**Secretariat:**

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
--------------------	-----------------

## Agenda

**1.- Welcome**

**2.- Agenda Review**

### **3.- NRO Strategy Update**

#### **Outline**

- Update report by Glenn Price

### **4.- RIR Legal Team Report on NRO Operation**

#### **Outline**

- NRO EC to confirm that based on the legal review can operate according to the NRO MoU.
- NRO 2022 expenses, NRO distribution formula and Preparation of ICANN contribution were pending to this review.

### **5.- AFRINIC Update**

#### **Outline**

- Update from last events in AFRINIC

### **6.- 2023 NRO Budget**

#### **Outline**

- NRO EC to review proposed 2023 NRO Budget

### **7.- RIR CEO Updates**

### **8.- Open Actions Review**

### **9.- Minutes Review**

- 2023-February-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC)
- 2023-January-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN)
- 2022-December-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)
- 2022-November-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

### **10.- Next Meetings**

- a) Tuesday 18 April 2023 Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 16 May 2023 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 20 June 2023 Teleconference

**11.- AOB**

**12.- Adjourn**

## **New and Updated Action Items**

**New Action Item 230321-1:** JC to send an email to the CoE to hold a joint NRO EC and AFRINIC CoE meeting next week.

**New Action Item 230221-2:** JC to draft a response letter to Tanzania Internet Association regarding the AFRINIC situation. PW to review the draft reply, suggest any improvements or changes, and then send the response back to the EC. If all agree via email, the reply will be sent as soon as possible. *Updates Action Item 230221-3*

**New Action Item 230321-3:** GV to send the final version of the 2023 NRO Budget and NRO Distribution Formula to the mailing list. All to work on the approval of both documents via email in the coming week.

**New Action Item 230321-4:** GP to send the slide he shared on screen at the 21 March 2023 NRO EC teleconference (NRO EC 5-Year Strategy on a page) to the EC tomorrow (22 March) for review and final approval for external use. Once it is approved, GP to start building out a fairly short deck that can also be used and then run it past the EC.

## **New Resolutions**

### **Minutes**

#### **1.- Welcome**

JC welcomed everyone and opened the meeting at 11:02 UTC.

#### **2.- Agenda Review**

JC went over the agenda and observed that in under the AFRINIC Update they would discuss the communications we've been working on and CoE's response, as well as the next steps on data recovery.

#### **3.- NRO Strategy Update**

Rather than an update, GP said he had two questions for the EC.

He shared on screen a slide deck that he, RJ and GV have been working on, which the EC can use anytime they want to communicate about the strategy to an internal or external audience. This seems to be slowing us down, so he thinks it's important to finalize the slide on vision,

mission and strategy in the three key focus areas so that it can be displayed on the website. He is looking for permission to work with RJ and have that published as soon as possible.

JC said that we need to consider the implications if this is published. The content looks exactly like what we have agreed to, but JC would like a chance to take a look at it once again.

GP said that the thinking of the legal team was to not give any further information other than this. We will provide you with all the slides so that you can pick and choose for your audience depending on how much you want to talk to people about. In terms of publicly sharing out, this is the content that works the best.

GP's second request is that we'd like to start with nominations for the cybersecurity steering group and the engagement program. He will send the one-page capture and ask for nominations for the other two steering groups.

GP said that RJ and GV are engaging with the coordination groups off the back of the meeting we had in the US, so stand by for a full update, probably during our next call.

In terms of program manager recruitment, GP said that this is underway, RJ and GV have been working with ARIN HR manager, who's been working with the RIR HR CG on getting final job descriptions. Question for RJ: Do we have a date when we will allow everyone to publicize the positions?

RJ replied that we did an update on this at our meeting last month. He and GV have worked together and there is a task list that we will be working through this year on the wiki (<https://nrowiki.atlassian.net/l/cp/jMRqH98E>). He and GV have had some meetings and are getting together again tomorrow, they are going to advance a few items on the task list, and they will coordinate with GP.

GP thanked RJ for the update.

Finally, GP provided an update on the work of the RPKI steering group. Update: the team has taken quite a bit of responsibility; they have drafted detailed action plans that are going to be presented to GP and GV on 13 April. Perhaps we can have a couple of EC members at this meeting, as the steering group would appreciate EC sponsorship. He will let the EC know what is happening.

PW thanked GP for the slide deck.

GP agreed. He said he would share the single slide to get sign off and then it might be useful to create two slide decks, one for internal and one for external use, or perhaps a single slide deck for internal use.

PW wondered why the legal team wanted to reduce this to just one slide.

GP replied that there is nothing under cover, nothing “we've got to be secret” at all. It was simply a matter of “sometimes less, is more,” something discussed when we were in the US.

For the sake of helping to coordinate our external messaging, PW noted that having an individual slide for each of the programs might be useful, an expanded set of messages for external use.

GP thanked PW for his input and agreed that this might be a good idea. It's been six months, and he believes that this at least needs to be public. Then we could build it out from there. He doesn't think we should wait any longer, especially when our internal resources are working on it.

HPH believes that having a single-slide overview is very convenient, but if we give in-depth presentations, he thinks it's helpful to have at least one slide per area. Yet he also likes the idea of having the one-slide overview as well as an exec summary.

After some further discussion, the following way forward was agreed: GP will send the one slide tomorrow so we can get the thumbs up for external, and then start building a fairly short deck we can also use and then run that past the EC.

**New Action Item 230321-4:** GP to send the slide he shared on screen at the 21 March 2023 NRO EC teleconference (NRO EC 5-Year Strategy on a page) to the EC tomorrow (22 March) for review and final approval for external use. Once it is approved, GP to start building out a fairly short deck that can also be used and then run it past the EC.

Before dropping off the call, GP thanked everyone for their time, as well as RJ and GV for their support.

#### **4.- RIR Legal Team Report on NRO Operation**

JC said that the legal team sent a memo that says that the NRO EC can lead the NRO, even without a member from each RIR. This means that other items on this agenda are now able to be executed on. It's good to have that clarity.

GV thanked JC for the clarification. It is important to have this on the record, as we have some pending issues from the last meeting.

RVM agreed that it's very useful to have this clarified position before people start challenging us and doing anything in public.

#### **5.- AFRINIC Update**

JC reiterated that, today, the EC needs to discuss several things related to AFRINIC, the first of which is the message that we've been working on about communications and bringing the community together.

While sharing his screen, OR went over the final version of his Proposal to Re-Engage the AFRINIC Community. All edits have been accepted. Are there any additional comments?

JC said that the proposal looks very good. His questions are 1) who are we sending this document to? and 2) how?

HPH received a comment from Athina that says it's missing a step: what are the actions that are taken to get an election up and running? He wants the EC to be conscious that this is the case before we send this out.

JC said the question is that we encourage elections, but we haven't discussed how we go about that.

OR said he would prefer having this at a high level, without too much detail. In his opinion, describing how we want to convince the members or the court to have elections is out of the scope of this document. We want to engage organizations to re-engage the AFRINIC community regardless of court decisions.

PW said he gets the point, the document stands alone in saying that elections are required, suggesting that this might be imminent without being definitive or committing to a particular path. This might be a question for NM.

NM explained that AFRINIC needs a board so to at least be able to operate. The Proposal appears to be effectively what AFRINIC is trying to do.

RVM said he sympathizes completely with this Proposal. As HPH and Athina remarked, he would like to have a full understanding of why the courts are not allowing elections to happen. Having a full understanding of the current state of play would be very helpful before we start doing a public statement saying that we would like to have board elections.

HPH explained that the thought behind this letter was to send this to ICANN in order to invite them to do outreach to enable the community. This letter is not really intended as a community announcement, although it will be public as ICANN correspondence is public.

RVM said he is curious about what the motivation is, the reason why we're sending this to ICANN. Because this letter, like all documents that are sent to the ICANN Board, will be public, we should be very clear based on what rationale we are doing this, whether it has any relationship to ICP-2 or any of the agreements we've signed.

JC said that he would like the Proposal to be directed to ICANN more specifically. Perhaps putting the Proposal into letter format addressed to ICANN, adding a header and a signature block.

PW agreed. We can deal with this is an open letter to ICANN, which makes it a kind of an announcement, as ICANN publishes all letters they receive. We can publish it ourselves in the same form.

OR also agreed.

HPH proposed making this a letter to ICANN,

All agreed.

After some further discussion of the wording of the letter, OR incorporated (live) the minor edits agreed during today's call. All agreed that JC would sign the letter as the 2023 Chair of the NRO EC and address it to Tripti Sinha, cc Sally Costerton. GV will put the letter on NRO letterhead.

JC then provided an update on the Council of Elders' efforts

After discussing possible time slots for the meeting with the CoE, no further comments were heard on this topic.

**New Action Item 230321-1:** JC to send an email to the CoE to hold a joint NRO EC and AFRINIC CoE meeting next week.

The final item on the AFRINIC status update is the request from Noah and the Tanzania ISP Association.

The following action item was updated:

**Updated Action Item 230221-2:** JC to draft a response letter to Tanzania Internet Association regarding the AFRINIC situation. PW to review the draft reply, suggest any improvements or changes, and then send the response back to the EC. If all agree via email, the reply will be sent as soon as possible.

No further items were brought up for discussion regarding AFRINIC

## **6.- 2023 NRO Budget**

While the 2023 NRO Budget was displayed on the screen, GV explained that he had shared a draft of this document in December and January. It is now updated with a comparison with the 2022 budget and adjusted for inflation. As agreed, all coordination group expenses have been removed and the estimated cost of the NRO programs have been added (this was estimated as half of the USD750,000 discussed in Miami, as the programs will only be running for six months).

GV then went over the individual items and amounts included in the document. He noted that he had included notes for some cells for clarity and asked whether there were any questions.

JC said that the NRO EC had seen the 2023 NRO Budget presented three times, but we did not know whether we had clear authority to adopt it. Now that we have clear authority, he asked if there were any questions.

PW asked whether it is expected that these amounts will be shared among four or among five RIRs. He also asked if they could take a look at the percentages for each RIR now.

GV shared on screen the NRO Distribution Formula spreadsheet for four or five RIRs.

HPH said that his approach would be to budget for the worst and to hope for the best.

JC agreed. These numbers will be reconciled at the end of 2023, so he is budgeting for the worst-case scenario but hoping that AFRINIC will be back in regular operation when we reconcile.

GV then went over the numbers included in the NRO Distribution Formula, explaining what it includes (e.g., six months of the NRO Programs, 2023 NRO regular budget and ICANN contribution).

After some additional discussion, the following action item was agreed:

**New Action Item 230321-3:** GV to send the final version of the 2023 NRO Budget and NRO Distribution Formula to the mailing list. All to work on the approval of both documents via email in the coming week.

## **7.- RIR CEO Updates**

HPH presented the following update:

- The RIPE NCC is going through a reorganization. All the technology departments will be organised under one manager. Felipe will now be appointed CTO of the RIPE NCC, and we will start recruitment of a new Chief Registry Officer.
- We have started to engage with our membership on the charging scheme for 2024. There is quite a lot of engagement on the list around this topic.
- Inflation rates in the Netherlands are expected to be in the 7-8% range also this year. Unless we can increase the budget for 2024, we will have a very tight year.

JC then presented the following update for ARIN:

- ARIN is moving into its preparations for our April meeting in Tampa.
- This is the last year that ARIN will be offering legacy registrants the chance to enter a registration agreement with ARIN and get a fee cap which we have offered to legacy registrants for the last 25 years. If they enter into the legacy agreement after the end of this year, they will pay the same fees as all other customers (they get all of our services, but they would be paying normal fees, not a capped fee schedule). This has caused quite a bit of excitement in the US legacy community. We are seeing a pretty significant uptake in interest and expect that to continue.

No other RIR updates were presented.

## **8.- Open Actions Review**

Action Item 230221-3 was discussed and updated earlier today, which resulted in its update.



**Updated Action Item 230321-2:** JC to draft a response letter to Tanzania Internet Association regarding the AFRINIC situation. PW to review the draft reply, suggest any improvements or changes, and then send the response back to the EC. If all agree via email, the reply will be sent as soon as possible.

Action Item 230221-4: All RIR CEOs. To instruct their Registration Services Managers to coordinate through the RSCG to contact MANRS for a more detailed information and scope of their requested work regarding the classification and state of unallocated address space in the RIRs. CLOSED

Action Item 220726-4: HPH will share with the EC draft output of the RIPE NCC'S recommended approaches to crisis response once this output is ready (2022 Q4). OPEN

JC received this document in December but has not had time yet to propose an NRO version of that.

## **9.- Minutes Review**

2023-February-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC)

2023-January-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN)

2022-December-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

2022-November-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

JC reminded everyone to try to catch up on this, at least for 2022.

## **10.- Next Meetings**

- a) Tuesday 18 April 2023 Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 16 May 2023 Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 20 June 2023 Teleconference

JC observed that 18 April is in the middle of ARIN time, so he will be on that call but will probably have to leave early. He will also have to leave early on 16 May. There is no need, however, to move any of these dates.

No other conflicts were brought up regarding these dates.

## **11.- AOB**

No further business was brought up for discussion.

## **12. Adjourn**

There being no further business to discuss, a motion to adjourn the meeting was approved and the meeting ended at 13:03 UTC.