

# 2022-May-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 24 May 2022, 11:00 AM UTC

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
Hans Petter Holen	RIPE NCCC	Vice-Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Treasurer
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	
Eddy Kayihura (EK)	AFRINIC	

### Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Kenny Huang (KH)	APNIC
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Esteban Lescano (EL)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Bill Sandiford (BS)	ARIN

### Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavón (LP)	Minutes

## Agenda

**1.- Welcome**

**2.- Agenda Review**

**3.- NRO Strategy Review Plan**

**4.- Reverse DNS Resolution Content in the IANA SLA Update**

**5.- RIR CEO Updates**

**6.- Open Actions Review**

**7.- Minutes Review**

- **2022-April-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, RIPE NCC)**

**8.- Next Meetings**

**a) 23 and 24 June 2022 f2f Meeting in Miami FL USA**

**b) Tuesday 19 July 2022**

**c) Tuesday 16 August 2022**

**9.- AOB**

**10. Adjourn**

## **New Action Items**

## **New Resolutions**

### **Minutes**

**1.- Welcome**

PW opened the meeting at 11:03 UTC.

**2.- Agenda Review**

PW went over the agenda, which was approved as written.

**3.- NRO Strategy Review Plan**

This agenda item was postponed.

#### **4.- Reverse DNS Resolution Content in the IANA SLA Update**

PW asked HPH whether he had any update on this.

HPH replied that he sent Kim Davies a reminder on 6 May but did not receive a response. He added that it's been almost two years now and that the question is whether he should escalate or just wait for ICANN's legal team.

PW noted that he could propose having a meeting with Kim Davies in The Hague to check if they need the NRO EC's help in this.

HPH concluded by saying that he would drop an email to Kim Davies and copy PW saying they both will be in The Hage and suggesting a meeting to see what ICANN needs to get this moving.

#### **5.- RIR CEO Updates**

Brief AFRINIC update by EK:

- AFRINIC has done some engagement with members, and visited different countries. Turnout is small, but face-to-face meetings lead to important discussions, and more and more members are understanding what is happening. AFRINIC will continue with this engagement.
- Members recommending other Members is the approach AFRINIC is adopting with its membership base.

Brief ARIN update by JC:

- ARIN has been noting a surge in attempted attacks against <http://arin.net> accounts (dictionary, brute force that ends up being a DDoS). Two-factor authentication is available but not everyone uses it. ARIN is in the process of adding SMS-based 2FA (in addition to token-based). ARIN is about to do a consultation with the community (whether 2FA should be mandatory when SMS authentication is available).
- ARIN had a great national meeting.
- We're looking at a refresher of our policy development process.

OR observed that LACNIC just introduced 2FA last year.

In HPH's opinion, 2FA should be mandatory.

PW observed that APNIC has deployed Okta for 2FA, that quite a lot of people are using it, and that APNIC enforces its use for certain functions that cannot be accessed without 2FA.

Brief LACNIC update by OR:

- During the latest Member Assembly, we proposed some changes to the LACNIC Bylaws and those were approved. Most relevant changes:
  - We'll be introducing two new directors over the next two years (one in 2022, one in 2023), although the Board may delay this until 2023 and 2025.
  - The introduction of objective criteria to allow candidates to run for the board. That is going to be done in collaboration with the Electoral Commission and a third-party institution. These will likely be an online training course and an assessment on corporate governance (the knowledge relevant for our organizations), the LACNIC critical processes and number resources ecosystem. This will be a challenge for the coming months, as we're facing some difficult questions (e.g., what happens if nobody passes this assessment?).
- LACNIC had its first hybrid event. We received about 530 in-person attendees and 600 online visitors. Attendance was great both in-person and online and there was also a good sense of community, reunion, and collaboration.

Brief RIPE update by HPH:

- RIPE held its meeting in Berlin with 589 onsite and 180 online participants.
- At the GM, two board members were up for re-election and were re-elected.
- Chris Kaufmann has been elected to the ICANN Board, he has announced he will step down as chair but will complete his term on the RIPE board, as the overlap period will be very short.
- There was a discussion in the GM on a suggestion from the Ukrainian ISP association to waive fees for members in Ukraine. The RIPE NCC has previously communicated it will not close any member due to non-payment due to the war. Payments will not be waived, but payment terms extended for a year at a time.

Brief APNIC update by PW:

- APNIC is preparing a hybrid meeting that will take place in Singapore in September, taking note of all the meetings that have happened already to try to figure out how many people may turn up.

## **6.- Open Actions Review**

It was observed that all action items are complete.

JC commented that the program team for RPKI had a successful kick-off, and that they got together, and discussed how to have a secure, coordinated set of services for the five RIRs. He added that some members of the team are now working on the areas of scope that need to be considered. JC will keep pushing this along in this interim mode while the EC figures out what we are going to do strategically with all these programs, as this is something that eventually will be done by the program managers.

PW thanked JC for the update and also GV for setting up the mailing list and space on the wiki for the RPKI program team.

Seeing that he was present on the call, PW asked PH if he could share an update from the PACG.

PH replied that last week the PACG had a three-hour meeting, after meeting in person in person in Geneva in February. Last week's agenda included Internet governance matters, planning our activities for the upcoming IGF. It was a good exchange of information. There are a few follow-up issues but something that came to light was whether the NRO would be willing to sponsor a cocktail jointly with ICANN and ISOC. Members of the PACG were positive about this, although not all members are sure we will be able to be present at the IGF. He mentioned that it would be good to know what the EC thinks about this outreach activity that has been successful in previous IGFs. He concluded by saying that when the notes of the latest PACG meeting are ready he will share them in the wiki space

### **7.- Minutes Review**

- 2022-April-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, RIPE NCC)
- All agreed that they would review these minutes.

### **8.- Next Meetings**

- a) 23 and 24 June 2022 f2f Meeting in Miami FL USA
- b) Tuesday 19 July 2022
- c) Tuesday 16 August 2022

No changes were made to the dates set for the next three meetings.

### **9.- AOB**

GV mentioned that ASO AC will not have an election process next year, so they have started a process to engage in a deep review of the ASO AC procedures which are very old and becoming outdated. The ASO AC has created a small committee to draft a proposal with changes and they expect to have a document ready for discussion and possible approval by the AC at the time of the second RIPE meeting of 2022. In this case, they may approach the RIRs to seek support for a full ASO AC meeting, the first one after three years. He added that this was not definitive but depends on how the committee works on this document. At the same time, the ASO AC may also request the NRO to provide a legal review of the procedures.

PW thanked GV for the update.

JC then asked about a draft agenda for the upcoming NRO EC meeting in Miami.

GV replied that he would follow up on this with GP.

PW mentioned that the agenda has been under discussion, that he had understood that it would be ready for today, but that they can work on the agenda online.

JC concluded by saying that the agenda will require careful attention and noted that all of us should be prepared.

## **10.- Adjourn**

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 13:04 UTC.