

2022-June-24: Minutes NRO EC f2f Meeting Miami

FINAL

Date: Friday, 24 June 2022, 16:30 Miami Local Time (UTC-4)

Attendees

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair	Online participation
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Vice-Chair	
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Treasurer	
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC		
Eddy Kayihura (EK)	AFRINIC		

Observers:

Benjamin Eshun	AFRINIC	
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC	Online participation
Bill Sandiford (BS)	ARIN	
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN	
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC	
Esteban Lescano (EL)	LACNIC	
Remco Van Mook (RVM)	RIPE NCC	
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC	Online participation
Glenn Price (GP)	LeaderShape	

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat	Online participation
Laureana Pavón (LP)	Minutes	Online participation

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- IETF Trust Support

4.- Reverse DNS Resolution Content in the IANA SLA Update

5.- NRO Contribution to IGF UN Secretariat

6.- RIR CEO Updates

7.- [Open Actions Review](#)

8.- Minutes Review

- [2022-May-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference](#) - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN)
- [2022-April-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference](#) - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, RIPE NCC)

9.- Next Meetings

a) Next NRO EC f2f Meeting.

a) Tuesday 19 July 2022 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 16 August 2022 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 20 September 2022 Teleconference

10.- AOB

11. Adjourn

New Action Items

New Action Item 220624-1: OR to draft a message to John Levine of the IETF Trust and share it to the mailing list. Themes for the message: the RIRs will provide the requested support but we'd like you to use the rest of the ecosystem; the RIRs are just hearing from the IETF Trust now; it would be good for the IETF Trust to come to the RIRs more often so we can hear how you are benefitting our community.

New Action Item 220624-2: JC to review and confirm proposed amendment to the SLA matched NRO proposal. Once JC confirms, PW will get back to Kim Davies so they can begin the process for signing it electronically, or at face-face event (probably ICANN 75 in Kuala Lumpur).

New Action Item 220624-3: JC to send GV the PDF version of the letter from the four RIRs (all except AFRINIC) to the Mauritius government. GV to strike EK from the bottom of the letter and send it to the list for the four CEOs to sign.

New Resolutions

R-20220624-1: The NRO EC resolves to contribute USD 25,000 to the IETF Trust to support their restructuring.

R-20220624-2: The NRO EC resolves to transfer an NRO contribution of USD 75,000 to UNDESA to support the IGF Secretariat.

=====

Minutes

1.- Welcome^[IETF]_[SEP:SEP]

PW welcomed everybody at 16:15 Miami time (UTC-4).

2.- Agenda Review

PW reviewed the agenda. No changes were made.

3.- IETF Trust Support

PW said there had been an email from John Levine asking if the RIRs would be interested in providing some support to the IETF Trust and opened the floor to comments.

GV displayed the email from John Levine onscreen.

JC explained that the IETF Trust is separate from IETF LLC, that all it does is hold intellectual property, and that the IETF trust is thinking about restructuring itself as a non-profit instead of an unincorporated common law trust. They're looking for a one-off contribution of USD 25,000.

PW said he was comfortable with this assuming it is in the contingency of the NRO budget or other unspent budget items.

GV shared that there are USD 10,000 for contingency and that there was some unspent budget in items such as AC Chair travel.

HPH said that if there is budget for it, he's in favor of the contribution.

OR commented that IETF activity is core to our role, that the RIRs already contribute to the IETF.

After some further discussion, the following resolution and action were decided:

R-20220624-1: The NRO EC resolves to contribute USD 25,000 to the IETF Trust to support their restructuring.

New Action Item 220624-1: OR to draft a message to John Levine of the IETF Trust and share it to the mailing list.

4.- Reverse DNS Resolution Content in the IANA SLA Update

HPH said that the proposed amendment to the SLA looks good. JC agreed.

HPH asked whether a consultation on this is needed.

JC replied that, to the best of his knowledge, this document is a service we're already receiving, so no consultation is needed.

OR asked if someone would be reviewing the document to check that it matched what we suggested

JC explained that it is a short amendment, not a new document.

PW and HPH agreed that it makes sense for it to be an amendment.

JC said that everything looks fine and asked for 24 hours for a final review. Presuming it matches what we submitted, ARIN is fine.

New Action Item 220624-2: JC to review and confirm proposed amendment to the SLA matched NRO proposal. Once JC confirms, PW will get back to Kim Davies so they can begin the process for signing it electronically, or at face-face event (probably ICANN 75 in Kuala Lumpur).

5.- NRO Contribution to IGF UN Secretariat

JC suggested discussing in the future the relevance of the IGF for the RIRs.

PW asked whether anyone had any objections to going ahead as planned and budgeted.

None were heard.

R-20220624-2: The NRO EC resolves to transfer an NRO contribution of USD 75,000 to UNDESA to support the IGF Secretariat.

6.- RIR CEO Updates

All discussed the status of the draft NRO letter for the Mauritius government sent yesterday to the NRO EC list.

New Action Item 220624-3: JC to send GV the PDF version of the letter from the four RIRs (all except AFRINIC) to the Mauritius government. GV to strike EK from the bottom of the letter and send it to the list for the four CEOs to sign.

ARIN update by JC:

- There are some discussions going on regarding a mailing list that hadn't been used for years to which you were automatically subscribed when you received resources. Every message resulted in a storm of complaints, so that list was shut down. We have a General Members mailing list to discuss things like fees, etc. We had a scenario where people are using the Public Policy mailing list for any ARIN discussion. Now there is a consultation in the ARIN region about reopening the Discuss mailing list.
- Since last year, ARIN offers its size category "2X" and greater customers a service called Premier Support Plan. This service is included in the fee for 2X customers and above, now it will be available to any customer for a fee.

7.- Open Actions Review

There are currently no open actions.

8.- Minutes Review

- [2022-May-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference](#) - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN)
- [2022-April-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference](#) - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, RIPE NCC)

PW invited the others to review the pending minutes.

9.- Next Meetings

a) Next NRO EC f2f Meeting.

a) Tuesday 19 July 2022 Teleconference

b) Tuesday 16 August 2022 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 20 September 2022 Teleconference

EK mentioned that he would not be able to attend the 19 July meeting.

All agreed to move it to 26 July 2022 at the usual time.

10.- AOB

GV asked the EC if they have an approximation of when and where the next NRO EC face-to-face meeting would be. This would be for the continuation of the strategy process, signing of the MoU, and other business

PW suggested the EC think about next steps, as it is a bit premature to decide when and where the EC will meet again. He asked GV to add this to the agenda for their July meeting.

PW then asked GP what the EC can expect from him after this meeting.

GP replied that the EC could expect a brief capture and recommendation report. He will share really raw information with the CEOs, providing them with a link to his capture format. He will then put together a report that will provide a draft of a strategy plan. He added that there are some recommendations the EC can pick up on a call and said he would try to join the EC meeting on 26 July, but that he will send the report before then.

PW moved a vote of thanks to GP for his work over the last couple of days. All agreed.

PW's final word of thanks was for the ARIN staff who supported this meeting.

11. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 17:25 local Miami time (UTC-4).