

# 2021-October-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

**Date:** Tuesday, 19 October 2021, 11:00 UTC

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Chair
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Vice-Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Treasurer
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	
Eddy Kayihura (EK)	AFRINIC	

### Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Kenny Huang	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Paul Andersen	ARIN
Ernesto Majó	LACNIC
Eduardo Jimenez	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC
Felipe Victolla Silveira (FVS)	RIPE NCC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

### Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavón	Minutes

## Agenda

**1 Welcome**

**2. Agenda Review**

**3. Legal Team Update**

**a) Legal Status IP address Document**

**4. AFRINIC Situation Update**

**5. NRO Strategy Review Plan**

**a) NRO EC f2f Workshop**

**6. ECG: An integrated report across the RIRs with the status of RPKI resilience**

**7. Reverse DNS Resolution in the SLA Update**

**8. 2022 ASO Review**

**9. 2022 NRO EC Roles**

**10. RIR Updates**

**11. Secretariat Report**

**a) ASO Mailing Lists**

**12. Open Actions Review**

**13. Minutes Review**

- 2021-September-21:Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - **DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC)**
- 2021-August-17:Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - **DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC)**

**14. Next Meetings**

**a) Tuesday 30 November 2021**

**b) Tuesday 21 December 2021**

**c) Tuesday 18 January 2022**

**15. AOB**

**a) ICANN Recognition Email.**

## **16. Adjourn**

### **New Action Items**

No new actions recorded

### **New Resolutions**

No new resolutions recorded

--

## **Minutes**

### **1. Welcome**

HPH welcomed everybody and opened the meeting at 11:02 AM UTC.

### **2. Agenda Review**

JC noted that ICANN sent a message saying they would be recognizing him as a member of the Empowered Community. Because he is not the Empowered Community Administration member for the ASO (OR is), he suggested adding this item under AOB.

At HPH's request, GV went over the draft agenda, which was approved as written with the addition suggested by JC above.

### **3. Legal Team Update**

#### **a) Legal Status IP address Document**

AF introduced the topic by saying that the legal team had finalized two documents and sent them to GV earlier in the day ("Legal Status of IP Addresses" report containing a proposed common RIR statement, an addendum with legal status of IP addresses in each RIR).

She explained that the legal team had identified the common elements of each RIR's legal analysis and come up with a common position:

*"IP addresses are not property. The right to IP addresses is the right to registration of IP addresses, which comes with exclusive rights to use and to transfer them, based on and subject to a contractual relationship between the right holder and the relevant RIR.*

*The right to registration of IP addresses may be eligible to seizure or some form of precautionary measure in civil proceedings, subject to limitations of the contractual relationship between the right holder and the relevant RIR."*

JC thanked the legal team for their great work and recommended that the NRO EC formally recognize that the report from the legal team is done and accept this document as it is. He added that it would be a significant step forward, as further refinements would have to reconcile each region's legal framework. He also recommended using the phrasing in the document in the RIR's communications.

AF then showed the second document on screen, explaining that each RIR had performed a legal analysis in their jurisdiction (Dutch law, Australian law, etc.), based on which the legal team had come up with a common statement. She added that they had found no inconsistencies, simply different legal systems.

After further discussing the different terms and concepts used in the various legal systems, JC stressed that the current statement is consistent with the construct that the RIRs have.

After some further discussion, JC proposed that the NRO EC: 1) Accept the "Legal Status of IP Addresses" report from the legal team and refer same to their organizations for use, and 2) Thank the legal team for their fine work.

No one opposed and JC's motion was approved.

#### **4. AFRINIC Situation Update**

EK shared that the freezing order against AFRINIC has been removed.

#### **5. NRO Strategy Review Plan**

GV shared that Glenn Price of Leader Shape had sent an email a few hours ago suggesting a face-to-face workshop with the NRO EC in Honolulu on 20-21 January 2022, right after the PTC22 meeting.

PW and JC mentioned that they are both planning to be there, travel restrictions permitting.

EK noted that, if everyone was good with the date and location, he would be there.

OR commented that he might need to be in Montevideo that week and added that he would double-check and get back to the EC on whether he would be available on that date.

After some further discussion, it was decided to wait until OR confirmed his availability and then ask GV to secure a meeting room before making travel arrangements. It was also decided to postpone the decision on whether the workshop would be attended by the CEOs only, by the CEOs +1, or by the CEOs +2 (board and staff).

#### **6. ECG: An integrated report across the RIRs with the status of RPKI resilience**

FVS shared a RPKI resiliency report on screen, showing its status across the five RIRs.

He began with a brief summary, including the following highlights: 1) The current state of infrastructure seems sufficient, though there are some concerns; 2) There is an overall move towards compliance; 3) Since each RIR can claim 0/0, a compromised trust anchor can potentially sign statements that affect global Internet routing; 4) This is a draft report, a final report will be sent in a couple of weeks.

FVS then presented the overall status of RPKI resiliency in each of the five RIRs, including information on Repositories (RRDP and rsync), Trust Anchor, Security, and Compliance in each region, and some more detailed information on the status in the RIPE NCC.

HPH thanked FVS for his presentation and said he was looking forward to seeing the cooperation move forward.

PW thanked FVS for a very informative presentation. He wondered about the next steps, i.e., has the ECG planned something to go from here? is there an intentional process going on? He also observed that each RIR is providing an attack surface that includes 0/0.

Regarding the fact that each RIR is providing 0/0, PW noted that they are all doing different things, providing five different opportunities for attack and wondered if this is this receiving enough attention.

JC agreed with PW that the RIRs have five different attack surfaces, adding that solving this would mean having only one attack surface, but an extremely attractive one with the potential to cause much harm if attacked.

FVS observed that there is an action on the NRO ECG to map the attack surface, that the ECG shares experiences at least once a quarter about RPKI resiliency, but that there is no single plan that everyone is following. At the root of the problem is the fact that each RIR is holding a 0/0.

HPH said if they replace five organizations with one, the risk would be different.

JC mentioned that it's a complicated issue and that he's not sure whether he'd like to be 0/0 for the global internet.

EK said he needs to do some more work on this, but that he understands it is a risk. He asked FVS if he would mind sending him the draft presentation today and FVS agreed.

HPH noted that the draft activity plan and budget that RIPE NCC is about to publish includes a significant increase in the RPKI activity and is a clear indication that we take this seriously.

PW reiterated his question to FVP regarding next steps.

FVS said that the ECG touches base regularly and share experiences, but they do not have a master plan all RIRs are following. He offered to bring this back and see if there are areas they need to focus on, e.g., compliance. He said that the EC might want to discuss this at EC level and

define priorities. He concluded by saying that the final report would be shared in a couple of weeks, after which they can discuss next steps.

HPH thanked FVS and said he looks forward to the final presentation. He added that they should get back to this in one year and see the status.

All agreed.

## **7. Reverse DNS Resolution in the SLA**

HPH noted that he had an Action Item (210316-4) to follow up with Kim Davies regarding the second round of comments to the proposal to include reverse DNS content in the SLA. HPH said he would follow up on that moving forward, that, basically, it was stuck in legal, but that Kim Davies thought it was a good idea, so he would move forward with planning and implementation.

## **8. 2022 ASO Review**

It was decided to postpone this agenda item until the next NRO EC meeting.

## **9. 2022 NRO EC Roles**

It was decided to postpone this agenda item until the next NRO EC meeting.

## **10. RIR Updates**

As an FYI, JC noted that ARIN was holding its policy meeting today and Thursday, six or seven proposals will be discussed.

HPH shared that he is busy preparing for the RIPE meeting at the end of November as well as the activity plan and budget which should be released shortly.

OR mentioned that LACNIC 36 had just concluded, a meeting held in a hybrid format with attendance via Zoom (full virtual participation) as well as in-person participants at two local hubs, one in Uruguay, the other in Argentina. He added that it had been a good experience and served as a rehearsal for the next LACNIC meeting, which will probably be held in this same format and based in Cali, Colombia.

## **11. Secretariat Report**

### **a) ASO Mailing Lists**

GV shared that there had been an outage of the ASO mailing lists last week and that the lists had been down for a few days while the RIPE NCC staff who provide the technical support were solving the issue. He reported that the ASO AC chairs held their monthly meeting in the middle of this outage, that he had to inform the chairs of this problem, and that the chairs had raised

some concerns about this. GV explained that he had contacted the ASO AC members about this and that they may contact the EC about the incident and request support to secure this service in the future. GV added that he had replied that the NRO is committed to giving the AC all the resources necessary for the ASO to operate fully. No part of the operational cycle was affected by the outage, except for the first reminder of their monthly teleconference.

As the operator of the server with those lists, HPH apologized on behalf of RIPE NCC. He said there was an investigation and that there was a report that he had not seen yet but would be happy to share. He also offered to pass on the operation of this to anybody else but added that if the decision was to continue as now, he would make sure that the necessary actions are put in place to make sure that this does not happen again.

## **12. Open Actions Review**

It was decided to postpone this agenda item.

## **13. Minutes Review**

HPH observed that it was nice to see that the decision to set deadlines for approval of minutes had had good results, as there were only minutes pending approval.

## **14. Next Meetings**

### **a) Tuesday 30 November 2021**

Everyone confirmed that this date was OK.

### **b) Tuesday 21 December 2021**

### **c) Tuesday 18 January 2022**

All agreed to revisit the December and January meeting dates at the next NRO EC meeting.

## **15. AOB**

ICANN Community Recognition at ICANN72, “acknowledgement of your service as Empowered Community Administration Member” – Topic proposed by JC

HPH asked JC what he would need re the recognition email.

JC said he was not planning on attending ICANN72 and that the message had come out of the blue. He then asked if anyone had any context in relation to this.

JC said one option would be to reply “I won’t be participating in the ICANN meeting; in addition, OR is the NRO EC’s Empower Community member, if that’s relevant to the to this discussion” and see what they say.

All agreed.

## **16. Adjourn**

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 13:01 UTC.