

# 2021-January-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

## Minutes

**Date:** Tuesday, 19 January 2021, 11 am UTC.

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Chair
John Curran	ARIN	Treasurer
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	
Eddy Kayihura (EK)	AFRINIC	

### Apologies:

Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Vice-Chair & Secretary
-------------------	--------	------------------------

### Observers:

Subramanian Moonesamy (SM)	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Paul Andersen (PA)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC

### Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
--------------------	-----------------

# Agenda

## 0. Welcome

## 1 Agenda Review

## 2 Timeline NRO strategic planning Process

## 3 Confirmation of ASO Representative to the ICANN Empowered Community Administration.

## 4 Coordinations Groups Reports/Consultations

- a) CCG(Communications) Chair 2021: Antony Gollan
- b) RSCG(Registration Services) Chair 2021: Marco Schmidt
- c) ECG(Engineering) Chair 2021: Felipe Victolla Silveira
- d) PSCG(Public Safety) Chair 2021: Chris Buckridge
- e) PACG/ISG(Public Affairs Group) Chair 2021: Chris Buckridge

## 5 NRO NC

- a) New chair Kevin Blumberg
- b) Guidance on physical meetings in 2021
- c) ICANN 70 Cancun (to be Virtual)
  - i) ASO AC plans: no activity planned

## 6 Open Actions Review

## 7 Minutes Review

2020-December-8: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending, AFRINIC, ARIN,, RIPE NCC)

2020-November-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending, AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN)

## **8 Next Meetings**

- a) Tuesday 16 February 2021
- b) Tuesday 17 March 2021
- c) Tuesday 20 April 2021

## **9 AOB**

## **10 Adjourn**

# **Resolutions**

–

# **New Action Items**

–

# **Minutes**

## **0 Welcome**

HPH welcomed everybody and opened the NRO EC meeting at 11:07 AM UTC, wishing all a great start of the new year during which it is his turn to chair the EC.

## **1 Agenda Review**

At HPH's request, GV commented the items included in the meeting agenda.

JC commented that he had emailed GV asking for an update from the legal team on Action Item 20200922-1. GV replied that he had contacted the legal team and that the legal team would be meeting next Monday to work on their action items.

## **2 Timeline NRO strategic planning Process**

HPH noted that GV had circulated a third draft of the NRO Strategic Planning Timeline.

GV reminded the EC that the first draft had extended to the end of the year, that the second draft had aimed to end in June or July, and that they had finally decided that perhaps that wasn't realistic.

GV then showed the third version on screen, noting that he had reviewed it with OR and that the new target was to finish by the end of September, for which they would need to start soon or extend the first stages of the timeline by one week. He added that this was similar to the previous version, with some adjustments in the time required to perform each step as well as some dependencies.

GV noted that the most important task they should be tackling in order to advance this according to the timeline was to draft the request for proposals and an active discussion about the cost.

HPH asked what kind of decisions GV required of the EC today to move ahead.

GV suggested having a brief discussion with OR and proposing some options on this matter. Then, with the agreement of HPH, draft a request for proposals for the EC to review in the coming days.

### **3 Confirmation of ASO Representative to the ICANN Empowered Community Administration.**

At HPH's request, GV reminded everyone that the EC needs to confirm the appointment of their representative to the ICANN Empowered Community Administration; that, according to the EC's internal procedures, they had agreed that this representative would be the NRO EC Secretary; and that a draft letter had been prepared. He added that, as part of the internal process, it was important to have it recorded in the minutes.

GV suggested including in the minutes that OR was the appointed representative. He added that, once HPH had signed the letter, he would follow up on the process, sending the letter to ICANN Legal Counsel and the ICANN empowered community.

JC moved to reappoint OR as representative to the ICANN Empowered Community Administration, PW seconded, no objections were heard, and the motion carried.

HPH stressed that they would need OR's retrospective approval of this to record it in the minutes.

### **4 Coordinations Groups Reports/Consultations**

- a) **CCG**(Communications) Chair 2021: Antony Gollan
- b) **RSCG**(Registration Services) Chair 2021: Marco Schmidt
- c) **ECG**(Engineering) Chair 2021: Felipe Victolla Silveira
- d) **PSCG**(Public Safety) Chair 2021: Chris Buckridge
- e) **PACG/ISG**(Public Affairs Group) Chair 2021: Chris Buckridge

HPH asked if any of the chairs of the coordination groups were present on the call and willing to present their reports.

CB said they had prepared draft work plans for 2021 for both the PSCG and the PACG and that they had been circulated on the mailing lists for comments and feedback.

CB then shared that they were relatively high-level work plans and proceeded to describe the key points of the PSCG work plan.

- Operationalize the NRO M3AAWG. Develop what their presence will be in the M3AAWG general meetings, potentially chair a newly formed special interest group on DNS and IP number abuse, coordinate the NRO's M3AAWG membership.

CB said that one point the PSCG had been discussed in relation to M3AAWG was that they had asked them not to make any public statements or mention of their membership for the first 12 months. He said that, despite this being unusual for the security community, the request had not terribly concerned him, but that it had raised some concerns in terms of the group's transparency to their communities.

PW observed that not advertising their membership was not a big deal but wondered why this request was limited to the first 12 months.

JC agreed with PW. He said it would be good to get more context, adding that, if there were any responsibilities attached, he would like to know them now rather than 11 months from now.

CB said he would try to come back with some more information on this.

After further discussion, JC looked up and quoted the typical M3AAWG membership requirements ("New members will not be listed in the public M3AAWG member roster and cannot display a M3AAWG logo or make any statement of membership on their website or in other company materials, blogs or social media accounts for the first 12 months of their membership and can only do so after their membership is renewed for another 12 months") and the matter was settled.

- Reconnect with global LEA communities, particularly given the absence of physical meetings. Possible organize a joint engagement event.

- Coordinate approach in relation to abuse reporting contacts on RIR sites/resources.

No comments were heard on the PSCG work plan, so CB went on to comment on the NRO PACG work plan.

CB noted that there had been strong resistance to having much formalization around this group, which currently does not have a formal charter in place. He said he'd asked GV to set up a wiki space for the PACG where they could post their work plan and include a paragraph on what the PACG is, as the group was not looking for much formalization but rather having some meetings, as they used to have during ICANN meetings.

CB noted that PACG projects mainly involved coordination and mentioned the following:

- Coordination with the ITU, as a number of major ITU events had been postponed so several major ITU events will be taking place in the next two years. Likewise, ARIN and AFRINIC are in the process of applying to have their membership fees waived, so the PSCG is looking at having a coordinated approach in this regard.
- Internet governance positions re. the Internet number registry system, as the outcome of some discussions taking place at the UN and elsewhere might have implications for the work of the RIRs and their communities.
- OECD and UN coordination.
- Update the Continuing Cooperation brochure

All thanked CB for presenting the two work plans.

HPH then asked whether both work plans were ready for approval and CB confirmed that they were.

JC moved to approve the NRO PSCG and PACG work plans for 2021, EK seconded, no objections were heard, and the motion carried.

HPH then noted that they had the NRO CCG work plan, but that Anthony Gollan was not present on the call.

GV replied that he would follow up with Anthony Gollan, Felipe Victolla and Marco Schmidt so they will be present at the next EC meeting to present their work plans.

HPH commented that he had received a message from Athina Fragkouli regarding the status of the legal coordination working group and whether there was any reason for this not to be a formal coordination group with a work plan and so on. He asked whether someone with organizational knowledge could comment on this.

JC said there was no reason why it shouldn't be, but that they had never formally created a legal team,

HPH said he would report back to Athina Fragkouli on this matter.

## **5 NRO NC**

- a) New chair Kevin Blumberg
- b) Guidance on physical meetings in 2021
- c) ICANN 70 Cancun (to be Virtual)
  - i) ASO AC plans: no activity planned

HPH mentioned that he had had a meeting with Kevin Blumberg, former vice chair and recently elected ASO AC chair, and that he had informally raised two issues, the first of which was whether the EC wanted to provide any guidance on physical meetings in 2021, hinting that it might not be realistic to plan any physical meetings this year.

The EC then discussed various dates on which different national borders might be closed to international travel, after which HPH said he would provide informal feedback to KB to not depend on any formal in-person meetings to do their work this year.

HPH then shared that that the ASO did not have any plans to do anything at the Cancun (now virtual) ICANN meeting.

To conclude, HPH said that KB had mentioned that the ASO AC would appreciate more guidance from the NRO EC, so he would attend their next call to any offer support the ASO AC might need. He said that he had got the impression that KB wanted to stay focused on the core actions of the Council, according to the MoU, and that the ASO AC was currently focused on selecting a board member for ICANN.

HPH added that KB had also noted that there had been a motion for the ASO AC to review all their procedures and that this had been delegated to Mike Silber.

JC and PW agreed that this was a good idea.

## **6 Open Actions Review**

HPH asked GV to go through the open actions:

Action Item 20201208-1: OR and PW to send a note to the SSAC requesting a point of contact/liaison role for Geoff Houston for their project on routing security, allowing him to share relevant information directly between the NRO and the SSAC.

GV said the last update he had was that PW had drafted a message for OR to send to SSAC on 29 December but that he was not sure whether they had received any acknowledgement.

PW said that an acknowledgement was indeed received and that the request had been approved and Geoff accepted into the group.

All agreed to close the action item.

GV noted that the other two open actions were on the legal team, who would meet next Monday and hopefully report back to the EC soon.

## **7 Minutes Review**

- 2020-December-8: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference- DRAFT (Pending, AFRINIC, ARIN,, RIPE NCC)
- 2020-November-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference- DRAFT (Pending, AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN)

HPH reminded those who had not yet done so to review the minutes.

## **8 Next Meetings**

- a) Tuesday 16 February 2021
- b) Tuesday 17 March 2021
- c) Tuesday 20 April 2021

EK noted that 17 March was Wednesday, not Tuesday.

No further comments were heard.

## **9 AOB**

GV said he had sent an email before the meeting regarding the M3AAWG membership approved last September and requesting reconfirmation on covering the membership fee. He said the EC could reply then or via email. No objections were heard.

## **10 Adjourn**

HPH thanked all participants and adjourned the meeting at 13:00 UTC.