2020-Mar-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 17 March 2020, 11am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice Chair/Secretary
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Treasurer
Eddy Kayihura	AFRINIC	
Kaveh Ranjbar	RIPE NCC	

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Paul Andersen	ARIN Board
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO Secretariat (Minutes)

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
2. Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System (NRO-INRS-JPAA)
3. RIR COVID-19 Update
4. Topics with ICANN Board
5. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations
a) 2020 NRO Budget
6. Open Actions Review
7. Minutes Review
8. Next Meetings
9. Legal Memo regarding Decisional Participant Inspection Powers
10. AOB
11. Adjourn

Resolutions

The following resolutions were passed during this meeting:

R-20200317-1: The NRO EC resolves to accept the proposed 2020 budget with the condition of a mid-year review.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

New Action Item 20200317-1: OR to draft a response to ICANN regarding the two questions received from the ICANN Board and circulate to the mailing list.

New Action Item 20200317-2: GV and PW to suggest times/dates for a series of three teleconferences between 11-15 May to replace the NRO EC F2F.

New Action Item 20200317-3: Secretariat to draft an acknowledgement email for the NRO EC to send to the IANA RC regarding the 2019 IANA Numbering Services Review Committee Report.

0. Welcome

OR welcomed the attendees to the call. The proceedings commenced at 11:05 UTC.

1. Agenda Review

No items were added to or removed from the agenda.

2. Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System (NRO-INRS-JPAA)

JC noted that he had not yet completed this Action Item - 20200303-2: JC to write a cover letter outlining the rationale behind and the potential value of the NRO-INRS-JPAA.

PW commented that this item had been scheduled for discussion during the upcoming F2F meeting, which now might not happen. No further discussion had taken place at APNIC on this topic.

OR suggested that this topic should be put back on the agenda of the May teleconference so that there was enough time for everyone to review it.

JC noted that he would circulate the cover letter as soon as possible

3. RIR COVID-19 Update

The NRO EC discussed the Covid-19 situation, noting that most RIR staff were already working remotely and that systems were fully set up to enable this. All staff travel had been cancelled and most in-person meetings/events had been cancelled for the foreseeable future. Most physical RIR offices would likely close down within the coming days with staff obligated to work home. There was some discussion on how general assemblies would be conducted if they could only be held virtually and the legal implications of this. OR noted that LACNIC was also discussing how to deal with members that were unable to pay fees due to the impact of COVID-19.

4. Topics with ICANN Board

The NRO EC discussed the questions posed by the ICANN Board.

New Action Item 20200317-1: OR to draft a response to ICANN regarding the two questions received from the ICANN Board and circulate to the mailing list.

5. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

a) 2020 NRO Budget

GV gave an overview of the proposed 2020 NRO Budget, noting that it was in line with the past budgets. He noted that there was a 10% decrease in the expenses for the NRO EC and in staff expenses due to currency fluctuations between the US$ and AU$. The budget had been drafted in collaboration with the CFOs.

He continued that most expense items were the same as in previous years but some provisioning had been included to secure a consultant for the proposed NRO EC retreat, which would likely happen this year if conditions allowed for it to go ahead. Overall there was a small decrease in the budget compared to last year.

OR asked what the main differences were between the 2019 and 2020 Budgets.

GV noted that the inclusion of the NRO EC retreat, the currency fluctuations and support for the new PSCG contributed to the differences between the budgets. The travel ban that had since come into effect would also have an impact on travel costs.

PW noted that he was happy with the proposed 2020 Budget: expenses were slightly less than last year. He noted that there would be a lot of savings in the first half of 2020 as budgeted-for meetings and travel would not happen and these savings should be carried through to the second half of the year. He suggested that, if all agreed with the proposed 2020 Budget, it be approved on condition of a mid-year review.

The NRO EC agreed.

> **R-20200317-1: The NRO EC resolves to accept the proposed 2020 budget with the condition of a mid-year review.**
> *There were no objections. Resolution passed.*

6. Open Actions Review

Action Items: NRO EC Meetings

Action Item 20200303-1: All to review the NRO-INRS-JPAA and engage individual legal teams as necessary, flagging any issue with ambiguity, meaning or intent to the NRO EC prior to rescheduled/replacement F2F Meeting as soon as possible | <u>Document</u> *Discussion*: See agenda item 1 and Action Item 20200303-2.	OPEN

Action Item 20200303-2: JC to write a cover letter outlining the rationale behind and the potential value of the NRO-INRS-JPAA. *Discussion*: See agenda item 1	OPEN
Action Item 20200303-3: OR to incorporate input from the ECG and eventual input from the legal team into the SLA Changes for the IANA Numbering Services Regarding RDNS and recirculate by end of March | Document *Discussion*: OR noted that he had received input from the ECG, which had provided some additions to the document. He would circulate this input on the mailing list shortly, outlining the next steps.	IN PROGRESS
Action Item 20200303-4: All to complete the ICANN-Bylaws-ASO/NRO-References spreadsheet before the F2F Meeting | Document | Spreadsheet SEP	OPEN
Action Item 20200303-5: OR to send a note the ASO AC asking if it had any items for the agenda for the ICANN Board – ASO session during the virtual ICANN 67 Meeting and propose to cancel if there were none.	CLOSED
Action Item 20200303-6: All to review the 2020 NRO Budget and approve as soon as possible | Document *Discussion*: The 2020 Budget was approved. See agenda item 5 and Resolution **R-20200317-1.**	CLOSED
Action Item 20200303-7: Secretariat to contact RIPE Meeting team to arrange rooms for the legal team/NRO EC F2F meetings during RIPE 80.	CLOSED
Action Item 20200303-8: JC to draft a response to the ASO AC regarding its Request for an Update on ICANN Inspection Request and circulate to the NRO EC mailing list.	OPEN
Action 20200114-1: OR to create a list of proposed changes to the ASO – ICANN MoU for eventual circulation to ICANN	OPEN

Action 20200114-6: Secretariat to work with the CCG to finalize the 2020 work plan (including F2F meeting work items) and decide on an alternative location for the 2020 F2F meeting if the NRO EC does not approve the requested F2F meeting in Cancun within the coming days. *Discussion*: Gv noted that the CCG had not yet agreed on a location to hold the CCG meeting.	OPEN
Action Item 20191108-9: GV to ask ICANN whether it could assist with translations of the revised ASO MoU.	OPEN

7. Minutes Review

- 2020-Mar-3: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, ARIN, LACNIC)
- 2020-Jan-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, ARIN, RIPE NCC)
- 2019-Dec-10: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, ARIN, LACNIC)

OR asked the NRO EC to review and approve the minutes from the previous three meetings.

8. Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 21 April 2020 Teleconference

b) 15 - 16 May NRO EC f2f Meeting during RIPE 80 Meeting in Berlin, Germany

After discussion regarding the likelihood of the RIPE 80 Meeting going ahead and the ability of participants to travel to Europe within the next few months, the NRO EC decided to schedule three two-hour teleconferences during the week of 11-15 May. These teleconferences should be scheduled at different times to take into account everyone's time zones.

New Action Item 20200317-2: GV and PW to suggest times/dates for a series of three teleconferences between 11-15 May to replace the NRO EC F2F.

c) Tuesday 16 June 2020 Teleconference

d) Tuesday 21 July 2020 Teleconference

9. Legal Memo regarding Decisional Participant Inspection Powers

KR noted that he would leave the call before this item was discussed. He informed the NRO EC that he also did not take part in the discussions that the ICANN Board had had on this topic.

KR subsequently left the call 12:04 UTC.

The NRO EC discussed the Legal Memo regarding Decisional Participant Inspection Powers.

10. AOB

- **IANA Review Committee (RC) Report**

GV noted that the IANA RC had published its 2019 Report last week. Announcements had been sent to the communities and published on the website. The RC noted that no incidents were reported in the IANA Numbering services to the RIRs in 2019.

New Action Item 20200317-3: Secretariat to draft an acknowledgement email for the NRO EC to send to the IANA RC regarding the 2019 IANA Numbering Services Review Committee Report.

11. Adjourn

The meeting ended at 12:27 UTC.