

# 2020-Jun-23: Minutes NRO EC Meeting

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 23 June 2020, 11 am UTC.

---

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

|                         |          |                      |
|-------------------------|----------|----------------------|
| Oscar Robles (OR)       | LACNIC   | Chair                |
| John Curran (JC)        | ARIN     | Vice Chair/Secretary |
| Paul Wilson (PW)        | APNIC    | Treasurer            |
| Eddy Kayihura (EK)      | AFRINIC  |                      |
| Hans Petter Holen (HPH) | RIPE NCC |                      |

### Observers:

|                        |          |
|------------------------|----------|
| Sanjaya                | APNIC    |
| Pablo Hinojosa (PH)    | APNIC    |
| Paul Andersen (PA)     | ARIN     |
| Richard Jimmerson (RJ) | ARIN     |
| Ernesto Majó (EM)      | LACNIC   |
| Chris Buckridge (CB)   | RIPE NCC |

### Secretariat:

|                    |                 |
|--------------------|-----------------|
| German Valdez (GV) | NRO Secretariat |
|--------------------|-----------------|

## Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
- 2 . ASO Procedures Changes to ICANN Board Selection Process
3. APC Request to Support IGF MAG Chair
4. CG and Secretariat Report/Consultations
5. Open Action Review
6. Minutes Review
7. Next Meetings
  - a) Tuesday 14 July 2020 Teleconference
  - b) Tuesday 18 August 2020 Teleconference
  - c) Tuesday 15 September
7. AOB
8. Adjourn

## **Resolutions**

Resolution 20200623-1 The NRO EC approves changes to sections 9.4.3, 9.4.6, 9.4.6.1, 9.4.6.2, 9.4.6.3, 9.4.6.4, 9.4.9 and 9.4.10 of the ASO AC Procedures.

## **New Action Items**

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

New Action Item 20200623-1 GV to confirm the support provided in the past by the NRO to the MAG Chair.

## **Minutes**

### **0. Welcome**

OR welcomed all participants and started the meeting at 11:00 AM UTC

## **1. Agenda Review**

OR asked for any new items for the agenda.

No new items were suggested.

## **2. ASO Procedures Changes to ICANN Board Selection Process.**

OR asked if the documents were the same approved by the NRO EC in the mailing list.

GV confirmed it was the same documents.

GV stated that all RIR CEO approved the ASO AC proposed changes to the CANN Board selection procedures.

**Resolution 20200623-1** The NRO EC approves changes to sections 9.4.3, 9.4.6, 9.4.6.1, 9.4.6.2, 9.4.6.3, 9.4.6.4, 9.4.9 and 9.4.10 of the ASO AC Procedures.

## **3. APC Request to Support IGF MAG Chair**

CB asked if the request was only for the year 2020.

OR said that the request was only for 2020 but open for additional years.

OR asked what the level of support for Lynn St Amour was in the past.

PW confirmed that the NRO EC supported Lynn St Amour as MAG Chair in similar circumstances.

OR asked GV if the NRO budget is currently under executed.

GV confirmed the NRO budget is under executed as there are no travels and meetings. GV said he could send a review of the budget to the NRO EC list.

OR asked if there were any objections to support the MAG Chair for 2020.

HPH, JC, EK and PW had no objections

OR asked for the amount of the support

PW suggested to have a similar level to support offered to Lynn St Amour.

OR asked GV to confirm the figure.

**New Action Item 20200623-1** GV to confirm the support provided in the past by the NRO to the MAG Chair.

#### 4. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

No topics were discussed on this section.

#### 5. Open Actions Review

The NRO EC reviewed the open Action Items:

| Action Item   | Status |
|---|--------|
| <p><b>Action Item 200521-01. GV to document the technical support for the NRO.</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>GV sent the document to the NRO EC List on 22 June 2020</p>   | CLOSED |
| <p><b>Action Item 200521-02 PW to draft a review of the NRO MoU considering the set of common NRO projects under discussion and the current relationship with ICANN</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>PW said that the document was underway</p>   | OPEN   |
| <p><b>Action Item 200520-01. GV to share with the legal team the communications with ICANN (Alan Barrett emails) regarding recommendation #6 of the ASO Review</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>GV said that mails were sent to the legal at the conclusion of the NRO EC teleconference on May 20th.</p>                       | CLOSED |
| <p><b>Action Item 200520-02. OR to restart communication with ICANN regarding NRO position on recommendation #6 of the ASO Review.</b></p>  | OPEN   |
| <p><b>Action Item 200520-03. GV to coordinate the participation of legal staff in the next RSCG teleconference to advance in the legal review of Inter RIR Fraud Handling Communication Framework document.</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>GV confirmed that the Legal Team and the RSCG had a meeting on June 11th 2020.</p> | CLOSED |
| <p><b>Action Item 200520-04. OR to follow up with legal team the review of the implementation of recommendations 1 - 17 (except 6 ).</b></p>  | OPEN   |

|   |        |
|---|--------|
| <b>Action Item 200520-05. OR to follow up with Legal Team in the development of a position paper on the Legal Status of IP Addresses.</b>   | OPEN   |
| <b>Action Item 20200518-1: GV to circulate the last version of the Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System document (NRO-INRS-JPAA) including LACNIC last changes.</b><br><br><i>Discussion:</i><br><br>GV confirmed that Last version (version 4) was sent to the NRO EC list on 28 May 2020. | CLOSED |

Action Item 20200518-2: All CEOs to report back the outcome of their organization's review of the Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System document (NRO-INRS-JPAA).

***Discussion:***

EK confirmed that AFRINIC board approved the document.

JC said that the ARIN Board reviewed the last revision of the document and they are ready to proceed.

OR said that his recollection is that LACNIC approved the document. OR asked GV to review the record of the document discussion to confirm it.

HPH said it was discussed last week in the RIPE board meeting and he was authorised to negotiate it.

HPH asked about adding a sentence considering the laws and regulations within the country of the RIR.

JC said that ARIN is ultimately govern my US law but they sovereign friendly when possible with other countries.

OR said it was difficult to write it down in the document because the RIR are not supposed to address all the jurisdiction available in the region.

HPH asked if the NRO EC is ready to sign it as a separate document instead of incorporating it to the NRO MoU.

OR said that he sees it as a fundamental document that can trigger a different set of documents.

JC said that presently is written as an addendum to the NRO MoU. JC stressed in the importance to have these values documented.

OR asked JC if ARIN would be ready to sign the document before having a broader discussion.

JC confirmed that ARIN was ready to proceed with whatever format the group decides.

HPH said that he was ok to follow JC suggestion.

OR suggested to have confirmation of all RIR supporting the document and then agree if they sign in as it is or have a broader discussion.

IN  
PROGRESS

|   |        |
|---|--------|
| <b>Action Item 20200518-3: All CEO to complete the review of ASO/NRO in ICANN's Bylaws Excel Document</b>   | OPEN   |
| <p><b>Action Item 202004201-3: GV to prepare a proposal for filling the vacant Secretariat Support role and circulate on the NRO EC mailing list.</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>GV reported about the proposal to fill the vacant secretariat support role sent to the NRO EC off-list.</p> <p>OR suggested to have the review internally.</p> | CLOSED |
| <p><b>Action Item 202004201-4: GV to send a note to the ICANN OEC noting when the NRO would be starting the next ASO Review Cycle.</b></p> <p><i>Discussion:</i></p> <p>GV said that he'd like to have written confirmation with the NRO EC that we are in the same page with the timeline of the next review before contacting ICANN OEC</p>         | OPEN   |
| Action 20200114-1: OR to create a list of proposed changes to the ASO – ICANN MoU for eventual circulation to ICANN.  | OPEN   |

## 6. Minutes Review

- 2020-May-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2020-May-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2020-May-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2020-Apr-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2020-Mar-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: RIPE NCC)

OR asked GV to send regular reminders about pending minutes and open actions.

## 7. Next Meetings

- Tuesday 14 July
- Tuesday 18 August
- Tuesday 15 September

The NRO EC agreed with the above dates.

#### **8. AOB**

There was no AOB.

#### **9. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:43 AM UTC.