2020-July-21: Minutes NRO EC Meeting Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 21 July 2020, 11 am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice Chair/Secretary
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Treasurer
Eddy Kayihura (EK)	AFRINIC	
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	

Observers:

Sanjaya	APNIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

| German Valdez (GV) | NRO Secretariat |

Agenda

0. Welcome

1. Agenda Review

2. Framework for NRO MoU 2020

3.- Review 2020 NRO Budget

4.- APC Request to Support IGF MAG Chair

5.- NRO Contribution to IGF Trust Fund for 2020

6. Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System - Next Step (NRO-INRS-JPAA)

7. Status NRO-IRT and NRO-SECURITY Groups

8. Open Actions Review

9. Minutes Review

10. Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 18 August

b) Tuesday 15 September

c) Tuesday 20 October

11. AOB

a) Schedule RIR Meeting Coordination (JC)

b) NRO Stats Announcement (PW)

12. Adjourn

Resolutions

New Resolution R-20200721-1 The NRO EC resolves to contribute $ 75,000 USD to the UN IGF Trust Fund in 2020.

New Action Items

The following action items were assigned during this meeting:

New Open Action Item 20200721-1. PW to prepare a second draft of the Framework for the NRO MoU 2020 Document based on the discussion of the 21 July 2020 Teleconference.
New Open Action Item 20200721-2. PW to contact APC requesting information on the current set of contributions for the request of financial support for the IGF MAG Chair. Based on the information the NRO EC should establish the contribution for the IGF MAG Chair.
New Open Action Item 20200721-3. GV to organise the contribution ($75,000 USD) to UN IGF Trust Fund.
New Open Action Item 20200721-4. GV to organise the signing of the Cooperation on The Internet Number Registry System document and publish it in the NRO Website.
New Open Action Item 20200721-5. Each RIR CEO to confirm the members of the NRO Security Groups.
New Open Action Item 20200721-6. GV to update the NRO Security mailing list, NRO wiki space and informed the participants of the NRO security group about the creation of the list and wiki space.
New Open Action Item 20200721-7 GV to send a poll to define NRO EC teleconference for September 2020.
New Open Action Item 20200721-8 OR to ask the CCG to explore mechanism of RIR meeting scheduling coordination in order to avoid clashes.
New Open Action Item 20200721-9 OR to communicate to the CGs that for any joint global announcement they should be review it by the NRO CCG and/or the NRO EC.

Minutes

0. Welcome

OR Welcomed the participants and started the meeting at 11:02 AM UTC

1. Agenda Review

OR asked for any changes or new topics to be added to the agenda.

JC asked to add in AOB a discussion about RIR meeting scheduling coordination

OR accepted the new topics.

2. Framework for NRO MoU 2020

PW presented the NRO MoU 2020 Framework document.

PW said that the next steps would be a sanity check of the main headings and the content to extract to the relevant articles of the NRO MoU.

PW highlighted that other vehicles or mechanisms are not included in the MoU like the ICANN Empowered Community agreements and the commitment to the IGF, he mentioned that could be a section related to the general Internet governance.

JC liked the proposed document. He commented that the NRO EC would need some brainstorming on how we organise it, but the document is an excellent reference. JC added that it'd be a good idea to pick up some of the discussion of 2013 and try to instantiate them.

JC expressed some caution that some of the items, for example some of the governance commitments, may need community consultation before entering to the MoU.

JC said that he was in favour of the document and the NRO EC might need to have an actual strategy workshop to try to figure out how to organise this working from vision and mission down to specific projects and then specific agreements that we've done for those projects.

JC suggested to work in a timeline as may not be a short development project.

HPH liked the document and agreed that the NRO needs a strategy discussion. HPH said that maybe as presented the personal data section might be too prominent while there is no a clear definition of what are the number resources we are dealing with. HPH added that should be some discussion about whether IP addresses are considered an economic resource or not.

OR liked the document, he said allows them to allocate the right priority to the different documents previously discussed but also define the general principles that will be part of the structure. OR asked about the next steps.

PW suggested to continue to flesh out some more without trying to answer all of the aspects and work in the references, ordering, priority and structure. PW volunteered to take it to the next stage between now and the next meeting.

PW said that the NRO should continue the discussion about going to a strategic planning process, PW considered that the document could be an input to such process that would settle on what is going to be our new relationship.

JC said that the new MoU would need to be discussed, at least within our organisations and our governing boards and maybe with the members, JC considered it a worthwhile project.

EK expressed full support to the document.

New Open Action Item 20200721-1 PW to prepare a second draft of the Framework for the NRO MoU 2020 Document based on the discussion of the 21 July 2020 Teleconference.

3.- Review 2020 NRO Budget

GV reminded that the EC requested a reviewed version of the budget by mid-year due to the covid-19 global situation

GV presented the reviewed 2020 NRO budget. He highlighted that most of the adjustments respond to the cancellation of meetings like the NRO EC, NRO coordination groups and ICANN meetings, as example he said no expenses will be executed in supporting ASO AC Chair travel, ASO dinners and IGF Tech reception. GV reported that the original budget would be under-executed by around 200,000 USD.

PW asked if there is any other new item that has been requested or consider other than the request to support the IGF MAG Chair.

GV confirmed that the only new item is the request to support the IGF MAG Chair.

OR asked the NRO EC what would be the action, or if the adjusted budget should be considered only for information

PW considered that would be an input to help to make other decisions.

OR agreed.

4.- APC Request to Support IGF MAG Chair

GV reminded that the NRO EC agreed in principle in the last teleconference to support the IGF MAG chair request. GV said that the EC agreed to support the new IGF Chair at the same level that Lynn St Amour some years ago. GV confirmed that the details of the financial support were sent to the NRO EC list.

OR asked PW about his last meeting comments on the importance to support the IGF Chair.

PW said that it was related to the fact that the future of the IGF is in the air. PW said that the chair of the IGF has great influence where the IGF goes in the future.

PW said that the request went out for a number of organizations. PW suggested to reply that in principle the NRO would like to provide some support but knowing what other contributions have been obtained and how much is needed. PW said that it could be lower the amount of support needed based on the current contribution from other places.

EK and HPH supported the approach.

New Open Action Item 20200721-2 PW to contact APC requesting information on the current set of contributions for the request of financial support for the IGF MAG Chair. Based on the information the NRO EC should establish the contribution for the IGF MAG Chair.

5.- NRO Contribution to IGF Trust Fund for 2020

GV reported that Chengetai Masango, UN IGF Programme Manager, contacted the NRO secretariat enquiring about the 2020 NRO contribution to the IGF Trust Fund.

GV reminded that this year the NRO budgeted 75,000 USD for this purpose . GV said that he is looking ratification from the NRO EC for this contribution before liaising with UN and RIR staff to wire the resources.

OR asked NRO EC if they were in favour to proceed with the annual contribution to the IGF Trust Fund

All approved.

New Resolution R-20200721-1 The NRO EC resolves to contribute $ 75,000 USD to the UN IGF Trust Fund in 2020.

New Open Action Item 20200721-3 GV to organise the contribution ($75,000 USD) to UN IGF Trust Fund.

6. Cooperation on the Internet Number Registry System - Next Step (NRO-INRS-JPAA)

JC said there are two possible paths, one is to table the process until is incorporated in the 2021 NRO MoU, the second viable option is to proceed to sign the document and announce it, JC commented that the document doesn't get in the way of anything else and just recognise a lot of the terms and concepts that are going to be incorporated in the future MoU but for the moment can be added as an addendum.

OR agrees with second option. OR said that would like to sign it and publish it in the NRO website.

PW, HPH, EK agreed.

EK asked to be sure we are dealing with the last version of the document.

OR said that last version used the word "consistent" instead of "uniform"

JC asked GV to send a pdf version to the NRO EC mailing list with a signing order.

New Open Action Item 20200721-4 GV to organise the signing of the Cooperation on The Internet Number Registry System document and publish it in the NRO Website.

7. Status NRO-IRT and NRO-SECURITY Groups

PW said that it was brought to his attention by APNIC staff about the status of the NRO IRT and NRO Security groups. PW reminded that those groups were discussed and approved in the f2f meeting in Reykjavik last year in May, but it seems there is no traffic on it. PW added that for

the case of the NRO IRT it was agreed not to create a mailing list as it was not the right communication channel for such forum.

PW said that it may be some interest to escalate some of the discussion to the NRO security group about IRT and security processes.

HPH said that he has a special interest in the topic as one of the focus areas for next year is going to be information security and compliance of the registry. HPH asked about the members of the security group. HPH agreed that it would be interesting to share to some extent the incident response procedures for each RIR, not necessarily align them but at least to be inspired by them.

PW said that the question about the status of the groups was raised because there is an increase interest from the community in the coordination of the RIRs incident response teams. PW said that such coordination seems the right thing to do if we are going to collectively receive, respond and deal with each other and render assistance in the case of some serious attack. PW added that group was designed without much formality, there is no chair or anyone particular responsible for the group to what was deliberately intended. As a small group, it was organised as a trusted circle that could comeback with recommendations if it was need it.

HPH highlighted that currently there are only members from AFRINIC and APNIC in the NRO security mailing list.

JC suggested that each RIR review the charter of the group and send the members to GV

PW said that the charter is in the NRO wiki and it was agreed in the meeting in Reykjavik.

After reviewing the charter on display, HPH said it is consistent with the idea and justification of having a NRO security group.

New Open Action Item 20200721-5. Each RIR CEO to confirm the members of the NRO Security Groups.

New Open Action Item 20200721-6. GV to update the NRO Security mailing list, NRO wiki space and informed the participants of the NRO security group about the creation of the list and wiki space.

8. Open Actions Review

OR suggested to review those open actions that have some progress only.

Action Item 20200518-3: All CEO to complete the review of ASO/NRO in ICANN's Bylaws Excel Document ***Discussion:*** GV reported that ARIN, APNIC and LACNIC have completed the review of the document	IN PROGRESS

Action Item 202004201-3: GV to prepare a proposal for filling the vacant Secretariat Support role and circulate on the NRO EC mailing list. ***Discussion:*** GV reported that LACNIC and he are advancing in the negotiations of the new secretariat support role. GV mentioned there is a draft contract that will be shared with the candidate looking for reaching an agreement that the NRO EC can validate and ratify later on.	IN PROGRESS

Action Item 202004201-4: GV to send a note to the ICANN OEC noting when the NRO would be starting the next ASO Review Cycle. ***Discussion:*** GV mentioned that he shared a proposed timeline in the NRO EC list in order to have a full agreement of the next ASO Cycle with the NRO EC. GV said that according to ICANN Bylaws 4.4.a t the NRO can't run a new cycle before 5 years counting since the delivering of the last final report to the ICANN Board which was done in August 2017. Based on the suggested timeline and the ICANN Bylaws the NRO EC agreed to start the review of the nomination call by 2021 mid-year aiming to have a final report delivered to the ICANN Board by mid 2022.	OPEN

9. Minutes Review

GV reported that he received several confirmations with the approval of pending minutes in the last hours, so only April and June teleconferences are pending for final approval.

OR said that he would review April minutes right after the conclusion of the teleconference.

GV said that he would publish the approved minutes in the NRO website the next day.

10. Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 18 August

All agreed.

b) Tuesday 15 September

EK said he might not be available for this meeting.

New Open Action Item 202007210-7 GV to send a poll to define NRO EC teleconference for September 2020.

c) Tuesday 20 October

 All agreed.

11. AOB

a) Schedule RIR Meeting Coordination (JC)

JC proposed that the CCG could include in their work plan the RIR meeting date coordination or it could be done by other groups but must be coordination in setting up the RIR meeting dates.

OR said that the community would expect such coordination.

HPH mentioned that the RIPE meetings are decided formally by the RIPE chairs

GV mentioned that there is an informal group made of RIR meeting organisers staff where they share as soon as they have confirmation the meeting dates, but this is done informally without internal consultation.

HPH said that RIPE NCC uses a global calendar of Internet events to make sure that we don't overlap but agrees that some formal mechanism could be a good idea.

OR proposed to ask the NRO CCG to explore the chance to coordinate on these dates and see what can report back to us.

New Open Action Item 20200721-8 OR to ask the CCG to explore mechanism of RIR meeting scheduling coordination in order to avoid clashes.

b) NRO Stats Announcement (PW)

PW considered that the announcement could have told a better story. PW added it was not a big deal but could be different circumstances, he would expect that similar announcement should be reviewed by the CCG and the EC.

JC agreed. JC proposed that for any joint global announcement from any coordination groups they should approach the NRO EC or CCG to help draft the joint announcement.

OR agreed

New Open Action Item 20200721-9 OR to communicate to the CGs that for any joint global announcement they should be review it by the NRO CCG and/or the NRO EC.

12. Adjourn

OR thanked all participants and concluded the meeting at 13:11 UTC