2020-Apr-21: Minutes NRO EC Meeting

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 21 April 2020, 11am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice Chair/Secretary
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Treasurer
Eddy Kayihura	AFRINIC	
Kaveh Ranjbar	RIPE NCC	

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC
Hans Petter Holen (HH)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO Secretariat (Minutes)

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
2. COVID-19 RIR Update
3. SLA Update to Include Reverse DNS | Document
4. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations
5. Open Actions Review
6. Minutes Review
7. Next Meetings
8. AOB
9. Adjourn

Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

New Action Item 202004201-1: OR to send the finalized SLA Update to IANA/PTI for feedback before formally submitting the document to ICANN.
New Action Item 202004201-2: GV to prepare a list of current technical support and maintenance tasks currently carried out by the RIPE NCC for discussion during the May teleconference.
New Action Item 202004201-3: GV to prepare a proposal for filling the vacant Secretariat Support role and circulate on the NRO EC mailing list.
New Action Item 202004201-4: GV to send a note to the ICANN OEC noting when the NRO would be starting the next ASO Review Cycle.
New Action Item 202004201-5: GV to draft proposed agendas for the upcoming NRO EC virtual meetings in May.

0. Welcome

OR welcomed the attendees to the call. The proceedings commenced at 11:03 UTC.

KR noted that the incoming CEO of the RIPE NCC, Hans Petter Holen (HH), would also be participating in the call.

1. Agenda Review

KR added that any discussion on the .org sale should be moved to the end of the call and that he would disconnect at that point.

2. COVID-19 RIR Update

The NRO EC gave an update on the current situation in each region:

AFRINIC: EK noted that the AFRINIC 32 Meeting/AIS 2020 was postponed until September and would likely now be a virtual event.

APNIC: PW noted that the APNIC 50 Meeting scheduled for September in Bangladesh would most likely not go ahead as an in-person event: details were still being worked on. The office was still open but staff were mostly working from home.

ARIN: JC noted that operations were now fully remote and business was running as usual. The ARIN 46 Meeting scheduled for October was currently still going ahead at this point. The virtual ARIN 45 Meeting scheduled for April had been postponed at the Board's request and would now take place virtually in June and would consist of a reduced agenda and shorter sessions. There were ongoing discussions on how to reopen the office safely when lockdown would be lifted in June.

LACNIC: OR noted that staff were working from home and LACNIC would be the first of the RIRs to hold a virtual meeting at the beginning of May. The meeting agenda had been reduced and sessions shortened. After seeking legal advice, the LACNIC General Meeting had been postponed; while there was a legal requirement to hold this meeting before 31 June, LACNIC was obligated to suspend it if holding it would pose a health risk.

RIPE NCC: KR noted that staff had been working remotely for several weeks and there had been no reduction in services. The General Meeting would take place online with ample time for online voting, which was the usual situation. Planning had already started on how the office could be reopened when lockdown would be lifted.

HH added that the RIPE Meeting had been planned around the General Meeting. Sessions had been reduced to 45 minutes from 90 and would start later in the day. A virtual RIPE Dinner was

also being planned. Each Working Group had been given the choice on whether to participate in the new meeting format or not. One group, the DNS WG, had decided to hold monthly virtual meetings instead to complete its work.

3. SLA Update to Include Reverse DNS

OR explained that this document had been under discussion for some time and that the final version had been sent to the mailing list on 31 March. The technical part of the document had already been reviewed by the ECG and the next steps were to get feedback from IANA/PTI and then ask the legal team to review it. He noted that he had already spoken with Kim Davies (KD) about this work.

KR noted that the RIPE NCC had no issue with the last version of the document: it was currently under review by the legal team and he would send approval to the list shortly.

JC commented that ARIN accepted the proposed changes and was ready to move ahead with the document.

PW noted that APNIC was ready to move ahead.

EK added that AFRINIC was also ready to move ahead.

OR concluded that he would draft a cover letter and send to KD for comments and feedback before formally submitting it to ICANN (Göran Marby and John Jeffrey).

New Action Item 202004201-1: OR to send the finalized SLA Update to IANA/PTI for feedback before formally submitting the document to ICANN.

4. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

a) Secretariat

- **New ASO Website - Timeline and Hosting**

SG gave an update on the new ASO website, noting that the Secretariat was gathering the final pieces of feedback from the ASO AC and the NRO EC. She continued that the content had been edited and reordered so that it was grouped together more logically and helped to reinforce the different roles of the ASO and the ASO AC. The Secretariat was also ensuring that the website conformed to GDPR requirements with the RIPE NCC legal team. Once it was clear where the website would be hosted, she would be able to provide a date for go-live.

GV noted that the CCG had also reviewed the new website and had provided feedback. He continued that the current ASO website was hosted on the RIPE NCC's servers and, after some

discussion with KR, the new site would also be hosted there. The Secretariat would liaise with the RIPE NCC staff to come up with a timeline for implementation. He suggested that the NRO EC could review how technical support was provided to the Secretariat in the future to find the most practical solutions going forward.

PW agreed and noted that the NRO EC should periodically discuss the technical support provision for the websites. This task did not rotate each year like the other Secretariat tasks and the RIPE NCC had provided this support for many years. It should not be taken for granted that the RIPE NCC would continue to provide support indefinitely.

JC agreed: it was not a function that should rotate yearly but it should be periodically reviewed to make sure that support was still satisfactory and to give the current provider of the function an opportunity to ask another RIR to take it over.

KR also agreed and noted that it was good governance to periodically review services and support. He added that the RIPE NCC was happy to provide technical support for the websites and was fully committed to continuing to provide it for the foreseeable future.

OR agreed and asked GV to prepare a list of all websites and the technical support and maintenance tasks currently carried out by the RIPE NCC for discussion during the next NRO EC meeting.

GV noted that the Secretariat was very appreciative of the support it received from the RIPE NCC.

New Action Item 202004201-2: GV to prepare a list of current technical support and maintenance tasks currently carried out by the RIPE NCC for discussion during the May teleconference.

- **New ASO Wiki**

GV noted that the ASO AC had requested a collaboration tool to facilitate its work. A new Confluence site, hosted by a third party (Atlassian), had been set up by the RIPE NCC team. The Secretariat was configuring the site and would have it ready for the ASO AC's use by the deadline of 20 May.

- **NRO Secretariat Support**

GV noted that SG would be leaving her role with the NRO at the end of May. He thanked her for her support over the years.

The NRO EC congratulated SG on her new role and thanked her for her work with the NRO.

GV noted that 15 hours a week for the support function had been sufficient. He would think further about how to find a replacement and get back to the NRO EC with more details. He

added that it had been helpful to have the Secretariat split over different time zones so that more business hours could be covered.

New Action Item 202004201-3: GV to prepare a proposal for filling the vacant Secretariat Support role and circulate on the NRO EC mailing list.

5. Open Actions Review

The NRO EC reviewed the open Action Items:

New Action Item 20200317-2: GV and PW to suggest times/dates for a series of three teleconferences between 11-15 May to replace the NRO EC F2F. *Discussion*: GV noted that he had sent a mail to the NRO EC with a proposal. This item would be discussed further under Agenda item 7.	CLOSED
Action Item 20200303-1: All to review the NRO-INRS-JPAA and engage individual legal teams as necessary, flagging any issue with ambiguity, meaning or intent to the NRO EC as soon as possible *Discussion:* JC explained that he had been tasked to prepare a cover letter rationalizing this document for the NRO EC to send to their legal and executive teams. He had sent this to the list. He added that ARIN had reviewed the NRO-INRS-JPAA document and was ready to approve. OR noted that LACNIC had already approved the NRO-INRS-JPAA document. If others find any inconsistencies in the document, he would need to take it back to the LACNIC Board again. He hoped that the other RIRs could approve this by the May NRO EC Teleconference.	OPEN
Action Item 20200303-2: JC to write a cover letter outlining the rationale behind and the potential value of the NRO-INRS-JPAA. *Discussion*: See *Action Item 20200303-1* above.	CLOSED
Action Item 20200303-3: OR to incorporate input from the ECG and eventual input from the legal team into the SLA Changes for the IANA Numbering Services Regarding RDNS and recirculate by end of March	CLOSED

Action Item 20200303-4: All to complete the ICANN-Bylaws-ASO/NRO-References spreadsheet before ~~the F2F Meeting~~ the virtual NRO EC Meetings in May |	OPEN
Action Item 20200303-8: JC to draft a response to the ASO AC regarding its Request for an Update on ICANN Inspection Request and circulate to the NRO EC mailing list. *Discussion*: JC sent a draft response to the mailing list for comment.	CLOSED
Action 20200114-1: OR to create a list of proposed changes to the ASO – ICANN MoU for eventual circulation to ICANN. *Discussion*: This item would be be discussed during the virtual NRO EC meetings in May.	OPEN
New Action Item 20191108-9: GV to ask ICANN whether it could assist with translations of the revised ASO MoU. *Discussion*: GV noted that he had reached out to Carlos Reyes (CR) regarding this and would follow up again.	OPEN
Action Item 20191108-3: GV to inform NRO EC when the upcoming ASO Review process needs to be initiated. *Discussion*: GV noted that he had approached CR regarding this, who had suggested that the NRO reach out directly to the ICANN Organizational Effectiveness Committee (**OEC**) to confirm when the next ASO Review cycle should be started. He continued that the Review needed to take place every five years but the dates should be coordinated with ICANN. **New Action Item 202004201-4: GV to send a note to the ICANN OEC noting when the NRO would be starting the next ASO Review Cycle.**	IN PROGRESS

Action Item 20191015-7: Secretariat to coordinate with the ECG on what information on TALs could be added to the RPKI page on the NRO website. *Discussion*: GV noted that the ECG had provided its recommendation on which TALs should be included on the NRO website. JC asked that GV ensure that the link to ARIN's information points to the ARIN TAL page. OR asked GV to add the information to the NRO website. There were no objections.	CLOSED

6. Minutes Review

- 2020-Mar-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN, RIPE NCC)

7. Next Meetings

a) NRO EC Virtual Meeting

OR explained that the NRO EC F2F Meeting had been cancelled. As there were several documents the NRO EC needed to discuss, it had been proposed that some short virtual sessions could be held in place of the F2F.

GV noted that he had sent an overview of the proposed times and dates.

After discussion the NRO EC agreed to hold three two-hour virtual sessions at 10:00 UTC during the week of 11 May.

HH noted that he would not be able to attend on the proposed dates as it was during the RIPE Meeting week and he was still acting as RIPE Chair.

The NRO EC agreed to move the virtual meetings to the following week (week beginning 18 May).

GV noted that this would cause a clash with the ASO AC teleconference scheduled on 20 May at 12:00 UTC. The NRO EC agreed that the session on 20 May would last only 90 minutes so that GV could leave on time to start the ASO AC teleconference.

OR asked GV to draft agendas for each of the virtual meetings.

New Action Item 202004201-5: GV to draft proposed agendas for the upcoming NRO EC virtual meetings in May.

b) Tuesday 16 June 2020 Teleconference

c) Tuesday 21 July 2020 Teleconference

8. AOB

OR formally welcomed HH to the NRO EC and wished SG success in her new role.

9. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 12:09 UTC.