

# 2019-Oct-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

**Date: Tuesday, 15 October 2019 | 11am UTC.**

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Chair
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice Chair/Secretary
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Patrisse Deesse	AFRINIC	
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	

### Observers:

Madhvi Gokool (MG)	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Paul Andersen (PA)	ARIN Board
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC

### Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO Secretariat (Minutes)

---

## Agenda

0. Welcome
  1. Agenda Review
  2. ICANN 66 Preparations
  3. NRO EC F2F Meeting in Montreal
  4. AFRINIC CEO update
  5. NRO Message to AFRINIC Regarding the Joint RIR Stability Fund
  6. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations
  7. Open Actions Review
  8. Minutes Review
  9. Next Meetings
  10. AOB
  11. Adjourn
- 

## Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

## New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

New Action Item 20191015-1: AP to send a note to ICANN documenting the proposed changes to the ASI MoU and asking whether it would be ready to sign a new MoU during the ICANN 66 Meeting in Montreal.
New Action Item 20191015-2: All to review the proposed amendment to the Fundamental Bylaws regarding the IANA Naming Functions Review Composition to develop an NRO position.
New Action Item 20191015-3: AP to follow up with Carlos Reyes regarding the NRO's participation in the <i>Approval Action Community Forum at ICANN 66 (dependent on outcome of New Action Item 20191015-2)</i> .
New Action Item 20191015-4: GV to send a note to Brad White declining the speaking slot offered to the NRO to during the ICANN 66 Opening Ceremony.
New Action Item 20191015-5: JC to inform ICANN that the NRO would not be able to offer sponsorship to ICANN for the ICANN 66 Gala.
New Action Item 20191015-6: AP to send the message regarding the Joint RIR Stability Fund to the AFRINIC Board, cc-ing each of the RIR Boards' Chairs.
New Action Item 20191015-6: All to review the RSCG 2020 Work Plan.
New Action Item 20191015-7: Secretariat to coordinate with the ECG on what information on TALs could be added to the RPKI page on the NRO website.
New Action Item 20191015-8: All to review the draft instructions for for the Legal Team's analysis of the ICANN Bylaws asap and provide edit or approve so that the Legal Team can work on this task before the F2F Meeting in Montreal.

---

## 0. Welcome

AP welcomed the attendees to the call.

## 1. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

## 2. ICANN 66 Preparations

### a) Expectations for the ASO Review discussion during ICANN 66.

The NRO EC discussed the Expectations for ASO the Review discussion in ICANN 66.

**New Action Item 20191015-1: AP to send a note to ICANN documenting the proposed changes to the ASI MoU and asking whether it would be ready to sign a new MoU during the ICANN 66 Meeting in Montreal.**

### b) Other Topics for the meeting with the ICANN Board in addition to the proposed new ASO MoU

AP mentioned that the NRO should congratulate the new Chair of the Board.

GV noted that he would confirm the proposed topics for the Meeting with the ICANN Board with Carlos Reyes.

### c) Approval Action Community Forum

JC noted that he was not aware of any contentious issues in the proposed amendment to the Fundamental Bylaws regarding the IANA Naming Functions Review Composition. He was not sure that a representative from the NRO needed to attend the session but noted that the NRO should decide upon its position and be prepared to explain whether it supported or opposed the amendment.

GV noted that the NRO Secretary, AP, should attend, as he was the designated *Empowered Community Administration Representative*.

**New Action Item 20191015-2: All to review the proposed amendment to the Fundamental Bylaws regarding the IANA Naming Functions Review Composition to develop an NRO position.**

**New Action Item 20191015-3: AP to follow up with Carlos Reyes regarding the NRO's participation in the Approval Action Community Forum at ICANN 66 (dependent on outcome of New Action Item 20191015-2).**

### d) Opening Ceremony slot

JC noted that, at previous ICANN meetings, the NRO had given brief updates in the opening ceremony when there were relevant updates to share. He didn't think there was any new information to share at the upcoming meeting this time.

After discussion, the NRO EC agreed that it would not need to use the speaking slot at ICANN 66.

JC added that a note should be sent to ICANN thanking them but declining the invitation to speak.

**New Action Item 20191015-4: GV to send a note to Brad White declining the speaking slot offered to the NRO to during the ICANN 66 Opening Ceremony.**

## **e) Gala Sponsorship**

The NRO EC discussed the request to sponsor the ICANN 66 Gala.

The NRO EC decided that it would not be able to offer sponsorship to ICANN for the ICANN 66 gala. JC noted that he'd inform ICANN of this decision.

**New Action Item 20191015-5: JC to inform ICANN that the NRO would not be able to offer sponsorship to ICANN for the ICANN 66 Gala.**

## **3. NRO EC F2F Meeting in Montreal**

### **a) Agenda Topics**

Proposed topics:

- Strategic Planning 2020 (OR)
- Timing and process for next ASO review (PW)
- ASO Review Next Steps (considering outcome from the ICANN 66 meeting re the ASO MoU)
- PSCG Charter

OR noted that it was not his intention to plan the Strategic Planning Meeting 2020 itself during the F2F but to discuss the general planning of the event. He continued that the Strategic Planning Meeting should take place once the new AFRINIC CEO is in place and, by the time the F2F Meeting in Montreal occurred, there would be more information on the CEO selection process.

JC noted that, in addition to the ASO Review Next Steps, the NRO EC would need to go through the list of Recommendations and spend time discussing the Future Structure of the ASO.

After discussion, the NRO EC decided to hold the upcoming F2F meeting on Friday, 8 November (afternoon), continuing into the evening if necessary.

### **b) List of Participants (onsite and online)**

- **ARIN:** John Curran, Michael Abejuela, Paul Andersen.
- **APNIC:** Paul Wilson, Gaurab Upadhaya, Craig Ng.
- **RIPE NCC:** Axel Pawlik, Chris Buckridge, Athina Fragkouli (tentative), Kaveh Ranjbar (tentative).
- **AFRINIC:** to confirm during the coming week.
- **LACNIC:** to confirm during the coming week.
- **Secretariat:** German Valdez, Susannah Gray.

## **4. AFRINIC CEO Update**

PD gave an overview of the recruitment of AFRINIC's new CEO.

## 5. NRO Message to AFRINIC Regarding the Joint RIR Stability Fund

The NRO EC discussed the NRO message to AFRINIC regarding the Joint RIR Stability Fund.

**New Action Item 20191015-6: AP to send the message regarding the Joint RIR Stability Fund to the AFRINIC Board, cc-ing each of the RIR Boards' Chairs.**

## 6. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

MG gave an overview of the recent RSCG Meeting held in Panama in October:

There was a full day of discussion on Inter-RIR transfer coordination on day one, which focused on:

- Getting LACNIC ready for implementation: testing to be implemented in 2020.
- Exchanging best practices.
- Creating templates.
- Documenting transfer procedures (action item to be completed by the end of the year).
- Latest developments in each RIR region.

Day two focused on:

- ITHI: measurements have now been consolidated and shared on the NRO wiki. All RIRs had some measurements but most are still planning to do the current and correctness statistics in 2020.
- Fraud Handling Communication Framework: work on this was limited, as feedback had not yet been received from the Legal Team.
- Updating the 2019 Work Plan.
- Drafting the 2020 Work Plan. Key tasks include:
  - Fraud Handling Communications Framework
  - Inter RIR transfers
  - IPv6 promotion
  - ITHI review and implementation
  - Registry and whois accuracy (and the potential abuse-c and poc-validation policies that might be implemented)
  - RIR-to-RIR coordination framework (to resolve urgent issues pertaining to Internet number resources.
  - Impact of inter-RIR transfers on technical/security services provided by the RIRs

MG noted that the RSCG had requested to hold an F2F meeting at the APNIC offices in Q1 2020 prior to the APNIC 49 Meeting in Melbourne. She added that the first draft of the RSCG 2020 Work Plan had been submitted for the NRO EC's review.

PW noted that, if the NRO EC agreed, the RSCG was welcome to hold its meeting at the APNIC offices.

**New Action Item 20191015-6: All to review the RSCG 2020 Work Plan.**

PW commented that the ECG had flagged an issue: there was no central directory or registry for Trust Anchor Locations (TALs) that the RIRs operate. This meant that, if you wanted to find TALs to configure RPKI, you'd need to visit each RIR's website. He added that a discussion was held on whether the IANA could, hypothetically, create a registry for this or whether the NRO should create a directory that noted where TAL information could be found on each RIR website.

JC noted that it would be useful to have a page on the NRO website that provides [RPKI information](#) and provides pointers to each RIR's TAL information. He continued that some software packages have had to create this because this information is required to configure RPKI. ARIN had a hard requirement that the TAL must be obtained from ARIN: it was not possible to pre-bundle into all software packages.

**New Action Item 20191015-7: Secretariat to coordinate with the ECG on what information on TALs could be added to the RPKI page on the NRO website.**

## 7. Open Actions Review

Action Item 20190917-1 AP to send the proposed revised MoU to ICANN for discussion with their board during ICANN Meeting in Montreal. <b>Discussion:</b> See discussion under agenda item 2a.	CLOSED
Action Item 20190820-1: PW to ask PSCG representatives to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues and report back to the NRO EC before the September NRO EC Meeting. <b>Discussion:</b> PW noted that he had sent a note to the PSCG but had nothing to report. GV noted that the PSCG had asked to meet with the NRO EC during the F2F meeting in Montreal to discuss the mandate. He noted that he had added it to the agenda.	IN PROGRESS
Action Item 20190820-3: AP to ask IANA to provide an overview of its current RDNS service levels.	OPEN
Action Item 20190820-4: AP to follow up on action item 20190618-1 and ask the ECG and legal team to provide a report on the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services regarding RDNS before the September NRO EC Teleconference. <b>Discussion:</b> GV noted that he had added this to the agenda of the F2F Meeting in Montreal.	OPEN
Action Item 20190820-7: AP to follow up on ACTION ITEM 20190618-5 and ask the Legal Team to provide its review of the proposed Fraud Handling Framework before the September NRO EC teleconference. <b>Discussion:</b> AP noted he would follow up on this.	OPEN

<p>ACTION ITEM 20190716-1: JC to draft instructions for the legal team’s analysis of the ICANN Bylaws.</p> <p><b>Discussion:</b> JC noted that he had sent a draft document to the NRO EC mailing list. He asked the NRO EC to look at the document as soon as possible so that the Legal Team could work on this task before the F2F Meeting in Montreal.</p> <p><b>New Action Item 20191015-8: All to review the draft instructions for for the Legal Team’s analysis of the ICANN Bylaws asap and provide edit or approve so that the Legal Team can work on this task before the F2F Meeting in Montreal.</b></p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190716-8: GV to send a reminder to the NRO EC after each Teleconference to follow up with their respective IT Teams regarding RDAP Consistency and ITHI Projects (ongoing).</p> <p><b>Discussion:</b> GV noted that RDAP and ITHI had been added to the agenda of the F2F Meeting in Montreal.</p>	<p>ONGOING</p>

## 8. Minutes Review

- 2019-September 17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT  
(Pending: AFRINIC, ARIN, LACNIC)
- 2019-August 20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT  
(Pending: ARIN, RIPE NCC)
- 2019-July-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT  
(Pending: ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

AP asked the NRO EC to review and approve the minutes.

## 9. Next Meetings

- NRO EC f2f Meeting Friday 8 November in Montreal Canada (after ICANN meeting)
- Tuesday 19 November Teleconference
- Tuesday 17 December Teleconference (last of the year)
- NRO-EC Strategic Planning Meeting in 2020.

## 10. AOB

There was no other business.

## **11. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at 12:01 UTC.