

# 2019-May-24: Minutes NRO EC F2F Meeting

**Date: Friday, 24 May 2019, 17:30 UTC**  
**Reykjavik, Iceland**

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Alan Barrett (AB) - Remote	AFRINIC	Chair
Axel Pawlik* (AP)	RIPE NCC	Vice Chair/Secretary
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	

\*The meeting was chaired by AP due to AB's remote attendance.

### Observers:

Patrisse Deesse	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Gaurab Raj Upadhaya	APNIC Executive Council
Paul Andersen (PA)	ARIN Board of Trustees
Javier Salazar (JS)	LACNIC Board of Directors
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC
Remco van Mook (RvM)	RIPE NCC Executive Board

### Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (minutes)

---

## Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Agenda Review
3. ICANN Scope of Activities in Number Resources
4. NRO/RIR Activities and Community Collaboration at IGF
5. Discuss Draft Proposal for Inter-RIR Security Cooperation.
6. RDAP
7. Reverse DNS Resolution
8. History of the RIRs
9. New ASO Website
10. Use of Zoom for ASO and NRO Teleconferences
11. Open Actions
12. Minutes Review
13. Next Meetings
14. AOB
15. Adjourn

---

## Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

## New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190524-1: AB to discuss the recent OCTO-funded study on migration to IPv6 as well as continued collaboration on Internet number resource related activities with the ICANN CEO during the next ASO – ICANN CEO teleconference.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-2: GV to add continued collaboration on Internet number resource related activities to the agenda of the next NRO EC – ICANN Board joint session (ICANN 65 Marrakesh, AB and PW attending).
---

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-3: AB to add Reverse DNS Resolution/potential updates to the the SLA to the agenda for the upcoming SO Chair teleconference with the ICANN CEO.
---

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-4: ALL to review and comment on the document on proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service for reverse DNS resolution.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-5: SG to add links to RIR histories to the NRO website.
---

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-6: GV to set up an account for the NRO on APNIC’s corporate Zoom Account.
---

NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-7: GV to propose dates for the NRO EC F2F Meeting in Montreal in November, either during the meeting or at its conclusion.

---

## 1. Welcome

AP welcomed the attendees and noted that he would be chairing the meeting as AB was attending remotely.

## 2. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

## 3. ICANN Scope of Activities in Number Resources

The NRO EC discussed ICANN's number resource related activities.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 20190524-1: AB to discuss the recent OCTO-funded study on migration to IPv6 as well as continued collaboration on Internet number resource related activities with the ICANN CEO during the next ASO – ICANN CEO teleconference.**

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-2: GV to add continued collaboration on Internet number resource related activities to the agenda of the next NRO EC – ICANN Board joint session (ICANN 65 Marrakesh, AB and PW attending).**

## 4. NRO/RIR Activities and Community Collaboration at IGF

AB noted that he had sent a note to Juwang Zhu and Chengatai Masango at the UN informing them that the NRO EC would make a contribution of \$75,000 to the IGF Trust Fund in 2019, as noted in the 2019 NRO Budget. An acknowledgement had been received.

PW noted that the CCG had also sent a proposal for the NRO Booth.

## 5. Discuss Draft Proposal for Inter-RIR Security Cooperation

The NRO EC discussed the Draft Proposal for Inter-RIR Security Cooperation.

## 6. RDAP

PW explained that the ECG was currently working on RDAP and was working on developing an RDAP profile for the RIRs, together with input from the RSCG. Once work on the profile was complete, it would be necessary to understand from each RIR how far it was from following that profile.

PW noted that, in terms of compliance, three classes of items had been identified: short term, medium term and long term. Items in the longer-term category might have policy implications. It was expected that the short and medium term items would be implemented by the end of 2019. He continued that the ECG was discussing other topics, such as bringing RPKI information into RDAP. He encouraged the NRO EC to make sure that resources were allocated to their teams to enable them to continue their work on this.

OR noted that there was an action on the NRO EC to follow up with their respective teams and asked if there were any other updates on this:

*ACTION ITEM 20190416-5: All to follow up with their respective IT teams after each NRO EC Teleconference to check progress on the RDAP Consistency Project (ongoing).*

JC commented that ARIN was committed to supporting the work on RDAP and RDAP consistency and had committed significant resources to this work, as number community consistency in RDAP is very important. He added that ARIN supported various RDAP-related projects for the RIRs as well as supporting those working on tiered access and controlled access for DNS WHOIS, which also depends on RDAP.

## 7. Reverse DNS Resolution

The NRO EC discussed Reverse DNS Resolution in the [SLA for the IANA Numbering Service](#).

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-3: AB to add Reverse DNS Resolution/potential updates to the the SLA to the agenda for the upcoming SO Chair teleconference with the ICANN CEO.**

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-4: ALL to review and comment on the document on proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service for Reverse DNS resolution.**

## 8. History of the RIRs

JC explained that he had been contacted by an ICANN staff member, who suggested that the RIRs might embark on a project to record the history of the RIRs as recounted by various Internet pioneers. ICANN had recently published a history of the root servers.

RvM noted that each RIR had already published as much of their individual histories as they were comfortable with. A brief history of the NRO might add some value but the scope of this activity should be limited to the history of the NRO rather than of all five RIRs.

OR noted that LACNIC had recently embarked on a project regarding LACNIC's history: a researcher had been hired, interviews conducted and the resulting document would be published shortly. He noted that LACNIC had

decided to do this project to ensure a balanced story from the many actors in the region. If LACNIC did not write its own history, someone else would do it instead and probably without the same balance.

CB agreed that it was preferable for the RIRs to write their own histories. As most of the RIRs had already published documents on their histories, he suggested that these are linked to from the NRO website.

The NRO EC agreed.

JC noted that he would respond to the email that he had received, noting that the NRO had considered this and agreed that it was important. However, each RIR had already completed their own history project and links to these would be added to the NRO website.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-5: SG to add links to RIR histories to the NRO website.**

## 9. New ASO Website

SG gave overview of the new ASO website project. She noted that the Secretariat had drafted a new menu structure and had sent it to the ASO AC and the CCG for comment. The proposed new menu structure was not radically different to the current one but the ASO and the ASO AC responsibilities would be clearly separated to reinforce the differing roles and responsibilities. She continued that the same developer who had built the new NRO website has been contracted. The look and feel would be similar in case the two websites needed to be integrated in the future depending on the final outcomes of Recommendation #18. She concluded that work on the website would start after the ICANN Meeting in Marrakesh.

JC asked that the ASO AC meeting attendance record is made more prominent on the new website.

## 10. Use of Zoom for ASO and NRO Teleconferences

The NRO EC agreed to use APNIC's corporate Zoom account for the ASO and NRO teleconferences. Webex would no longer be used.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-6: GV to set up an account for the NRO on APNIC's corporate Zoom Account.**

## 11. Open Actions

ACTION ITEM 20190416-1: AP to update the Proposal on the Future Structure of the ASO and circulate for comment (with the intention to publish the following week).	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20190416-2: Secretariat to set up the NRO-security mailing list, prepare a space on the wiki and document list of names from 20190416-3 on wiki.  See agenda item 3.	IN PROGRESS

<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-3: ALL to inform IT staff about the new Inter-RIR Security Cooperation initiative. Each CEO to provide a list of staff to be assigned to the nro-irt group and to the NRO-security group.</p> <p>See agenda item 3.</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-4: AB to inform the ECG that the NRO EC discussed RDAP Consistency and that they should prioritise work on this, with the goal to complete this by the end of 2019 (tentative).</p>	<p>CLOSED</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-5: All to follow up with their respective IT teams after each NRO EC Teleconference to check progress on the RDAP Consistency Project (ongoing).</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-6: GV to contact CR to find out ICANN's expectations in regard to the How It Works Tutorials series.</p> <p>GV to send a reminder to CR regarding this.</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-7: GV to send a note to AS (ASO AC Chair) thanking him for bringing the ICANN How It Works Tutorials request to the attention of the NRO EC, noting that RIR staff would continue the discussion on this matter with ICANN.</p>	<p>CLOSED</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-8: OR/JC to draft service level requirements for reverse zones to potentially add to the NRO-ICANN SLA and circulate in time for the F2F meeting in Reykjavik.</p> <p>See agenda item 5 and:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-3: AB to add Reverse DNS Resolution/potential updates to the the SLA to the agenda for the upcoming SO Chair teleconference with the ICANN CEO.</li> <li>• NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-4: ALL to review and comment on the document on proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service for Reverse DNS resolution.</li> </ul>	<p>CLOSED</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-9: GV to draft a message for AB to send to the Legal Team outlining the NRO EC's expectations for the F2F meeting and asking the team to also include Recommendation #18 in its ongoing review of Recommendations #1-17.</p>	<p>CLOSED</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190319-4: OR to respond to ICANN noting that the NRO had no objections to paying the NRO Contribution before the end of ICANN's fiscal year, and to make the payment.</p> <p>OR noted that, as Treasurer, LACNIC would make the transfer.</p>	<p>CLOSED</p>

<p>ACTION ITEM 20190319-7: AB to ask the RIR Legal Team to comment on the proposed Fraud Handling Communication Framework and report back to the NRO EC.</p> <p>The legal team had not yet fully considered this document.</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>
<p>ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.</p> <p>Replaced by <i>ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.</i></p>	<p>CLOSED</p>
<p>ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.</p>	<p>CLOSED</p>

## 12. Minutes Review

AP asked the NRO EC to read and subsequently approve the pending minutes:

- 2019-Apr-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference- DRAFT (Pending: APNIC, ARIN LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2019-Mar-19: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

## 13. Next Meetings

### a) Next NRO EC F2F Meeting

The NRO EC agreed that the next F2F Meeting would be held either during or at the conclusion of the ICANN 65 Meeting in Montreal.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 0190524-7: GV to propose dates for the NRO EC F2F Meeting in Montreal in November, either during the meeting or at its conclusion.**

- b) Tuesday 18 June Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 16 July Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 20 August Teleconference

## 14. AOB

There was no AOB

## 15. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 18:45 UTC.