

2019-July-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Date: Tuesday, 16 July 2019, 11am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Alan Barrett (AB)	AFRINIC	Chair
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Vice Chair/Secretary
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	

Observers:

Patrisse Deesse (PD)	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Chris Buckridge (CB)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Minutes)

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
2. ASO ICANN Bylaws Review
3. ASO AC Roles and Responsibilities
4. SO/AC Chairs to Play a Role in Assigning Additional ICANN Funds
5. Report on Meeting with ICANN Board during ICANN 65
6. PSCG Mandate

7. RIR HR Staff Face-to-Face Meeting at LACNIC 32, Panama
8. Pending Mailing List Appointments
9. NRO EC Roles
10. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations
11. Open Actions Review
12. Minutes Review
13. Next Meetings
14. AOB

Resolutions

The following resolution was passed during this meeting:

RESOLUTION R-20190716-1: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2018 NRO Expense Report.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-1: AP to draft instructions for the legal team's analysis of the ICANN Bylaws.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-2: GV to inform AS that the NRO EC had agreed that the text regarding the ASO AC's Roles and Responsibilities could be published.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-3: PW to send an informal note to ICANN Board regarding the progress of the discussions on the ASO Future Structure.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-4: PW to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-5: Secretariat to add PSCG mandate/goals and discussion points to the NRO wiki.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-6: GV to check the existing ECG emergency response mailing list members against the newly proposed NRO-IRT mailing list members and follow up with the relevant RIRs so that just one mailing list could be maintained.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-7: Secretariat to update the NRO email aliases and webpages upon AB's departure.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-8: GV to send a reminder to the NRO EC after each Teleconference to follow up with their respective IT Teams regarding RDAP Consistency and ITHI Projects (ongoing).

0. Welcome

AB welcomed the attendees to the call.

1. Agenda Review

AB added an item to AoB.

2. ASO ICANN Bylaws Review

The NRO EC discussed the ASO in ICANN Bylaws Document.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-1: AP to draft instructions for the legal team's analysis of the ICANN Bylaws.

3. ASO AC Roles and Responsibilities

AB noted that the NRO EC had reviewed the message regarding the ASO AC's Roles and Responsibilities and agreed that it could be published.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-2: GV to inform AS that the NRO EC had agreed that the text regarding the ASO AC's Roles and Responsibilities could be published.

4. SO/AC Chairs to Play a Role in Assigning Additional ICANN Funds

AB explained that the ICANN CEO had informally suggested that the SO/ACs be given a role in how its surplus funds should be spent. The SO/AC Chairs discussed this during their meeting and had decided to draft a letter, stating that they would like to defer any budgeting exercises but would like to continue this discussion in the future. There was a suggestion to add the surplus to the contingency fund or to review the items that had previously been suggested but did not make it into the budget. He continued that the letter would be sent from the SO/AC Chairs rather than the organizations themselves so he didn't think it needed to be formally endorsed.

The NRO EC agreed that the message from the SO/AC Chairs as outlined by AB above was an appropriate response

5. Report on Meeting with ICANN Board at ICANN 65

The NRO EC discussed the recent meeting with the ICANN Board during ICANN 65.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-3: PW to send an informal note to ICANN Board regarding the progress of the discussions on the ASO Future Structure.

6. PSCG Mandate

PW explained that, during ICANN 65, there had been a general discussion about the PSCG with ARIN and RIPE NCC staff. As a result, he had circulated a few practical and achievable goals that the PSCG could start working on if the NRO EC was in agreement. The next step would be for each CEO to inform its PSCG representatives of these goals.

JC commented that ARIN had no issues with the proposed PSCG goals. However, he had expected that the PSCG mailing list would have just one representative per RIR on it rather than any interested staff member.

PW noted that he didn't recall list membership being discussed and thought that the PSCG mailing list would be like any other CG's mailing list: the CEOs would add anyone it felt should be on that list.

JC noted that some of the information the PSCG might share could be sensitive and the distribution would need to be tightly controlled. Information about specific fraud cases, for example, could not be shared on an open mailing list.

PW agreed. He noted that, in his view, the PSCG's role was to coordinate activities such as training workshops and to facilitate engagement at events rather than using its mailing list for operational purposes.

JC had no objections to this but asked that the PSCG be asked to discuss its modes of communication.

AB noted that it was important the PSCG understood any confidentiality issues.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-4: PW to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-5: Secretariat to add PSCG mandate/goals and discussion points to the NRO wiki.

7. RIR HR Staff Face-to-Face Meeting at LACNIC 32, Panama

The NRO EC approved the RIR HR Staff F2F Meeting during LACNIC 32, Panama.

8. Pending Mailing List Appointments

The NRO EC discussed the pending mailing list appointments.

a) AC-DISCUSS Mailing List

The NRO EC discussed the ac-discuss mailing list.

b) PSCG

The NRO EC discussed the PSCG mailing list.

c) NRO-SECURITY

The NRO EC discussed the NRO-Security mailing list.

d) NRO-IRT

The NRO EC discussed the NRO-IRT mailing list.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-6: GV to check the existing ECG emergency response mailing list members against the newly proposed NRO-IRT mailing list members and follow up with the relevant RIRs so that just one mailing list could be maintained.

e) Legal Team Wiki Space

The NRO EC discussed the Legal Team's Wiki space.

9. NRO EC Roles

The NRO EC discussed role rotation once AB leaves his position as CEO of AFRINIC:

- Chair: AP
- Vice Chair: PW
- The Secretary (AP) and Treasurer (OR) remain unchanged.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-7: Secretariat to update the NRO email aliases and webpages upon AB's departure.

10. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

a) Secretariat | 2018 NRO Expense Report

The NRO EC discussed the 2018 NRO Expense Report.

GV explained that the 2018 NRO Expense Report had been reviewed by each RIR's CFO, who had validated the numbers and confirmed that the NRO expenses that their RIR incurred in 2018 were accurately recorded.

He continued that the NRO had executed around 75% of what had been budgeted for in 2018. Areas where resources had been saved included:

- A contract that was not renewed.
- Lower costs for Secretariat travel due to the practice of combining travel as much as possible.
- Lower costs for ASO AC Chair travel due to a change in the Chair's region.
- Lower meeting expenses.

GV noted that the 2019 contribution to ICANN had been made. The distribution formula that was used to pay this 2019 invoice was based on each RIR's revenue from registration services in 2018.

He also noted that the 2018 NRO Expenses distribution formula was based on each RIR's revenue from registration services in 2017. He continued that the NRO EC had committed to check the distribution formula every year. Both tables had been sent to the mailing list so that the NRO EC could see the variation between the percentages that each RIR contributes to the NRO expenses. The biggest variation was for ARIN (1.9%).

AB noted that he was pleased to see that the IANA Contract fee and the Voluntary Contribution to ICANN were separate line items

PW commended GV on the resources saved in 2018.

AB asked if the 2018 expenses had been audited.

GV noted that each CFO had audited it and the figures had been audited within each RIR. He noted that the distribution formula had also been validated.

RESOLUTION R-20190716-1: The NRO EC resolves to approve the 2018 NRO Expense Report.

AB thanked the Secretariat for its work.

11. Open Actions Review

ACTION ITEM 20190618-1: AB to ask the ECG and the Legal Team to review the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service and report back.	OPEN
ACTION ITEM 20190618-2: GV to request a list of appointees to the new newly formed Public Safety Coordination Group (PSCG) from each CEO. Notes: Pending AFRINIC appointees.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20190618-3: Secretariat to prepare mailing list, wiki space etc. for the newly formed Public Safety Coordination Group (PSCG). Notes: Pending AFRINIC appointees.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20190618-5: AB to send a reminder to the Legal Team regarding its review of the proposed Fraud Handling Framework.	OPEN
ACTION ITEM 20190618-6: Secretariat to send login credentials to the Legal Team representatives and add the Legal Team's deliverables to the Legal Space on the NRO Wiki.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20190524-1: AB to discuss the recent OCTO-funded study on migration to IPv6 as well as continued collaboration on Internet number resource related activities with the ICANN CEO during the next ASO – ICANN CEO teleconference.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 0190524-3: AB to add Reverse DNS Resolution/potential updates to the the SLA to the agenda for the upcoming SO Chair teleconference with the ICANN CEO. Notes: See ACTION ITEM 20190618-1 and ACTION ITEM 0190524-4.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 0190524-4: ALL to review and comment on the document on proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service for Reverse DNS resolution. Notes: See ACTION ITEM 20190618-1.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 0190524-7: GV to propose dates for the NRO EC F2F Meeting in Montreal in November, either during the meeting or at its conclusion. Notes: Confirmed 8/9 November 2019.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20190416-2: Secretariat to set up the NRO-security mailing list, prepare a space on the wiki and document list of names from 20190416-3 on wiki.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20190416-3: ALL to inform IT staff about the new Inter-RIR Security Cooperation initiative. Each CEO to provide a list of staff to be assigned to the nro-irt group and to the NRO-security group.	CLOSED

<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-5: All to follow up with their respective IT teams after each NRO EC Teleconference to check progress on the RDAP Consistency Project (ongoing).</p> <p>Notes: AB asked GV to send a reminder to the NRO EC after each meeting on this as well as on any other pending projects, such as ITHI.</p> <p>NEW ACTION ITEM 20190716-8: GV to send a reminder to the NRO EC after each Teleconference to follow up with their respective IT Teams regarding RDAP Consistency and ITHI Projects (ongoing).</p>	<p>ONGOING</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190416-6: GV to contact CR to find out ICANN’s expectations in regard to the How It Works Tutorials series.</p> <p>Notes: GV noted he would follow up on this.</p> <p>PW noted that Adiel Akplogan was now responsible for coordinating ICANN's technical training and that APNIC's training team had collaborated with ICANN's Asia-Pacific trainer.</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS.</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20190319-7: AB to ask the RIR Legal Team to comment on the proposed Fraud Handling Communication Framework and report back to the NRO EC.</p>	<p>IN PROGRESS</p>

12. Minutes Review

- 2019-Jun-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT
Pending: LACNIC
- 2019-May-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference
The minutes from the May 2019 Teleconference were approved. AB asked the Secretariat to publish these minutes on the NRO website.
- 2019-Apr-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference
The minutes from the April 2019 Teleconference were approved. AB asked the Secretariat to publish these minutes on the NRO website.

13. Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 20 August Teleconference
- b) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference
- c) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference (During RIPE 79 Meeting)
- d) NRO EC f2f Meeting Friday 8 - Saturday 9 November in Montreal Canada (after ICANN meeting)

14. AOB

a) AFRINIC Status

AB noted that he would be leaving AFRINIC on 27 July, 2019, and that this would be his last NRO EC Teleconference. He thanked the NRO EC for its support.

b) Thanks to Alan Barrett

PW, as the incoming NRO EC Vice Chair and in the absence of the incoming Chair, thanked AB on behalf of the NRO for his contribution to the NRO EC, for his work as NRO Chair this year and for his efforts at AFRINIC. He also thanked AB for his contribution to the entire RIR system and wished him all the best in his future endeavours.

The NRO EC concurred and thanked AB for his efforts.

15. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned 12:11 UTC.