2019-August-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Date: Tuesday, 20 august 2019, 11am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Vice Chair/Secretary
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	Treasurer
Patrisse Deesse	AFRINIC	
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	

Apologies

Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Chair

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya Sanjaya (SS)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Minutes)

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
2. ASO Review
3. PSCG Mandate
4. Distribution of the Annual IANA Engagement Survey
5. SLA for the IANA Numbering Services for Reverse DNS Resolution

6. Request for Private IPv6 Address Block
7. IGF Tech Reception
8. I* Meeting
9. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations
10. Open Actions Review
11. Minutes Review
12. Next Meetings
13. AOB
14. Adjourn

Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

New Action Item 20190820-1: PW to ask PSCG representatives to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues and report back to the NRO EC before the September NRO EC Meeting.
New Action Item 20190820-2: JC to draft a response to IANA regarding the IANA Engagement Survey and circulate to the mailing list for discussion during the next NRO EC Teleconference.
New Action Item 20190820-3: AP to ask IANA to provide an overview of its current RDNS service levels.
New Action Item 20190820-4: AP to follow up on action item 20190618-1 and ask the ECG and Legal Team to provide a report on the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services regarding RDNS before the September NRO EC Teleconference.
New Action Item 20190820-5: ALL to respond to the [Doodle Poll](#) regarding the date for the upcoming I* Meeting.
New Action Item 20190820-6: ALL to review and subsequently approve the request for the proposed CFO F2F Meeting.
New Action Item 20190820-7: AP to follow up on ACTION ITEM 20190618-5 and ask the Legal Team to provide its review of the proposed Fraud Handling Framework before the September NRO EC teleconference.

---

1. Welcome

PW welcomed the attendees to the call. He noted that AP had sent his apologies and that he would be chairing the meeting in AP's absence.

2. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

3. ASO Review

The NRO EC discussed the Proposal for Progressing the ASO Review.

4. PSCG Mandate

PW noted that the following action had been assigned to him:

ACTION ITEM 20190716-4: PW to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues.

He commented that he was not the correct person to tackle this and suggested that this action should be transferred to the relevant PSCG members instead.

The NRO EC agreed.

New Action Item 20190820-1: PW to ask PSCG representatives to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues and report back to the NRO EC before the September NRO EC Meeting.

5. Distribution of the Annual IANA Engagement Survey

The NRO EC discussed the recent email from IANA asking whether the IANA Engagement Survey could be circulated on the RIR communities' mailing lists.

New Action Item 20190820-2: JC to draft a response to IANA regarding the IANA Engagement Survey and circulate to the mailing list for discussion during the next NRO EC Teleconference.

6. SLA for the IANA Numbering Services for Reverse DNS Resolution

The NRO EC discussed Reverse DNS Resolution.

New Action Item 20190820-3: AP to ask IANA to provide an overview of its current RDNS service levels.

New Action Item 20190820-4: AP to follow up on action item 20190618-1 and ask the ECG and Legal Team to provide a report on the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services regarding RDNS before the September NRO EC Teleconference.

7. Request for Private IPv6 Address Block

PW explained that *[redacted]* had contacted the NRO asking for a private IPv6 block. He continued that, as private IPv6 blocks do not exist, this seemed to be a regular request for space. As the organization was based in Canada, it should be referred to ARIN.

JC agreed and noted that ARIN's Registration Services team would take this on.

OR asked if it was clear what *[redacted]* had meant when it had asked for an address block for private use.

JC noted that anyone who has been issued an address block and doesn't route it could be assured private use. This would be the highest level of clarity that ARIN could provide. He added that, if RPKI was used, not only was there assured private use, but information could be added to ensure that, if that block was routed with any AS other than their own, the routes would be dropped. He continued that this would be a better solution for *[redacted]* than to approach the IETF in attempt to gain reserved space. He concluded that ARIN would take this on and that he would report back to the NRO EC.

8. IGF Tech Reception

The NRO EC discussed its contribution to the Tech Reception at the upcoming IGF.

PW explained that, as in previous years, the NRO had budget to support the IGF Tech Reception.

GV noted that in the past, the NRO had matched ICANN's and ISOC's contributions. He noted that he would follow up on this and report back to the NRO EC if the proposed contribution was more than the $8.5k budgeted for this purpose.

OR asked if the commitment to match ISOC and ICANN's contributions was an agreement among the NRO EC or whether it was something that had been agreed with ICANN and ISOC in the past.

GV confirmed that the decision to match the contributions was an internal one: nothing had been publicly committed to.

JC noted that it was not possible to measure the return on this particular investment. In principle, the NRO should contribute the same as the two partner organizations and as long as the amount roughly corresponded to the NRO EC's expectations, there would be no problem committing to sharing the cost. He added that there should be no issue if the costs were within 10% of the budgeted amount.

PW asked GV to continue the discussions on this with the partner organizations, noting that the NRO could agree to match the contribution of around $8.5k without needing further discussion.

9. I* Meeting

PW explained that ISOC CEO Andrew Sullivan had suggested two dates for the I* Meeting. As 1 November clashed with the ARIN Meeting, 8 November would be the best option. He continued that 8 November had been designated for the NRO F2F in Montreal and proposed that the NRO EC attend the I* meeting in the morning, start the F2F meeting in the afternoon and continue the F2F meeting on 9 November.

There were no objections.

PW asked the NRO EC to respond to the Doodle Poll.

New Action Item 20190820-5: ALL to respond to the Doodle Poll regarding the date for the upcoming I* Meeting.

10. CG and Secretariat Reports/Consultations

GV noted that there were no CG reports.

- **CFO F2F Meeting**

GV noted that he had sent a request for approval for the proposed CFO F2F Meeting, which would take place in Uruguay from 13-15 November.

JC noted that ARIN had a new CFO and his availability for the F2F Meeting had been confirmed.

New Action Item 20190820-6: ALL to review and subsequently approve the request for the proposed CFO F2F Meeting.

- **Secretariat**

GV noted that the ASO AC was currently in a voting process to nominate its representative to the ICANN NomCom. An announcement regarding the selected candidate would be made shortly.

11. Open Actions Review

ACTION ITEM 20190716-1: AP to draft instructions for the legal team's analysis of the ICANN Bylaws. *Discussion*: JC noted that he had agreed to work with AP on this but nothing had yet been done. He suggested that this action be put on him instead and he would circulate a first draft so that the NRO EC has something to comment on.	OPEN
ACTION ITEM 20190716-4: PW to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues. *Discussion*: See discussion under agenda item *4: PSCG Mandate* and replacement action item: *New Action Item 20190820-1: PW to ask PSCG representatives to update the draft PSCG mandate/goals with details about communication methods and confidentiality issues and report back to the NRO EC before the September NRO EC Meeting.*	CLOSED

ACTION ITEM 20190716-6: GV to check the existing ECG emergency response mailing list members against the newly proposed NRO-IRT mailing list members and follow up with the relevant RIRs so that just one mailing list could be maintained.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20190716-8: GV to send a reminder to the NRO EC after each Teleconference to follow up with their respective IT Teams regarding RDAP Consistency and ITHI Projects (ongoing).	ONGOING
ACTION ITEM 20190618-1: AB to ask the ECG and the Legal Team to review the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service and report back. *Discussion*: See Agenda item 6. *SLA for the IANA Numbering Services for Reverse DNS Resolution* and replacement action item: *New Action Item 20190820-4: AP to follow up on action item 20190618-1 and ask the ECG to provide a report on the proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Services regarding RDNS before the September NRO EC Teleconference.*	CLOSED > Replaced by20190820-4
ACTION ITEM 20190618-5: AB to send a reminder to the Legal Team regarding its review of the proposed Fraud Handling Framework. **New Action Item 20190820-7: AP to follow up on ACTION ITEM 20190618-5 and ask the Legal Team to provide its review of the proposed Fraud Handling Framework before the September NRO EC teleconference.**	CLOSED > Replaced by 20190820-7
ACTION ITEM 0190524-4: ALL to review and comment on the document on proposed changes to the SLA for the IANA Numbering Service for reverse DNS resolution.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20190416-5: All to follow up with their respective IT teams after each NRO EC Teleconference to check progress on the RDAP Consistency Project (ongoing).	ONGOING
ACTION ITEM 20190416-6: GV to contact CR to find out ICANN's expectations in regard to the How It Works Tutorials series. GV noted that he would follow up with CR on this again. He noted that the NRO EC had agreed that it would support ICANN's tutorial series: the RIRs would use their own materials to conduct tutorials in various regions.	IN PROGRESS

12. Minutes Review

- 2019-July-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference- DRAFT
  (Pending: ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2019-Jun-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT
  (Pending: LACNIC)

PW asked the NRO EC to review and approve the minutes.

13. Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference
b) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference (During RIPE 79 Meeting)
c) NRO EC f2f Meeting Friday 8 - Saturday 9 November in Montreal Canada (after ICANN meeting)
d) Tuesday 19 November Teleconference

PW noted that the NRO EC would review the need for this meeting during the F2F meeting earlier in the month.

e) Tuesday 17 December Teleconference (last of the year)

PW asked the NRO EC to review the meeting dates and flag any issues.

14. AOB

There was no AOB.

15. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 11:46 UTC