

Minutes NRO EC F2F Meeting Amsterdam

Friday, 19 October 2018, 14:00 CET

Attendees

Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
Alan Barrett (AB)	AFRINIC	Secretary – Vice Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Paul Andersen (PA)	ARIN Board
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC
Javier Salazar (JS)	LACNIC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Scribe)

Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Agenda Review
3. Process for Agreeing Upon and Endorsing Joint RIR documents
4. A Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System
5. Definitions/Terminology in use for Database/Registry
6. Changes in IETF Trust
7. Final Review ICANN 63 Barcelona
8. RPKI coordination

- 9. RIR Incident Response coordination
 - 10. I* Agenda
 - 11. NRO Website Update
 - 12. Next Meetings
 - 13. AOB
 - 14. Adjourn
-

Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.
NEW ACTION 20181019-2: AB to send a response to the IANA IPR CCG noting that the NRO EC had no objections to proposed changes in the IETF Trust.
NEW ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.
NEW ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting.
NEW ACTION 20181019-5: All to discuss with Boards/Legal whether the “Paris Call for Trust and Security in Cyberspace” should be signed and whether it should be signed by individual RIRs or by the NRO.

1. Welcome

PW welcomed the attendees.

2. Agenda Review

Item 6. *Root Zone / .ARPA / Inverse Resolution / SLA / EZRC (OR)* was removed from the agenda.

3. Process for Agreeing Upon and Endorsing Joint RIR documents

4. A Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System

The NRO EC discussed whether a process for agreeing upon and endorsing joint RIR documents was necessary. It also discussed the proposed Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System document.

NEW ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.

5. Definitions/Terminology in use for Database/Registry etc. (AP)

AP noted that there had been an impression forming in the RIPE region that the quality of the data in the database was very bad due to the terminology being used by staff and Board.

He noted that what was now called the RIPE NCC registry included internal data and public data on allocations that the RIPE NCC was responsible for and ensures the correctness and accuracy of. The quality of the data in this registry is excellent. The RIPE NCC does not have control over the data entered into the RIPE Database by third parties.

AP suggested that the CCG could be asked to work with this concept and review current documentation.

PW suggested that the NRO EC should come up with the definitions and then instruct staff: a document could be drafted.

JC noted that the ITHI metrics don't recognize that the data fields to which they apply have different maintainers. It might be worthwhile having different levels of accuracy for fields maintained by the RIRs and for fields maintained by the LIRs.

AB added that some items have multiple maintainers. He added that AFRINIC had not been consistent in the way it communicates about the database –AFRINIC database, WHOIS, Number Registry – and was in support of more consistency.

PW noted that a formal document of concise definitions could be produced and then the NRO EC could see if there was agreement.

JC commented that the document should describe the database fields that the RIRs maintain and the fields that others are responsible for maintaining. It would be good for the five RIRs, when talking about metrics and the Internet Number Registry System, to describe them in the same way.

AP noted that he would send some slides on this topic to the NRO EC and would be happy to lead this discussion with the RIPE NCC Comms team and the CCG. He added that there was still an action on him from the May teleconference:

ACTION ITEM 20180515-7: AP to initiate discussion on how to communicate on database accuracy versus registry accuracy.

6. Changes in IETF Trust

AB explained that an email had been received by representatives on the IANA IPR CCG inviting the NRO to comment on changes to the IETF Trust's terms and conditions. He continued that he believed that no action was necessary but a note should be sent stating that the NRO EC had no objection to the changes.

There were no objections.

NEW ACTION 20181019-2: AB to send a response to the IANA IPR CCG noting that the NRO EC had no objections to proposed changes in the IETF Trust.

7. Final Review ICANN 63 Barcelona

a) ICANN Opening - RIR 5 min Statement

Items to be included in the opening statement:

- An overview on how the RIRs supported the KSK rollover.
- Acknowledgement of the 20th anniversary of John Postel's passing.

b) Agenda Topics with ICANN Board Directors - Tuesday 23 October 8:30 - 9:30

PW noted that it had been agreed that the ASO Public Session would be cancelled so this session would be the only public ASO session.

Items to be included on the agenda:

- ASO AC update
- NRO EC update
- Questions from the ICANN Board

c) ITHI session - Wednesday 24 October 10:30

PW will present the ITHI slides.

d) Joint ASO AC - NRO EC Meeting session - Wed 24 October 13:30 - 15:00

Proposed agenda items:

- ASO Review Recommendations: updates from each region
- ICANN Fellowship Committee Appointments
- ASO NomCom Appointment
- Appointments to ICANN/other bodies
- Progress the global PDP document clean up

AP noted that he would not be able to attend as it clashed with the RIPE NCC Member lunch event.

- **ASO/NRO Appointments to Bodies**

PW asked the Secretariat whether a list of Appointments to ICANN/other bodies had been created yet.

SG noted that the Secretariat was working on the list on the NRO wiki.

AB suggested expanding the list to include appointments to other organizations such as IETF.

- **ASO Review Recommendations**

PW noted that an overview of the status of all recommendations should be given. Regarding Recommendation 18, AFRINIC needed to hold its final consultation before the NRO EC could consider next steps.

e) ICANN Board and NRO EC Private Session - 15:15 - 16:45

The NRO EC discussed the agenda for the ICANN Board and NRO EC Private Session.

f) ASO Dinner

The ASO Dinner takes place on Tuesday evening.

8. RPKI Coordination

The NRO EC discussed RPKI coordination among the five RIRs.

NEW ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.

9. RIR Incident Response Coordination

PW suggested that the NRO EC define its collective incidence response mechanism. He noted that APNIC is establishing an IRT in response to Members' requests as well as in response to its own needs and asked if there was need to coordinate with other RIRs on this.

There was some discussion on this and the NRO EC agreed on the following action item:

NEW ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting.

10. I* Agenda

The NRO EC discussed the agenda for the upcoming I* meeting.

11. NRO Website Update

SG gave an update on the new NRO website. She noted that the current and new sites had been running in parallel for several weeks with no issues. The new website will go live on 24 October.

12. Next Meetings

- a) Meeting with I* Saturday 27 October 2018
- b) Teleconference Tuesday 20 November (week after IGF)
- c) Teleconference Tuesday 18 December (last meeting of the year)
- d) Next face to face

The NRO EC agreed to hold its next F2F meeting on 1 March 2019, after the APRICOT Meeting in Daejeon, Korea.

13. AOB

- **Paris Call for Trust and Security in Cyberspace**

JC noted that the RIRs had been asked if they would like to sign the “Paris Call for Trust and Security in Cyberspace”.

AP noted that the RIPE NCC was currently hesitant to sign.

PW noted the draft text was so far innocuous.

OR noted that the message in the document was strong but agreed that it was innocuous.

PW noted that the final text is still under embargo.

AB noted that he would need to seek approval from the AFRINIC Board before signing.

PH noted that President Macron would issue a call for support for the document. He added the draft text might change.

JC noted that he would propose to the ARIN Board that the statement should be signed. He added that signing and then withdrawing support if the document went awry would be a strong message.

NEW ACTION 20181019-5: All to discuss with Boards/Legal whether the “Paris Call for Trust and Security in Cyberspace” should be signed and whether it should be signed by individual RIRs or by the NRO.

14. Adjourn

The meeting was Adjourned at 17.21 CET (16:21 UTC).