

Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Tuesday, 20 November 2018 | 11am UTC.

Attendees

Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya (SJ)	APNIC
Nate Davis (ND)	ARIN
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Scribe)

Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Agenda Review
3. ASO Review
4. RIR Incident Response Coordination
5. CCG Reports
6. Review Open Actions

- 7. Minutes Review
 - 8. Next Meetings
 - 9. AOB
 - 10. Adjourn
-

Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-01: All to review the RSCG's proposal to hold an F2F meeting during the ICANN 64 Meeting in Japan and to discuss this during the December teleconference.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-02: All to review the "NRO Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN (version: 19 November 2018)" for discussion during the December teleconference.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-03: All to further discuss date/location of the proposed F2F NRO EC Meeting on the mailing list.
--

1. Welcome

PW welcomed the attendees.

2. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

3. ASO Review

PW noted that once the upcoming AFRINIC meeting had concluded, the NRO EC would discuss the next steps regarding the ASO Review.

4. RIR Incident Response Coordination

JC noted that he had asked ARIN security staff to consider the proposed RIR Incident Response team. He added that the RIRs should work together on this and the NRO EC would need to decide whether the work should be done formally or informally.

AP noted that the RIPE NCC's CIO had shared details with the ECG representatives and it was under discussion.

OR noted that, for LACNIC, there was an interest to coordinate on this but noted that expectations should be clear. He added that Carlos Martinez had informed him that this subject had been discussed previously but there had been no agreement on it at the time. He believed, however, that some level of coordination across the RIRs was necessary in case of attack or other incidents.

PW reported that discussions at APNIC were also ongoing. He continued that the following action item should remain open and that the NRO EC should discuss this during the December teleconference: *ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting.*

5. CCG Reports

PW gave an overview of the CGs' activities:

a) CCG

- The CCG attended the IGF:
 - Over 100 delegates visited the RIR booth and around 75 people participated in the scratch card game.
 - The NRO Continuing Cooperation brochure was distributed.
- The NRO website has been completed and is live (see Secretariat's report)
- The redesign work on the NRO PPT template is ongoing.

b) ECG

- Delegated Extended Stats
 - Work is underway on the reporting of the delegated extended stats. This is a RIPE work item, which has been moved to Q1 2019.
 - There is ongoing discussion on how to report transfers and on the detection of overlaps in the transit process.
- RPKI
 - Discussion on RPKI reporting proposals is ongoing.
 - The validation reconsidered proposal was submitted to the IETF. The consensus in the room was for the RIRs to run the code to see if it worked before asking for a commitment. The ECG will be working with the RIPE NCC product team to run code in its validator and this is planned for Q1 2019.
- ITHI Reporting
 - The ECG is still working with the RSCG on this and progress is being tracked by the RSCG.
- RDAP Alignment
 - Discussion on the alignment of RDAP profiles across the RIRs is continuing. The RIRs will run compliance tests and report on findings.

- Emergency back up Registry
 - A first draft was presented to the ECG by Carlos Martinez. The draft noted two phases: FM (Frozen Mode) and MR (Maintenance Required). The ECG will discuss this further in the coming weeks.

c) RSCG

- There were no updates to the RSCG’s work plan this month.
- The RSCG has submitted a proposal to hold an F2F meeting during the ICANN meeting in Kobe, Japan.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-01: All to review the RSCG’s proposal to hold an F2F meeting during the ICANN 64 Meeting in Japan and to discuss this during the December teleconference.

d) Secretariat

- **NRO Website**

SG gave an update on the new NRO Website. She noted that the site had been live for several weeks and there had been no issues reported. She added that the redirects were functioning correctly and that a few issues with GDPR/cookie compliance were still under discussion with the RIPE NCC’s legal team.

- **ICANN Board Seat 10 Elections.**

GV gave an update on the ICANN Board Seat 10 Elections.

6. Review Open Actions

ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.	OPEN
ACTION 20181019-2: AB to send a response to the IANA IPR CCG noting that the NRO EC had no objections to proposed changes in the IETF Trust.	CLOSED
ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting.	OPEN
ACTION 20181019-5: All to discuss with Boards/Legal whether the “Paris Call for Trust and Security in Cyberspace” should be signed and whether it should be signed by individual RIRs or by the NRO.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20181009-5: All to review and subsequently approve the 2017 NRO distribution formula. GV noted that the CFOs had reviewed and approved the NRO distribution formula during the recent F2F meeting. The formula now needed to be adjusted according to the discussion and then presented to the NRO EC.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20180717-1: AP/JC to draft a straw man proposal on how to move the ASO Review forward. The proposal should be published by end of August 2018 [ASO Review]	CLOSED

ACTION ITEM 20180717-3: OR to send a brief note to Göran Marby and Cherine Chalaby thanking them for the meeting and summarizing the points about NRO/ASO's cooperation with ICANN and ICANN's IPv6 initiative.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20180717-5: Secretariat to keep the ASO Review Report Recommendation Implementation Status document updated according to the progress reported in future NRO EC meetings	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20180628-4: JC to draft a procedure for periodic reviews of the ASO [ASO Review Rec #3]. JC noted that he had circulated a draft procedure to the NRO EC mailing list on 19 November. NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-02: All to review the "NRO Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN (version: 19 November 2018)" for discussion during the December teleconference.	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20180628-5: JC to confirm that the ASO AC is working on Recommendation #7 [ASO Review Rec #7].	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20180628-10: All to review and comment on the draft Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System <i>Superseded by ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.</i>	CLOSED

7. Minutes Review

- a) 9 October 2018
- b) 19 October 2018

Both sets of minutes were still pending approval by several RIRs.

8. Next Meetings

- a) Teleconference Tuesday 18 December
- b) Teleconference Tuesday 15 January
- c) Teleconference Tuesday 19 February
- b) Next f2f Meeting 1 March Daejeon, Korea

JC noted that he might have a conflict that could prevent him attending the F2F in Korea. He added that he would be able to share more details about his schedule in the coming two weeks.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181120-03: All to further discuss date/location of the proposed F2F NRO EC Meeting on the mailing list.

9. AOB

JC informed the NRO EC that, due to his upcoming retirement from ARIN, this would be ND's last NRO EC Teleconference. RJ would continue to join the calls as an observer.

On behalf of the NRO EC, PW thanked ND for his hard work and contribution to the work of the NRO over the years and wished him all the best with this next phase in life.

10. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 11.36 UTC.