

Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Tuesday, 18 December 2018, 11am UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
Alan Barrett (AB)	AFRINIC	Secretary – Vice Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Sanjaya (SJ)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)	LACNIC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Scribe)

Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Agenda Review
3. ASO Review
4. NRO Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN (version: 19 November 2018)
5. ASO Participation in ATRT3
6. Registering IANA in the EUIPO
7. RIR Incident Response Coordination

- 8. CG Reports
 - 9. Open Actions
 - 10. Next Meetings
 - a) Teleconference Tuesday 15 January 2019
 - b) Teleconference Tuesday 19 February 2019
 - c) Next f2f Meeting
 - 11. Minutes Review
 - 12. AOB
 - 13. Adjourn
-

Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181218-01: PW to circulate a draft proposal on Incidence Response before the February Teleconference.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181218-02: GV to circulate a Doodle poll to determine which location would work for the upcoming NRO EC F2F Meeting.

1. Welcome

PW welcomed the attendees.

2. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

3. ASO Review

a) Update

The NRO EC discussed the status of the ASO Future Structure Consultation.

AFRINIC: AB noted that the three AFRINIC ASO AC representatives issued a community survey on the ASO Future Structure Consultation. The survey closed on 16 Dec and the results should be available late December/early January.

APNIC: PW noted that the APNIC EC had recently discussed the ASO Future Structure Consultation and had agreed to assign representatives to a global group if it transpired that one might be necessary in the future.

There were no further updates on the ASO Future Structure Consultation from ARIN, LACNIC and RIPE NCC.

The NRO EC decided to continue the discussion on this in January 2019.

b) ASO AC Comments on Recommendations #6

- **Recommendation #6 (p.30):** The ASO AC should ensure that procedures are developed for Steps 12, 15 and 16 of the GPDP as described in Attachment A of the ASO MoU.

ASO AC Response: *Regarding Step 12, we as ASO AC can confirm that 6.6.2.3 fulfil the needs of step 12 of ASO MoU Attachment A. Whereas due to the specific nature of step 15 and 16 we believe that NRO EC should consider these points.*

Ref: <https://aso.icann.org/global-policies/global-policy-development-process/>

c) ASO AC Comments on Recommendations #7

- **Recommendation #7 (p.31):** The ASO should consider the adoption of a single, authoritative description of the GPDP for global numbering policies. The same description of the GPDP should appear in Attachment A of the ASO MoU and the relevant section of the Operating Procedures of the ASO AC (Currently Section 6).

ASO AC Response: *We consider that the ASO MoU (and specifically the attachment A) is the authoritative document from which ASO operational procedures are defined. ASO MoU should only contain high-level policy descriptions and perhaps operational descriptions should be removed from the Attachment A. We request NRO EC if there is a wish that the MoU be cleaned up, then ASO AC will re-read the Operational Procedures to check if there is a complete ad equation between the 2 documents.*

The NRO EC decided to continue the discussion on this in January 2019 once AFRINIC's Consultation results had been finalized.

4. NRO Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN (version: 19 November 2018)

The NRO EC discussed the Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN.

PW asked if the document should state specific timelines.

JC noted that, as written, this version of the document presumed a variable that was not stated. There were some constraints in the ICANN bylaws about how often reviews have to be conducted. He suggested that the document be edited to note *"Four years after the completion of the prior review the NRO EC shall initiate the planning year for the ASO Review to take place in year five, the following year..."*

JC continued that the previous review process took around two years, one of which was a year of planning, which included issuing an RFP and making sure the budget was in place. He noted that trying to complete much of the required work in the planning year might be beneficial. If there are several RIR meetings where consultations need to be held in the first half of a review year, there might not be enough time for the NRO EC to initiate an RFP and select the vendor before consultations need to start. He continued that issuing the RFP and selecting a vendor could happen in the planning year but the process would need to begin very early in that year.

The NRO EC decided to continue the discussion on this in January 2019.

5. ASO Participation in ATRT3

PW noted that the NRO EC had agreed on the mailing list to decline the invitation to participate in ICANN's Accountability and Transparency Review (ATRT3).

GV noted that he would inform ICANN of this decision.

6. Registering IANA in the EUIPO

PW noted that the NRO EC had discussed this on the mailing list and no objections had been raised.

AB noted that, in his capacity as NRO Secretary, he had sent the following message to the IANA IPR CCG:

“The NRO supports expansion of the IANA-related trademark registrations to the EU, and possible future expansion to other jurisdictions, as has been suggested by others in this discussion.”

7. RIR Incident Response Coordination

PW noted the following pending action item: *ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting.* He noted that APNIC was in support of setting up an RIR Incident Response Coordination team.

JC noted that ARIN was willing to coordinate as well but wondered how formal this team needed to be.

AB agreed with JC. He noted that AFRINIC would like to coordinate on RIR Incident Response activities but wondered if a formal team was necessary. Perhaps all that was needed was a formalized way of communicating on this across the RIRs.

AP agreed with AB: the RIPE NCC supported incidence response coordination and the communication channels should be reconfirmed.

JC agreed that it would be helpful to have a specific proposal on how this coordination would occur and how the RIR teams would work together in the event of an incident.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181218-01: PW to circulate a draft proposal on Incidence Response before the February Teleconference.

8. CG Reports

PW gave an overview of the CGs' activities:

a) CCG

- **Workplan 2018**
 - The CCG completed the handover of Chair duties to AFRINIC
 - Work completed included:
 - NRO website redesign
 - IGF Booth
 - Comparative Membership stats
 - Ongoing work included:
 - Terminology/definitions and guidelines on how to refer to/use the terms Registry and Database
 - Out of region route objects
 - ITHI outreach and communication activities
 - RPKI Trust Anchor Status report (on hold)
 - Ref doc on NRO v RIR collective activities

AB noted that Ashil Oogarah would take over as Chair of the CCG in 2019.

b) ECG

- **Workplan**
 - NRO document series on GitHub established
 - NRO Reporting: Work on Extended Stats and RPKI Stats is underway
 - RPKI Validation reconsidered is in progress.
 - ITHI reporting is underway
 - Emergency Back-end Registry: draft provided for initial comment and feedback.
 - IETF and Relevant Fora Observation are ongoing.

PH noted that the ECG had requested approval for an F2F meeting in Cape Town, South Africa, in February 2019.

PW added that no proposed agenda had yet been submitted.

JC commented that ARIN would be carefully prioritizing travel in 2019 and could not provide confirmation at this point. He noted that he would like to avoid holding CG meetings at events to which the five RIRs are not already sending staff.

PW added that as the ECG Chair would be held by AFRINIC in 2019, it had been proposed that the ECG F2F meeting be held in the region. It would not be held alongside another meeting and therefore would not fit JC's requested criteria.

AB and AP supported JC's comments.

OR noted that he also supported JC's comment that a special meeting might be perceived as an additional and costly meeting. However, he added that the CGs might occasionally need to hold special meetings to enable them to move ahead on pending issues. Holding ECG meetings only during IETFs might limit the amount of time available for the ECG to meet and discuss issues and a special meeting would allow more time for this. He suggested that the ECG be asked to justify the need for the proposed F2F.

JC noted that he had also heard from staff that time is limited during the IETFs. He noted that his comment was not aimed specifically at the ECG and applied to all CG meeting requests. He noted that it was usually more cost effective to add an extra day onto a meeting to which staff was already travelling than to send 8-10 staff to a different location.

c) RSCG

- **Workplan 2018**
 - ITHI
 - Whois accuracy
 - Registry accuracy
 - Inter RIR transfers procedures
 - Document on Best Practices for Resource Transfers
 - NRO Stats presentation
 - RDAP Consistency
 - RPKI

- **Workplan 2019**
 - New work included:
 - Fraud handling
 - Coordination and documentation on IPv4 pool depletion

PW noted that there was on action on the NRO EC to approve the RSCG’s request to hold an F2F meeting during ICANN 64 in Kobe (*ACTION ITEM 20181120-01*). The proposed agenda (Proposal: Face face meeting) had been circulated.

JC noted that as discussed, he would be unable to provide ARIN’s approval on the F2F meeting and noted that he would provide further input in the next couple of weeks.

Note: JC left the meeting at 11:37 UTC.

d) Secretariat

GV gave an update on the ASO AC Seat 10 Elections.

9. Open Actions

<p>ACTION ITEM 20181120-01: All to review the RSCG’s proposal to hold an F2F meeting during the ICANN 64 Meeting in Japan and to discuss this during the December teleconference.</p> <p>Proposal: Face face meeting (DOC)</p>	<p>OPEN</p>
<p>ACTION ITEM 20181120-02: All to review the "NRO Process for Review of the ASO within ICANN (version: 19 November 2018)" for discussion during the December teleconference.</p>	<p>OPEN</p>

ACTION ITEM 20181120-03: All to further discuss date/location of the proposed F2F NRO EC Meeting on the mailing list.	OPEN
ACTION 20181019-1: All to review/share with respective Boards the 'Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System' and report back by end of the 2018.	OPEN
ACTION 20181019-3: JC to circulate an outline for an RIR Cooperation Agreement document by early 2019.	OPEN
ACTION 20181019-4: All to discuss internally whether an Incident Response Team should be set up and report back during the next NRO EC Meeting. Replaced by <i>NEW ACTION ITEM 20181218-01: PW to circulate a draft proposal on Incidence Response before the February Teleconference.</i>	CLOSED
ACTION ITEM 20181009-5: All to review and subsequently approve the 2017 NRO distribution formula. GV noted that this would be completed by the January NRO EC teleconference.	IN PROGRESS
ACTION ITEM 20180717-5: Secretariat to keep the ASO Review Report Recommendation Implementation Status document updated according to the progress reported in future NRO EC meetings.	ONGOIN

10. Next Meetings

a) Teleconference Tuesday 15 January 2019

PW suggested that this meeting was rescheduled to 22 January 2019.

AP noted that he might have conflict and would confirm to the email list shortly.

b) Teleconference Tuesday 19 February 2019

c) Next f2f Meeting

The NRO EC discussed the following options: Daejeon (APNIC 47), Kobe (ICANN 64), Prague (IETF 104), or Barbados (ARIN 43).

NEW ACTION ITEM 20181218-02: GV to circulate a Doodle poll to determine which location would work for the upcoming NRO EC F2F Meeting.

11. Minutes Review

- **2018-Nov-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference**

Pending: ARIN

- **2018-Oct-19: Minutes NRO EC f2f Meeting in Amsterdam**

Pending ARIN

- **2018-Oct-9: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference**

The 9 October 2018 NRO EC Teleconference minutes were approved. PW asked the Secretariat to publish these minutes on the NRO website.

12. AOB

PW noted that AB would take over as Chair in 2019 and would have the NRO EC's full support.

AB noted that he would be assuming the role for the first time and looked forward to the NRO EC's continued support.

AP thanked PW for his Chairing for the past year.

The NRO EC also thanked PW.

AB thanked the Secretariat for its work over the year.

13. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 11.54 UTC.