

# 2018-Aug-21: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Date: Tuesday, 21 August 2018, 11:00 UTC

---

## Attendees

### Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
Alan Barrett (AB)	AFRINIC	Secretary – Vice Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer

### Observers:

Sanjaya (SJ)	APNIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Nate Davis (ND)	ARIN
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Ernesto Majó (EM)*	LACNIC
Paul Rendek (PR)	RIPE NCC

\*EM acts on behalf of LACNIC due to OR's absence.

### Secretariat:

German Vadez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Scribe)

---

## Agenda

1. Welcome

2. Agenda Review

3. ASO Review Update

- a) NRO EC Draft Statement on the Public Consultation to Determine the Future Structure of the ASO
- b) Strawman Proposal

4. A Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System

5. Technical Community Appointments to the MAG

6. NRO Contribution to IGFS

7. CG Reports / Consultations

- a) CCG
- b) ECG
- c) RSCG
- d) Secretariat on New NRO Website

8. Review Open Actions

9. Minutes Review

- a) July 2018
- b) June 2018

9. Next Meetings

- a) Teleconference Tuesday 18 September
- b) F2f Meeting Friday 19 October (afternoon) Amsterdam in RIPE NCC Offices (Right before ICANN 63)
- c) F2F Meeting Tuesday 23 October (afternoon) ICANN 63 (TENTATIVE)
- d) Meeting with I\* Saturday 27 October 2018
- e) Teleconference Tuesday 20 November (week after IGF)

10. AOB

11. Adjourn

## Resolutions

No resolutions were passed during this meeting.

## New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-1: JC to edit the NRO EC Draft statement on the Public Consultation to Determine the Future Structure of the ASO according to the discussion and circulate to the list.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-2: PW to send a note to the Internet Collaboration mailing list outlining the NRO's concerns regarding the technical community appointments to the MAG.
--

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-3: AP/GV to make the US\$ 50,000 contribution to the IGFSAs.
---

---

## 1. Welcome

PW welcomed the attendees and declared quorum. He noted that EM would act on behalf of LACNIC due to OR's absence.

## 2. Agenda Review

No additional items were added to the agenda.

## 3. ASO Review Update

**a) NRO EC Draft statement on the Public Consultation to Determine the Future Structure of the ASO**

**b) Strawman Proposal**

The NRO EC discussed the *NRO EC Draft statement on the Public Consultation to Determine the Future Structure of the ASO* and the straw man proposal.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-1: JC to edit the NRO EC Draft statement on the Public Consultation to Determine the Future Structure of the ASO according to the discussion and circulate to the list.**

## 4. A Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System

The NRO EC discussed the draft Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System document.

## 5. Technical Community Appointments to the MAG

The NRO EC discussed technical community appointments to the MAG.

PW noted that other parties had also expressed concern about the technical community selections to the MAG.

AB added that a note had recently been sent to the list regarding this and perhaps the NRO EC could offer support to the issues raised in that email.

PW agreed and suggested that a response be sent to the Internet Collaboration mailing list on behalf of the NRO, noting that it shares the concerns raised and would be prepared to take joint action or contribute to a joint statement on this matter.

There were no objections.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-2: PW to send a note to the Internet Collaboration mailing list outlining the NRO's concerns regarding the technical community appointments to the MAG.**

## 6. NRO Contribution to IGFSA

GV explained that he had requested an activity report from the IGFSA. This report had been received and circulated on the NRO EC list. He continued that a contribution of US\$ 50,000 to the IGF had been budgeted for. Previously, the contribution had been paid in June or July, although there was no specific deadline. He asked the NRO EC if the activity report was satisfactory and whether they would like to go ahead with the contribution.

AP noted that the NRO EC had requested more information about what its contribution was used for. He added that the IGF had also published an [annual report](#) with information pertaining to the last two years. He noted that he did not have any further concerns regarding this and suggested that the contribution be processed if all were in agreement.

There were no objections.

**NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-3: AP/GV to make the US\$ 50,000 contribution to the IGFSA.**

## 7. CG Reports / Consultations

PW gave an overview of the CGs' activities:

### a) CCG

- Preparations for the global IGF are ongoing: the CCG will hold a call next month to discuss materials and logistics.
- The new NRO website is in progress (to be discussed in agenda item 7d below).
- The NRO PowerPoint template redesign is in progress and minor issues are currently being dealt with.
- ARIN has developed a comparative membership statistic matrix and the CCG is assembling the necessary information to complete it.
- The project to define the terminology/definitions to be used when communicating about the registry and database will be discussed during the upcoming CCG call.

## **b) ECG**

- NRO RPKI reporting is being implemented by the RIPE NCC and will be delivered in Q4. A set of RPKI statistics will be added to the existing NRO statistics.
- APNIC's George Michaelson is submitting a draft re RPKI Validation Reconsidered to the IETF 103.
- The ECG and the RSCG are working together on ITHI reporting and plan to get the measurements in place by end of 2018. Reporting will start at the beginning of 2019.
- Work is continuing on the alignment of RDAP. ARIN has produced a detailed summary of RDAP issues, which will be discussed during the upcoming ECG meeting. The target for fixing these issues is by the end of 2018.
- LACNIC's Carlos Martinez is drafting a document to outline the essential services that need to be included in the Emergency Backup Registry project. The ECG has suggested that the following should be included: whois, rDNS, RPKI, DNSSEC, transfer logs, delegated stats and IRRs.
- The ECG has appointed LACNIC's Carlos Martinez to fulfil another two-year term on the Root Zone Evolution Review Committee (RZERC).
- APNIC is scoping out work on the RPKI Repository Delta Protocol (RRDP) to see if an implementation could be built (by APNIC), and shared with LACNIC and AFRINIC.

## **c) RSCG**

- The RSCG will hold a call on 29 August to discuss ITHI measurements, the whois accuracy comparison document and intra-RIR transfer procedures.
- The updated NRO statistics presentation template is due to be finalized by the end of Q3.
- The RSCG will hold its F2F meeting in Barcelona in October.

## **d) Secretariat on New NRO Website**

SG gave an update on the work to develop the new NRO website:

- Suggestions received from the NRO EC have been implemented.
- The page redirect phase has been completed.
- The website developer will shortly send over the files to the RIPE NCC for implementation on its servers.
- The current and new websites will be run in parallel for several weeks to gather feedback and check issues with redirects and functionality.
- An email alias, [websitefeedback@nro.net](mailto:websitefeedback@nro.net) has been created to gather feedback from RIR staff and the communities.
- APNIC and RIPE NCC's legal reps were consulted regarding cookies and GDPR compliance: feedback on whether anything needs to be implemented regarding GDPR is pending.

SG outlined the expected timeline:

- 3 September: New website available on RIPE NCC servers.
- 3-17 September: Secretariat/Developer/RIPE NCC final checks.
- 17 September: Announce website preview and ask for feedback.
- Approx. 15 October: Switch over to new website and archive current website.

PW asked about the progress on restoring historical links on the ASO website.

SG noted that, where possible, redirects had been created. There were currently some missing documents and broken links that refer to content on some of the RIR websites. The CCG had been contacted to help track down missing documents and restore links. She added that she would send PW an update on the progress shortly.

## 8. Review Open Actions

ACTION ITEM 20180717-1: AP/JC to draft a straw man proposal on how to move the ASO Review forward. The proposal should be published by end of August 2018 [ASO Review]	IN PROGRESS.
NEW ACTION ITEM 20180717-2: JC to submit the joint RIR response to the NTIA NOI on International Internet Policy Priorities on behalf of the five RIRs addressing section 2d: Should the IANA Stewardship Transition be unwound?	CLOSED.
NEW ACTION ITEM 20180717-3: OR to send a brief note to Göran Marby and Cherine Chalaby thanking them for the meeting and summarizing the points about NRO/ASO's cooperation with ICANN and ICANN's IPv6 initiative.	IN PROGRESS.
NEW ACTION ITEM 20180717-4: AP to follow up on the request to contribute to the IGFSAs and to report back to the NRO EC with further details.  Action item to be closed once the payment is made.	IN PROGRESS.
NEW ACTION ITEM 20180717-5: Secretariat to keep the ASO Review Report Recommendation Implementation Status document updated according to the progress reported in future NRO EC meetings.  The Secretariat created a draft page on the new NRO website. This action item to remain open, as the status document will need updating in the future.	IN PROGRESS.
ACTION ITEM 20180628-4: JC to draft a procedure for periodic reviews of the ASO [ASO Review Rec #3].	OPEN.
ACTION ITEM 20180628-5: JC to confirm that the ASO AC is working on Recommendation #7 [ASO Review Rec #7].	OPEN.
ACTION ITEM 20180628-8: PW to refer Recommendation #17, updating the ASO AC website with recent presentations, contact details and an archive of the activities of both the ASO AC and NRO EC, to the CCG [ASO Review Rec #17].	CLOSED.
ACTION ITEM 20180628-10: All to review and comment on the draft Framework for Personal Data in the Internet Numbers Registry System	IN PROGRESS.
ACTION ITEM 20180628-12: PW to draft formal request to the MAG to look into the issue of Technical Community appointments to the IGF MAG.  <b>See NEW ACTION ITEM 20180821-2: PW to send a note to the Internet Collaboration mailing list outlining the NRO's concerns regarding the technical community appointments to the MAG.</b>	CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180628-15: GV to send a Doodle Poll to find a time for an NRO EC meeting during ICANN 63.	CLOSED.
ACTION ITEM 20180515-6: AP to release the funds for the NRO's US\$ 75,000 contribution to the IGF Secretariat as per Resolution R-20180515-1.	CLOSED.
20180316-11: ALL to review and subsequently approve the 2017 NRO expense report v2 and the 2017 NRO distribution formula  GV noted that validation of the distribution formula by the CFOs is still pending.	IN PROGRESS.

## 9. Minutes Review

### a) July 2018

Pending approval by ARIN, LACNIC and RIPE NCC.

### b) June 2018

Pending approval by ARIN.

## 9. Next Meetings

### a) Teleconference Tuesday 18 September

### b) F2F Meeting Friday 19 October (afternoon) Amsterdam in RIPE NCC Offices (Right before ICANN 63)

### c) F2F Meeting Tuesday 23 October (afternoon) ICANN 63 (TENTATIVE)

After discussion, it was decided to cancel the F2F meeting proposed during ICANN 63.

### d) Meeting with I\* Saturday 27 October 2018

### e) Teleconference Tuesday 20 November (week after IGF)

## 10. AOB

EM noted that the I\* meeting had an agenda that lasts 1.5 days: he had thought that this meeting would be a one-day event.

PW noted that he had also been under the impression that the meeting would last one day. He asked the NRO EC to send any items that it would like to see on the I\* meeting agenda to the NRO EC mailing list for further discussion.

## 11. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 12.32 UTC.