

# IANA Review Committee Teleconference

22 January | 12PM UTC  
*Minutes*

## Attendees

	Community Representatives	Staff Representative
<b>AFRIC</b>		
	Noah Maina (NM)	Madhvi Gokool (MG)
	Mike Silber (MS)	
<b>APNIC</b>		
	Bertrand Cherrier (BC)	Guangliang Pan (GP)
<b>ARIN</b>		
	Martin Hannigan (MH)	John Sweeting (JS)
	Louie Lee (LL)	
<b>LACNIC</b>		
	Juan Alejo Peirano (JP)	Ernesto Majó (EM)
	Nathalia Sautchuk Patricio (NP)	
<b>RIPE NCC</b>		
	Nurani Nimpuno (NN) – <i>Chair</i>	Felipe Silveira (FS)
	Filiz Yilmaz (FY)	

## Secretariat

German Valdez (GV) – NRO Executive Secretary

## Apologies

Syam Zulfadly (SZ) (*APNIC Community Representative*)

## Minutes:

Susannah Gray (SG)

## New Action Items

- New Action Item 200122-1: RIR Staff representatives to contact the NRO EC regarding the additional items the EC had asked IANA to include in the IANA Monthly Reports and to provide any input and feedback they might also have.
- New Action Item 200122-2: RIR Staff representatives, LL and NN to discuss formatting modifications to the matrix to improve readability and circulate to the IANA RC by 29 January.
- New Action Item Action 200122-3: GV to circulate a Doodle Poll to find a time for the next IANA RC teleconference (first week of March) and subsequent placeholder meetings.
- New Action Item 200122-4: RIR Staff representatives to review the summarising statement and confirm that it reflects their view.
- New Action Item Action 200122-5: ALL to review the draft IANA RC Report and send comments and/or agreement to the mailing list before the next teleconference.
- New Action Item 200122-6: GV to subscribe the regional observers to the *iana-performance* mailing list before 31 January.

## **Agenda**

0. Welcome and Roll Call
  1. Agenda Review
  2. IANA RC Chair Election and Vice Chair Selection
  3. Approval of Minutes
  4. Review of Open Action Items
  5. RIR Matrix (Ernesto + RIR Staff)
  6. RC report draft (Louie)
  7. RC Report Work Plan 2020
  8. AOB
  9. Next Meeting
  10. Adjourn
- 

### **0. Welcome and Roll Call**

NN welcomed the IANA RC members to the teleconference. GV performed the roll call and declared quorum. NN welcomed the new RC members and gave a brief overview of the purpose and work of the IANA RC.

### **1. Agenda Review**

No items were added to the agenda.

### **2. IANA RC Chair Election and Vice Chair Selection**

NN explained that the nomination period closed at the first IANA RC Meeting of the year. She noted that FY had nominated her to take on another term as Chair for 2020 and that she had accepted the nomination. She asked if there were any other nominations. There were none. She handed the proceedings over to GV.

GV noted that procedures state that a vote should be held. However, as there was only one nomination, he proposed that a simple roll call be performed and each member could confirm his or her acceptance of NN's nomination.

MS proposed that GV asked for any objections to NN taking the 2020 Chair position: those who do not speak up would be presumed to have voted in favour.

GV asked if there were any objections to NN's appointment as the 2020 Chair of the IANA RC.

There were no objections.

GV asked if anyone would like to abstain.

There were no abstentions.

NN was appointed as the IANA RC Chair for 2020.

The IANA RC congratulated NN.

NN noted that the operating procedures state that the Vice Chair must represent a different region. She asked BC to accept the position of Vice Chair.

BC accepted and was appointed IANA RC Vice Chair for 2020.

The IANA RC congratulated BC.

### 3. Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the 27 November 2019 Meeting were approved. NN asked the Secretariat to publish them on nro.net.

### 4. Review of Open Action Items

- **Action Item 191127-1: EM to coordinate with the RIR staff representatives and circulate a first draft of the matrix before the January teleconference (date TBD) > CLOSED.**
- **Action Item 191127-2: LL to circulate the first draft of the IANA RC report before the January teleconference (date TBD) > CLOSED.**
- **Action Item 191127-3: NN and GV to send call for nominations and voting information for the IANA RC Chair Election before the first IANA RC teleconference in January 2020 > CLOSED.**
- **Action Item 191127-4: GV to send out a Doodle poll to find a date for the January IANA RC teleconference > CLOSED.**

### 5. RIR Matrix (Ernesto + RIR Staff)

EM gave an overview of the draft RIR Matrix that had been distributed to the mailing list. He noted that the three /8 delegations made in 2019 had not been included in the 2019 IANA Monthly Reports. He believed that this information had been included in previous years' monthly reports. This information had been included in the Matrix using information from the RIRs.

NN noted that there were no reported issues and surmised that the RIR's were happy with the level of service in 2019 and believed that the SLA had been fulfilled. She suggested that, as in previous reports, a comment be added noting this.

She agreed that the missing /8 delegations outlined by EM should be added to the matrix with an explanation. She asked EM to raise the issue with PTI/IANA and to suggest that such delegations be included in future reports for transparency and clarity.

JP noted that a footnote should be added to explain that the IANA RC had no comment on the /8 delegation.

GP noted that the matrix provided an overview of IANA's critical core services. IANA provided other services that were useful to the community and the RIRs, the statistics page for example. He asked if the IANA RC should comment on such services.

NN noted that the IANA RC's scope was limited to evaluating the SLA and it should not, therefore, comment on other tools and services provided by IANA. She suggested that the RIRs could provide feedback to IANA individually if they felt that it was important.

EM agreed: the IANA RC's scope was limited. He suggested that the NRO EC could be contacted to ask IANA to include this information in its monthly reports.

NN agreed.

JS commented that the NRO EC had been working with IANA to have additional items included in the IANA Monthly Reports, including items that the Engineering Coordination Group (ECG) had requested. The NRO EC could be asked for an update on this.

NN agreed.

**New Action Item 200122-1: RIR Staff representatives to contact the NRO EC regarding the additional items the EC had asked IANA to include in the IANA Monthly Reports and to provide any input and feedback they might also have.**

NN noted that the IANA RC had previously discussed how best to represent the information in the matrix so that it could easily be added to the IANA RC Report.

MS noted that the content should not be simplified but it would be helpful to have the information in a graphic format rather than text. This would be more effective for people who just want to glance at the report. He added that the data should still be made available for those who want to drill down.

JS noted that there was a lot of data in the matrix. He asked if it was required that the whole matrix was put in the report or whether it could be summarized and then a link added to the data: it would be hard to represent it all graphically in a meaningful way.

NN commented that the matrix was put in the report as it was received from the RIRs: it was not the IANA RC's role to modify it. There were many different ways to display the information but it was up to the RIRs to decide how to do it. She noted that care must be taken here so that community members, such as her, were not making assumptions and interpretations about the data provided by the RIRs.

JS suggested that the RIRs made a graphical representation of the matrix summary page. The detailed matrix obviously also needed to be included.

NN agreed.

FY agreed with NN and JS. She noted that, in the draft report, there was a simple table, which linked to more information and this format worked well. She noted, however, that the RIRs should consider optimizing how the full data was displayed: it should be coherent and self explanatory enough for an outsider to easily tell that there were no issues with the SLA.

NN explained that the next steps would be to publish the matrix and to seek feedback from the community. The RIRs and Secretariat would be responsible for that. She noted that she would draft an announcement. The RIR Comms' teams would be requested to distribute it throughout the regions via the appropriate mailing lists.

It was agreed that the RIR staff representatives, LL and NN would work on improving the formatting of the matrix and would circulate a new version to the IANA RC by 29 January. The draft matrix would be published for comment on 31 January (tentative), with a 30-day comment period. The next teleconference was scheduled for the first week of March

**New Action Item 200122-2: RIR Staff representatives, LL and NN to discuss formatting modifications to the matrix to improve readability and circulate to the IANA RC by 29 January.**

**New Action Item Action 200122-3: GV to circulate a Doodle Poll to find a time for the next IANA RC teleconference (first week of March) and subsequent placeholder meetings.**

## **6. RC Report Draft (Louie)**

LL noted that he had updated the RIR summarising statement: the RIR staff would need to agree that the new statement (as circulated on the mailing list) was accurate and acceptable for them.

The IANA RC discussed the draft IANA RC Report.

FY noted that the current formatting of the appendices worked well.

NN noted that the appendices were screenshots and the 'more info' buttons did not lead anywhere. However, the clear overview was a good way of displaying the information.

LL noted that, if the final version was in PDF format, the urls could easily be added.

NN asked the IANA RC to review the draft and note any comments or whether they had none and approved the draft as was.

**New Action Item 200122-4: RIR Staff representatives to review the summarising statement and confirm that it reflects their view.**

**New Action Item Action 200122-5: ALL to review the draft IANA RC Report and send comments and/or agreement to the mailing list before the next teleconference.**

## **7. RC Report Work Plan 2020**

NN recapped the agreed-upon work plan:

- 29 January: Updated RIR Matrix circulated to the IANA RC.
- 31 January: Announcement and RIR Matrix published.
- 1 March: 30-day comment period ends.
- Week 2, March: Teleconference and IANA RC Report published (tentative).
- Week 4 March: Placeholder for additional teleconference if necessary.
- April: Post mortem teleconference.
- November/December: Preparation teleconference for 2020 report.

NN asked each region to appoint an observer to monitor the *iana-performance* mailing list. The following representatives were appointed:

- AFRINIC: NM
- APNIC: BC
- ARIN: LL
- LACNIC: NP
- RIPE NCC: NN, FY

**New Action Item 200122-6: GV to subscribe the regional observers to the *iana-performance* mailing list before 31 January.**

## **8. AOB**

There was no AOB.

## **9. Next meeting**

The next meeting will take place during the first week of March.

## **10. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at 1:05 PM UTC

*-End-*