2018-May-15: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

Date: Tuesday, 15 May 2018, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	Chair
Alan Barrett (AB)	AFRINIC	Secretary – Vice Chair
Axel Pawlik (AP)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer
Oscar Robles (OR)	LACNIC	

Observers:

Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Izumi Okutani	APNIC Executive Council
Sanjaya	APNIC
Nate Davis (ND)*	ARIN

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO
Susannah Gray (SG)	NRO (Scribe)

*ND acts on behalf of ARIN due to JC's absence.

Agenda

1. Welcome

2. Agenda Review

3. Minutes Review

   a) April 2018

4. ASO Review

   a) Implementation Status (ASO Review Report Recommendation Implementation Status)

(ASO Consultations page on NRO website)

5. ITHI Document

6. NRO EC at ICANN 62

   a) Meeting with Göran Marby

7. IGF 2018

   a) Contribution to IGF Secretariat

   b) NRO Workshops

8. CG Reports / Consultations

   a) CCG

   b) ECG

   c) RSCG

9. Review Open Actions

10. Next Meetings

   a) Teleconference Tuesday 19 June (week before ICANN 62)

   b) Teleconference Tuesday 17 July

   c) Teleconference 21 August

   d) F2f Meeting Friday 19 & Saturday 20 October 2018 Amsterdam (Right before ICANN 63)

11. AOB

a) Publishing Resolutions list on NRO website.

12. Adjourn

Resolutions

The following resolutions were passed during this meeting:

R-20180515-1: The NRO EC agreed to transfer an NRO contribution of US$ 75,000 to the IGF Secretariat.

New Action Items

The following action Items were assigned during this meeting:

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-1: ALL to review the ASO Consultations page on the NRO website and inform the Secretariat of any missing information.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-2: PW to inform the RSCG that the ITHI Document has been approved. The EC would like to see the first set of indicators implemented as soon as reasonably possible and would like the RSCG to propose a timeline.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-3: GV to publish the ITHI Document on the NRO website.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-4: GV to organise a room for the NRO EC Meeting on 28 June during ICANN 62.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-5: AB to send a note stating that the NRO EC has resolved to transfer US$ 75,000 to the IGF Secretariat.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-6: AP to release the funds for the NRO's US$ 75,000 contribution to the IGF Secretariat as per Resolution R-20180515-1.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-7: AP to initiate discussion on how to communicate on database accuracy versus registry accuracy.

---

1. Welcome

PW noted that JC was currently in transit due to a flight delay and would not attend the meeting: ND acts on behalf of ARIN.

2. Agenda Review

No additional items were added to the agenda.

3. Minutes Review

• April 2018

Awaiting approval from AFRINIC and ARIN.

4. ASO Review

a) Implementation Status

PW noted that this is an action on JC and would be further discussed in the next call.

GV explained that the Secretariat had created a page on the NRO website to track the on-going ASO consultation discussions. He asked the EC to inform the Secretariat if anything was missing so that an accurate record could be kept and that the content reflects the discussions taking place in each region.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-1: ALL to review the ASO Consultations page on the NRO website and inform the Secretariat of any missing information.

AB noted that a brief consultation was held during the recent AFRINIC-28 Meeting. The Board and the community is of view that the three AFRINIC ASO AC / NRO NC representatives could be tasked with engaging with the community in order to find a way forward. AB continued that the ASO AC / NRO NC representatives have not been formally asked to do anything yet. He assumed that, when the representatives are approached regarding this, they would be able to choose their own working methods.

AP added that he will give a presentation during the on-going RIPE 76 meeting and would report back to the EC.

5. ITHI Document

PW explained that ACTION ITEM 20180424-8 called for the EC to review the ITHI report and suggest a reasonable deadline for publishing it.

PW asked if there were any objections to approving the ITHI Document. There were none. The document was subsequently approved for publication.

He continued that the EC was also asked to give some guidance to the RSCG as to when it would like it to publish the first set of indicators. However, he thought it difficult to make such a suggestion without first understanding what the RSCG is planning in regard to implementation.

AP added that he is hesitant to suggest a timeline without getting input from the RSCG. He suggested asking them for their input as well as informing them that the EC would like to see the ITHI implemented as soon as reasonably possible.

The EC agreed.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-2: PW to inform the RSCG that the ITHI Document has been approved. The EC would like to see the first set of indicators implemented as soon as reasonably possible and would like the RSCG to propose a timeline.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-3: GV to publish the ITHI Document on the NRO website.

AB asked that a title and date be added before the ITHI Document is published. GV noted this.

6. NRO EC at ICANN 62

a) Meeting with Göran Marby

PW noted that the meeting with Göran Marby (GM) has been (tentatively) scheduled for the afternoon of 28 June.

He added that the ASO has been asked if it would like any slots on the agenda or had need for other resources during ICANN 62.

OR noted that the EC would need to meet prior to the meeting with GM to prepare.

GV noted that he would ask Carlos Reyes (CR) to reserve a room for the EC's meeting around lunchtime on 28 June.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-4: GV to organise a room for the NRO EC Meeting on 28 June during ICANN 62.

GV noted that he was not sure if the ICANN 62 meeting format allowed for joint meetings with the ICANN Board but that, if the EC was interested in holding such meeting, he could investigate possibilities.

PW noted that the EC had not put in a request to meet with the ICANN Board. ICANN had advised that the Chair of the Board, Cherine Chalaby, and the ASO representatives (Seats 9 and 10) on the ICANN Board, Ron da Silva and Akinori Maemura, would also be present during the NRO EC's meeting with GM. He confirmed that, as agreed, only the five CEOs would attend.

7. IGF 2018

a) Contribution to IGF Secretariat

R-20180515-1: The NRO EC agreed to transfer an NRO contribution of US$ 75,000 to the IGF Secretariat.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-5: AB to send a note stating that the NRO EC has resolved to transfer US$ 75,000 to the IGF Secretariat.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-6: AP to release the funds for the NRO's US$ 75,000 contribution to the IGF Secretariat as per Resolution R-20180515-1.

b) NRO Workshops

GV explained that the deadline for submitting IGF 2018 workshop proposals was 27 May. Previously, the PACG had taken on this task. He noted that the CCG had enquired as to whose responsibility this was now and expressed concern that there didn't seem to be any ownership of this presently. He asked the EC if it believed there were relevant topics to propose and asked whether the CCG or the PACG should be tasked with making such a proposal.

PW noted that the lack of ownership is a result of the PACG now being an information-sharing group rather than a coordination group. He believed that any proposals would therefore probably need to be organised by individual RIRs.

He noted that APNIC was considering submitting a proposal for a workshop on whois privacy and asked if any of the other RIRs would like to join.

AP asked if the proposed workshop would be related to GDPR.

PH explained that there had been discussion on whois in APNIC's Cooperation SIG, including the topics of whois accuracy and law enforcement agencies' interests in the whois. He noted that APNIC is moving towards privacy mostly because of GDPR concerns.

He continued that APNIC had submitted a workshop proposal to the Asia Pacific Regional IGF on whois privacy and thought that this topic would also be relevant for the global IGF. However, the proposal is not focused on GDPR concerns but on the privacy concerns of the whois in terms of names and numbers.

AP noted that he would like to find out more about the proposal and how it would fit into the RIPE NCC's GDPR activities, as there seems to be a lot of overlap.

He continued that the term 'whois accuracy' raises concern: in the RIPE region, the term *RIPE Database* is used rather than *whois* to avoid confusion. He continued that the RIPE NCC tries to talk about registry accuracy rather than database accuracy. It does not have control of the accuracy of the information in the database, as members are able to input and update it.

NEW ACTION ITEM 20180515-7: AP to initiate discussion on how to communicate on database accuracy versus registry accuracy.

AP wondered whether the workshop proposals were something that the CCG could be tasked with.

PW suggested that without any agreed NRO workshops, it was not something for the CCG to deal with. However, whichever RIRs wanted to be involved in any proposals should coordinate with each other.

AB noted that AFRINIC may be interested but would need more information to assess whether to be involved or not.

OR noted that he was skeptical about the IGF overall: in his opinion it required a lot of coordination effort among the NRO and there was very little effect on the numbers community. However, he added that he is open to talk about this proposal.

ND noted that he was not aware of any proposal ideas coming out of ARIN. He added that he would pass on the details regarding the whois privacy proposal to JC to see if ARIN would participate.

8. CG Reports / Consultations

a) CCG

PW gave an update on the CCG's current activities:

- The IGF evaluation report was approved by the EC in the April meeting. The CCG is awaiting more information on when and where the IGF will take place so it can begin outlining activities.

- NRO website redesign: an overview of the changes being implemented is available on the NRO wiki.
- Coordinating the PowerPoint redesign.

b) ECG

PW noted that the ECG had not held a teleconference since the last EC meeting. He noted that he had been informed that the RIPE NCC's Tim Bruijnzeels (TB) would be leaving his role, which may have an impact on the ECG as TB has been involved in several ECG projects.

AP confirmed that TB was leaving the RIPE NCC and noted that he would be missed.

PW noted that standards-related work would be taken over by APNIC's George Michaelson: however, as he already has other work, timelines may be impacted.

c) RSCG

PW gave an update on the RSCG's current activities:

- ITHI will be discussed during the next RSCG teleconference.
- whois accuracy activities: in the document, the section relating to the RIPE NCC is still pending.
- Work on best practices for resource transfers is ongoing.
- Work on the statistics presentation is ongoing: the designer will propose a draft shortly.
- Work is continuing on RDAP consistency and will be discussed during the next RSCG teleconference.

9. Review Open Actions

Action	Status
20180316-22: JC to add the Joint Response to the ASO Review to the wiki and annotate with current statuses and pending actions.	OPEN.
20180316-18: PW to note concerns about some of the technical community appointments to the IGF MAG on the next Internet Collaboration call.	CLOSED (raised directly with Lynn St Amour)
20180316-17: PW to request clarification from the CCG regarding the budget requests for NRO and ASO website revamp projects in the current version of the CCG Workplan (currently they are unclear).	OPEN.
20180316-13: AP to inform IGF Secretariat that before the NRO Secretariat will make its contribution for 2018 (see action 20180316-12), it would like to see a report on how the NRO contributions from 2016 and 2017 were spent.	CLOSED (overtaken by events).

20180316-11: ALL to review and subsequently approve the NRO expense report and the 2017 NRO expense distribution formula. GV noted that this action item is partly completed. He had received the outstanding figures from the RIPE NCC but now needs to run the formula so that the CFOs can give approval on the final calculations. AB asked that the NRO's contribution to ICANN is split into two line items in the expense report: one line item for the contribution to ICANN as called for in the IANA Numbering Services SLA and one line item for the voluntary contribution for on-going ICANN activities. GV noted that this change would be made in the report.	OPEN.
20180316-5: All to review the ITHI document for discussion during the next NRO EC Meeting.	CLOSED.
20180424-10: PW to share details of ECG's request to use Bitbucket to gather RIR feedback on RDAP.	OPEN.
20180424-9: PW and GV to contact the ASO AC Chair regarding its report on the WS2 report recommendations: the NRO EC welcomes its report and would also like to see an overview of any proposed changes to the ASO.	OPEN.
20180424-8: ALL to review the ITHI report and suggest a reasonable deadline for publishing during the next NRO EC teleconference.	CLOSED.

10. Next Meetings

a) Teleconference Tuesday 19 June (week before ICANN 62)

b) Teleconference Tuesday 17 July

c) Teleconference 21 August

d) F2f Meeting Friday 19 & Saturday 20 October 2018 Amsterdam (Right before ICANN 63)

There were no comments.

11. AOB

a) Publishing Resolutions list on NRO website.

GV explained that, for clarity, resolutions made by the NRO EC could be published on the NRO website immediately after they are passed: approval of the minutes is sometimes delayed. For example, the EC recently resolved to appoint AB to the ICANN Empowered Community Administration and it might have been a good idea to make this resolution public at the time.

OR noted that he did not think it was a good idea to publish the resolutions before the minutes were formally approved: there might need to be unforeseen changes to the resolutions at a later date.

PW agreed: the resolutions should not be published before the minutes have been approved.

[*NOTE: JC joined the call at 11.53 UTC*]

12. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 11.55 UTC.